

**Members are reminded that they must declare all relevant pecuniary and non-pecuniary interests relating to any items of business to be discussed at this meeting**

**BIRMINGHAM CITY COUNCIL**

**JOINT CABINET MEMBER AND CHIEF OFFICER**

**FRIDAY, 28 APRIL 2017 AT 00:00 HOURS**  
**IN CABINET MEMBERS OFFICE, COUNCIL HOUSE, VICTORIA**  
**SQUARE, BIRMINGHAM, B1 1BB**

**A G E N D A**

**3 - 40**

- 1 **IMPLEMENTATION OF CHARGING SCHEME FOR CAR PARKING IN CANNON HILL PARK AND APPROVAL TO UNDERTAKE ASSOCIATED IMPROVEMENT WORKS - FULL BUSINESS CASE**

Report of the Service Director - Sport, Events, Open Spaces and Wellbeing



# BIRMINGHAM CITY COUNCIL

## PUBLIC REPORT

<b>Report to:</b>	<b>CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS, RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT AND THE CORPORATE DIRECTOR FOR PLACE</b>
<b>Report of:</b>	<b>SERVICE DIRECTOR PLACE - SPORT, EVENTS, OPEN SPACES AND WELLBEING</b>
<b>Date of Decision:</b>	<b>28th April 2017</b>
<b>SUBJECT:</b>	<b>IMPLEMENTATION OF CHARGING SCHEME FOR CAR PARKING IN CANNON HILL PARK AND APPROVAL TO UNDERTAKE ASSOCIATED IMPROVEMENT WORKS – FULL BUSINESS CASE</b>
<b>Key Decision: No</b>	<b>Relevant Forward Plan Ref:</b>
<b>If not in the Forward Plan: (please "X" box)</b>	Chief Executive approved <input type="checkbox"/> O&S Chairman approved <input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Relevant Cabinet Member(s) or Relevant Executive Member for Local Services:</b>	<b>COUNCILLOR LISA TRICKETT – CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS, RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT</b>
<b>Relevant O&amp;S Chairman:</b>	<b>Corporate Resources and Governance</b>
<b>Wards affected:</b>	<b>MOSELEY &amp; KINGS HEATH</b>

### 1. Purpose of report:

To seek approval to the Full Business Case for the introduction of car parking charges at Cannon Hill Park as part of an overall strategy to introduce charges across parks and to set out a phased programme of improvement works to the car parking infrastructure within Cannon Hill Park to improve the standard and safety of the facilities.

### 2. Decision(s) Recommended:

That the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling and Environment jointly with the Corporate Director for Place:-

- 2.1 Approves the Full Business Case for the implementation of car parking charges within Cannon Hill Park, as part of an overall strategy to introduce charges across City Council parks.
- 2.2 Approves the implementation of an arrangement with the Midlands Arts Centre (MAC) which will establish shared responsibility for management of the car parking scheme and an income share arrangement between the City Council and the MAC as set out in paragraph 4.2.
- 2.3 Notes the implementation of experimental Traffic Regulation Orders in identified surrounding roads to mitigate the impact of displacement parking on local residents, attached in Appendix 1.
- 2.4 Approves prudential borrowing of £0.450m, to be repaid over a period of 10 years, to implement a phased programme of improvement and infrastructure works associated with surface improvements, CCTV and lighting as set out in Appendix 2 and notes the use of contractors on current procurement frameworks to carry out this work.

- 2.5 Authorises the Service Director of Sport, Events, Open Spaces and Wellbeing to place orders up to the value of £0.450m through existing contracts and in line with the Procurement Governance arrangements.
- 2.6 Approves the retention of surpluses from the implementation of these charges, to the extent that they exceed existing budget assumptions, for reinvestment in the parks service, in accordance with the business plan set out in Paragraph 4.2 and Appendix 5 of this Report.

<b>Lead Contact Officer(s):</b>	Steve Hollingworth, Service Director – Sport, Events, Open Spaces and Wellbeing
<b>Telephone No:</b> <b>E-mail address:</b>	0121 464 2023 <a href="mailto:steve.hollingworth@birmingham.gov.uk">steve.hollingworth@birmingham.gov.uk</a>

### **3. Consultation**

- 3.1 Internal  
The Deputy Leader and the Cabinet Member for Value for Money and Efficiency have been consulted along with the Commercialism Board, who support the proposal. In addition the Cabinet Member for Transport and Roads has also been consulted in relation to traffic management issues.  
Local Members for Moseley and Kings Heath have also been advised of the proposals and are supportive of the scheme alongside relevant parking measures in the surrounding community. Consultation and responses are attached in Appendix 6 of this report.  
The Trusts and Charities Committee approved the scheme in principle at the meeting on 1 March 2017, subject to cabinet member approval.
- Officers from City Finance, Legal Services, Procurement and Highways have been involved in the preparation of this report.
- 3.2 External  
Management at the Midlands Art Centre have been consulted, including the Chief Executive and the Strategic Operations Director who are working alongside the Council to implement the proposals.
- Public consultation on the introduction of car parking charges in City parks was undertaken as part of the 2016/17 budget process and feedback from that consultation has been noted. Following the feedback work has taken place alongside key stakeholders, including the MAC, to revise the scheme in line with feedback.
- Following the development of a revised scheme public consultation on the relevant traffic orders for the park took place in April 2017. A summary of the public consultation is attached in Appendix 6 of the report and all views have been fully considered as part of the development of the scheme.

### **4. Compliance Issues:**

- 4.1 Are the recommended decisions consistent with the Council's policies, plans and strategies?  
The approach to introduce car parking charges in City parks has been very carefully considered since it was first proposed to ensure that its introduction is better understood and also to mitigate any negative impact on park users and other vulnerable groups.

- Promotion of public transport and green travel options – the implementation of car parking charges will incentivise the use of green travel and public transport options. As part of the introduction of the scheme alternative forms of travel to parks will be promoted and reinforced.
- Commercialism – the Council is embarking on a Commercialism approach that seeks to maximise the financial value of every asset that the Council holds, including seeking to generate new revenue for the Council. The implementation of this scheme will support the Commercialism approach and the scheme has been endorsed by the Commercialism Board while improving facilities and the availability of spaces for park users.

#### 4.2 Financial Implications

##### (Will decisions be carried out within existing finance and Resources?)

The implementation of the car parking scheme is estimated to generate a total net revenue surplus prior to borrowing costs and distributions to the MAC of £0.117m in 2017/18 (assuming implementation by July 2017), increasing to £0.160m per annum from 2018/19 (the first full year of operation). An agreement has been put in place with the MAC, which will see a 50% share of operating surplus (i.e. before capital financing costs) paid to the MAC, who will manage the day to day aspects of the car park.

It is anticipated that the phased programme of infrastructure and improvements works to Cannon Hill Park will be necessary to support the proposed scheme, requiring capital investment of £0.45m, to be funded through prudential borrowing over a 10 year period, to be repaid utilising revenue surpluses generated from the implementation of car parking charges. A full business case is attached in Appendix 3.

The following table summarises the financial implications of implementation of the proposed scheme over the first 11 years of operation.

	2017/18 £'000	2018/19 £'000	2019/20 – 2027/28 £'000	Total (11 years) £'000
<b>Capital</b>				
Capital Investment (Appendix 1)	450	-	-	<b>450</b>
Prudential Borrowing	(450)	-	-	<b>(450)</b>
<b>Net Capital Position</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>-</b>
<b>Revenue</b>				
Car Parking Income	(132)	(175)	(1,575)	<b>(1,882)</b>
Operating Costs	10	15	135	<b>160</b>
Contribution to Commercialism Team	5	0	0	<b>5</b>
Borrowing Charges	0	49	441	<b>490</b>
Operating Surplus share to MAC	61	80	720	<b>861</b>
<b>Net Revenue Surplus</b>	<b>(56)</b>	<b>(31)</b>	<b>(279)</b>	<b>(366)</b>

Income and revenue assumptions are net of VAT and car park usage figures are based on a conservative case following a series of site surveys and have assumed a 20% reduction in usage following the implementation of the charges.

of these charges (of up to £31k per annum for each full year of operation) will be available for reinvestment in the Parks Service to the extent that surpluses exceed existing budget assumptions, including the implementation of further car parking charging schemes and to fund the development of further commercial and service improvement opportunities across the parks service.

#### 4.3 Legal Implications

As landowner and sole corporate trustee Birmingham City Council is responsible for the management of parks held in trust. Although the Trusts and Charities Committee is ultimately responsible for the day-to-day management of all assets held in Trust, where the Council is Trustee, the management of trust parks and open spaces is currently delegated to the Parks Service via the Corporate Director of Place.

The original trust deeds require that Birmingham City Council shall hold Cannon Hill Park as public walks or pleasure gardens provided and maintained by them under s.64 of the Public Health Act 1875 but in addition to the general law applying to charitable trusts and the powers under the Trustees Act 2000. S83 -85 of the West Midlands County Council Act 1980 specifically permits the grant of leases within Cannon Hill Park not exceeding two acres to anybody, incorporated or not whose objects are charitable and comprise or include the provision of an art or cultural centre but not otherwise. Birmingham City Council is not the first local authority to introduce car parking charges in parks and it is not anticipated that this will cause any legal implications.

A Road Traffic Order is being put in place to designate the site as an off street car park and enforcement undertaken under the Council's citywide enforcement arrangements.

#### 4.4 Public Sector Equality Duty

An Equality Assessment (number EA001949) accompanies this report in Appendix 4 and concludes that maintaining free parking for blue badge holders mitigates one of the key areas of equalities impact.

### 5. **Relevant background/chronology of key events:**

5.1 As part of the 2016/17 budget process a proposal was included to work alongside the MAC to generate a surplus of £0.02m by introducing car parking charges in parks across the City in addition to a previous commitment of £0.06m (citywide). These proposals were undelivered, but this proposed scheme is the first of a series of schemes that will enable the Parks service to meet or exceed this saving requirement.

5.2 In addition to the income target above, funding reductions to the Parks budget of 10% was agreed as part of the approved City Council 2017/18 budget, which will lead to a funding reduction in the region of £1.2m in 2017/18, increasing to £1.8m in 2018/19. This will have significant implications on the range and quality of services that can be provided in parks if corresponding income generating schemes cannot be identified. To help partially mitigate the impact on improving and investing in services of these funding reductions, the Parks Service and Commercialism Board commissioned a business case to explore the income opportunities and return on investment.

5.3 The section of the car park that is situated immediately outside Birmingham Wildlife Conservation Park is in a state of disrepair and in urgent need of improvement works. It has been identified that the initial phase of these improvement works are required before an effective charging scheme could become active.

5.4 There have been a number of safety concerns associated with the car park in Cannon Hill Park. This scheme will provide a means of funding improvement to parking infrastructure and therefore tackling safety issues through the implementation of lighting and CCTV.

- 5.5 The Council has been unable to significantly invest in the car park or safety infrastructure highlighted in paragraphs 5.3 and 5.4 due to a lack of funding. Therefore it was considered prudent to consider routes to generate income and enable investment in these assets.
- 5.6 Introduction of this proposed scheme will also provide a means of control on existing commuter parking, where it is felt that currently the car park is used as hospital car parking or a 'free park and ride' by some users and will assist in managing this situation, or at least gaining appropriate recompense from those persons parking for that purpose.
- 5.7 Consultation has taken place with the ward councillors for Moseley and Kings Heath to ensure that issues related to displacement car parking have been explored and appropriate measures have been put in place to mitigate the impact on local residents. An experimental Traffic Regulation Order is in place for the surrounding roads. The experimental Traffic Regulation Order provides the ability to amend the terms of the restrictions in line with feedback from residents.
- 5.8 Discussions with the MAC, the Trusts and Charities Committee and local park management teams established that in year one a charging mechanism of £2 for up to 4 hours and £3 for 4-16.5 hours is the most appropriate approach. The current proposed level of charges was established by benchmarking against schemes run by other local authorities and some initial market analysis. It is proposed to review these charges and the associated charging structure on an annual basis.
- 5.9 Currently a premium rate for the car park is charged by a third party for the operation of specific events (e.g. major match days at Edgbaston stadium). The intention is to retain the car park for these events and for the Council to consider a separate business case for operating direct management of such events from 2018.
- 5.10 Procurement is taking place on a schedule of rates basis, using existing frameworks. The frameworks being utilised are the ESPO Framework 509 'Parking Management Solutions' for the procurement of ticket machines and the Highways and Infrastructure Works Framework agreement (P0178) agreement for the delivery of physical works.
- 5.11 The value of the contracts is below the threshold for the BBC4SR to apply. However, the contractors on these frameworks are already Charter signatories and are committed to pay the Birmingham Living Wage.

## 6. Evaluation of alternative option(s):

- 6.1 **Do Nothing** – There is an option to do nothing and continue to provide access to parking at Cannon Hill Park at no charge. However this option is rejected as it would miss the opportunity to generate revenue to fund improvement to infrastructure and health and safety works in the car park and would impact on the ongoing development of a sustainable partnership with the MAC.
- 6.2 **Implement Full Programme of Improvements Prior to Go-Live** – Develop a full programme of improvement activity (likely to be in the region of 9-12 months) and do not implement a charging scheme until after all improvement works are undertaken. This option is rejected as it will lead to a delay in receiving income and likely to negatively impact on the ongoing development of a sustainable partnership with the MAC.

- 6.3 **Transfer the land to the MAC and receive a lease** – There is an option to transfer

responsibility for the Car Park to the MAC and receive a guaranteed lease for the asset. This option is rejected as it is likely to limit the Council's future gains from the scheme and result in loss of other income, such as parking on major match days at Edgbaston.

**7. Reasons for Decision(s):**

- 7.1 Implementation of the scheme will support the Council in accessing £0.16m pa to contribute to the achievement of agreed savings targets, invest in the park, car park and related facilities and also develop the ongoing relationship with the Midlands Art Centre
- 7.2 Introduction of the parking scheme will continue to support the Council's longer term principles to promote and support green transport options and reduce car use across the City.
- 7.3. The phased approach will balance the need to undertake urgent improvement works to elements of the car park with the opportunity to generate income for 9 months of the financial year 2017/18




<u>Signatures</u>	<u>Date</u>
Councillor Lisa Trickett Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling and Environment .....	.....
Jacqui Kennedy Corporate Director of Place .....	.....

<b>List of Background Documents used to compile this Report:</b>
Report to Trusts and Charities Committee of the Assistant Director of Sport, Leisure and Parks – 1 March 2017

<b>List of Appendices accompanying this Report (if any):</b>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Appendix 1 – Map of parking scheme in residential area</li> <li>2. Appendix 2 – Breakdown of phasing of work</li> <li>3. Appendix 3 – Full Business Case for introducing charging for car parking in Cannon Hill Park</li> <li>4. Appendix 4 – Equalities Impact Assessment</li> <li>5. Appendix 5 – Business Case for use of surpluses</li> <li>6. Appendix 6 – Consultation responses</li> </ol>

<b>Report Version</b>		<b>Dated</b>	28/04/2017
-----------------------	--	--------------	------------





**Birmingham City Council**  
Highways  
Traffic Management Services

KEVIN HICKS  
TRAFFIC MANAGER,  
HIGHWAYS & INFRASTRUCTURE.  
1 LANCASTER CIRCUS,  
BIRMINGHAM B4 7DQ.


SCHEME

Birmingham City Council  
(Russell Road Etc, Moseley & Kings Heath)  
(Traffic Regulation) (Experimental) Order 201\*


DRAWING

Effective Date:

This map is based upon Ordnance Survey material with the permission of Ordnance Survey on behalf of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office Crown copyright. Unauthorised reproduction may lead to prosecution or civil proceedings. B.C.C. Licence No 100021326 Date 2016



KEY:

 Traffic Regulation Order Boundary.  
Only this Traffic Regulation Order's  
restrictions are shown on this plan.

Page 11 of 40

DATE	REV	REVISIONS	DRN.	DES.	P.M.
SCALE		STATUS			
1:2500		Tile Ref:			
P.M.	KL	DESIGNER	DRAWN		
		GSD	GSD		
DRAWING NO		REV.			
IMSE/GD/447		--			
DRAWING UNITS ARE METRES A3 SHEET					



### Project and Funding Phasing

The improvement works for this project will occur in 2 phases – to enable a pragmatic approach to implementation and also to drive ongoing improvements in the car park. The total costs of the works are anticipated to be £0.450m, split in to 2 separate phases, which are:

- Phase 1 – Pre-Go live requirements
- Phase 2 – Post-Go live health and safety improvements

<b>Phase 1 – Upfront investment (by June 2017)</b>
Ticket Machines and Installation
Traffic Orders and Consultation
Engineers Fees
Project Management
Signage
Surface Improvements

<b>Phase 2 – Post-Go live health and safety improvements</b>
CCTV
Lighting



Full Business Case (FBC)			
1. General Information			
Directorate	Place	Portfolio/Committee	Clean Streets, Recycling and Environment
Project Title	<i>Introduction of charges for Car Parking in Cannon Hill Park</i>	Project Code	
Project Description	<p>This document sets out the business case for implementing charges for Car Parking in Cannon Hill Park and investment and improvement in the parking facilities within the park.</p> <p><u>1.1 Context – Car Parking in Major Parks</u></p> <p>A business case to introduce car parking in major city parks was produced and approved by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Commercialism Board (23 January 2017)</li> <li>- Trusts and Charities Committee (1 March 2017)</li> </ul> <p>The business case sets out the case for introducing parking schemes across the major parks within the city to enable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Income to invest in deteriorating car parking facilities</li> <li>- Income to support and invest in the parks and surrounding areas</li> <li>- Promotion of green travel options</li> <li>- Investment in city parks and facilities from users outside of the city boundary</li> </ul> <p><u>1.2 Cannon Hill Park</u></p> <p>Cannon Hill Park is one of the most vibrant and successful parks within Birmingham, it provides a range of high quality facilities and events and is a hub park within the City. As well as the park facilities provided Cannon Hill Park is also home to the Midlands Art Centre (MAC), a popular and leading cultural venue within the city and the Birmingham Wildlife Conservation Park.</p> <p>Cannon Hill Park and the MAC are served by a car park that has capacity for over 400 cars and currently, with the exception of major match days at Edgbaston Cricket Ground, the car park is free at the point of access. Although the car park is very popular it is in need of significant investment and improvement works and has been subject to a number of safety issues in recent years.</p> <p>As part of the 2016/17 budget process a proposal was included to work alongside the MAC to generate a surplus of £0.02m by introducing car parking charges in parks across the City in addition to a previous commitment of £0.06m (citywide). These proposals were undelivered, but this proposed scheme is the first of a series of schemes that will enable the Parks service to meet this saving requirement.</p>		

To enable the Council to invest in the car parking facilities and to support the continued development of a sustainable relationship with the MAC the Council is seeking to invest in the car parking facilities on site and implement a charge for car parking.

### 1.3 Proposal

The Council is seeking to introduce the charges at Cannon Hill Park in June 2017 and to implement a phased programme of improvement works to support their introduction. The proposed scheme for the car park will be (opening 07:00-23:00):

- £2 per car for up to 4 hours
- £3 per car for up to 16.5 hours

To support the implementation and minimise the impact of displacement parking on local residents an experimental parking order has been put in place on surrounding roads (Russell Road, Moorcroft Road and The Russells), which will prevent parking on these roads from 10:00-18:00. Feedback will be sought from local residents as to whether these measures are effective and a decision taken as to whether to vary the terms of this order.

The scheme will encourage the usage of cashless parking options, but there will be cash payment machines available in the car park.

### 1.4 Phasing of Improvement Works

Implementation of the scheme is subject to implementation of various improvement works to the parking infrastructure at Cannon Hill Park. The proposal is to phase these works as follows:

#### **Phase 1 – Pre Go-Live 23 June**

- Ticket Machines and Signage
- Surface Improvements to the Conservation Park's Car Park

#### **Phase 2 – Summer/Autumn 2017**

- Installation of CCTV
- Installation of Lighting

Procurement is taking place on a schedule of rates basis, using existing frameworks. The frameworks being utilised are the ESPO Framework 509 'Parking Management Solutions' for the procurement of ticket machines and the Highways and Infrastructure Works Framework agreement (P0178) agreement for the delivery of physical works. The value of the contracts is below the threshold for the BBC4SR to apply. However, the contractors on these frameworks are already Charter signatories and are committed to pay the Birmingham Living Wage.



### 1.5 Cannon Hill Park and Relationship with Midlands Art Centre and Capital Improvements

An initial agreement has been put in place with the MAC whereby the MAC will receive 50% of the operating surplus of the Car Parking scheme (i.e. prior to repayment of borrowing) as a fee for operating the car park and responding to security issues.

In addition to this and to support the MAC in providing effective management of the Car Park a number of capital improvement works have been identified (which are set out in this business case), including:

- Resurfacing
- Lighting
- CCTV

### 1.6 Financial Case

Following an initial business case for the wider scheme, which focussed on the investment required specific parking resources, a further more detailed investment plan is being developed for each park.

The financial case associated with this scheme includes capital investment in:

- Parking infrastructure and facilities
  - o Prior to go-live (i.e. resurfacing)
  - o Ongoing phased improvement works (i.e. lighting, CCTV)
- Parking orders and equipment (i.e. TROs, Ticket Machines)
- Professional Fees (i.e. Project Management)

The financial case also considers the revenue cost of running the scheme (i.e. cash collection, ongoing repairs and maintenance, replacement ticket machines). It should be noted however that on a day to day basis oversight of the scheme will be provided by the MAC as part of the revenue share arrangement.

Assumptions are set out in the financial section of the business case and are based on a 20% reduction on current usage and are considered by stakeholders to be a conservative estimate of usage.

An additional benefit of this scheme is that it will enable Birmingham to benefit from income from outside of the City as Cannon Hill Park and the MAC have a high number of users from outside of the City.

The scheme will be enforced via the Council's citywide enforcement contract, income from enforcement will be retained by the Highways service. It is anticipated that the costs of enforcement will be offset by income.

### 1.7 Key Risks/Dependencies

There are a number of key risks and dependencies for which a mitigation and management plan will be put in place – these risks focus

	<p>around:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Anticipated income figures not achieved</li> <li>- Adverse reaction from stakeholders</li> <li>- Delays to the scheme impacting on the realisation of income</li> <li>- Negative impact on local residents caused by displacement parking</li> <li>- Negative impact on the usage of Cannon Hill Park and associated facilities</li> </ul>
<p><b>Links to Corporate and Service Outcomes</b></p>	<p>Introducing charges for car parking in Cannon Hill Park support other areas of priority for BCC, including:</p> <p><u>2.1 Promotion of Public and Green Transport Options:</u></p> <p>Promoting and driving sustainability is a core priority of the Council, particularly related to transport and travel options. Implementing a car parking charge at car parks would support this priority.</p> <p>There are public transport options serving each of our 'major' parks, which are also supported by 'green' transport facilities (e.g. cycle facilities). The introduction of car parking charges would be accompanied by a promotion of these alternative forms of transport.</p> <p>It is anticipated that introducing parking charges and promoting other travel options will help to incentivise the use of 'green' forms of transport.</p> <p><u>2.2 Commercialism:</u></p> <p>Commercialism focuses on maximising the value of every asset within the organisation to drive a financial return, which will enable the authority to protect other services to Birmingham. As part of the Commercialism approach work is taking place across the organisation to identify income opportunities to enable the continued provision of key services to citizens.</p> <p>The approach of charging for car parking in parks is well embedded in a number of other local authorities – with authorities such as Derby City Council and Warwickshire County Council charging and generating substantial income from their flagship parks.</p> <p><u>2.3 Working with Cultural Sector:</u></p> <p>The Council is seeking opportunities to promote a sustainable model for the cultural sector in an environment of reducing grants and funding for the cultural sector. One of the key approaches to this end is to work in partnership with the organisations within the sector to sweat and maximise the value of any asset. The shared operations and surplus</p>

	from the charging scheme in Cannon Hill Park will be an example of such a scheme and will provide learning for other similar schemes going forward.		
<b>Project Definition Document Approved by</b>	<i>Not applicable</i>	<b>Date of Approval</b>	<i>Not applicable</i>
<b>Benefits Quantification- Impact on Outcomes</b>	<b>Measure</b>		<b>Impact</b>
	<i>Introduction of Car Parking Charges</i>		<i>Generation of £0.122m in 17/18 and £0.160m in a full year. This will contribute to approved savings targets with the balance available for investment in services and profit share with the MAC</i>
	<i>Improvement in facilities</i>		<i>Improved car parking facilities, including surfacing, lighting, CCTV and signage</i>
	<i>Sustainable funding scenario for MAC</i>		<i>Profit share arrangement creating a sustainable funding scenario for the MAC</i>
	<i>Investment from beyond Birmingham</i>		<i>Cannon Hill Park receiving investment from users beyond the Birmingham City boundary</i>
<b>Project Deliverables</b>	Project deliverables are: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Implementation of a sustainable car park charging scheme</li> <li>• Improvement in car parking facilities through phased programme of works</li> <li>• Traffic management orders in place for surrounding roads to prevent displacement parking</li> </ul>		
<b>Scope</b>	Within the scope of this project is the following: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Introduction of a charges for parking in Cannon Hill Park, including agreeing the fee structure and any related TROs that are required</li> <li>2. Introduction and installation of a mechanism for payments (e.g. ticket machines/cashless)</li> <li>3. Any consultation required prior to introduction</li> <li>4. Implementation of any related highways orders and parking schemes in local neighbourhoods</li> <li>5. Scheduling, Phasing and overseeing a programme of improvement works for Cannon Hill Park</li> </ol>		
<b>Scope exclusions</b>	Out of scope of this project is the following: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Ongoing management or operational responsibility for running the car parks</li> <li>2. Developing arrangements or agreements with the MAC around profit share (this will sit with the business as usual team)</li> </ol>		
<b>Dependencies on other projects or activities</b>	There are a number of dependencies related to the delivery of this scheme, which include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Formal approval of permanent TRO from Assistant Director for Highways Infrastructure in consultation with relevant cabinet member</li> <li>• Physical Works required to achieve go-live</li> <li>• Existing scheduling of major events in Cannon Hill Park</li> <li>• Relationship with special interest groups</li> <li>• Availability of a project manager and specialist resource in</li> </ul>		

	highways and transport		
<b>Achievability</b>	<b>Milestone</b>		<b>Date</b>
	Initial Business Case of wider scheme to Commercialism Board		23 January 2017
	Approval by charities and trust committee		1 March 2017
	Cabinet Member Approval		April 2017
	TRO consultation and agreement		April 2017
	Phase 1 Physical Works		May/June 2017
	<b>Go-Live of Phase 1</b>		<b>23 June 2017</b>
	Phase 2 Physical Works		Summer/Autumn 2017
	Phase 3 Physical Works		Autumn/Winter 2017/18
<b>Project Manager</b>	Matt Hageney		
<b>Budget Holder</b>	Steve Hollingworth		
<b>Sponsor</b>	Steve Hollingworth		
<b>Project Accountant</b>	Guy Olivant, <a href="mailto:Guy.Olivant@birmingham.gov.uk">Guy.Olivant@birmingham.gov.uk</a>		
<b>Project Board Members</b>	Commercialism Board, Cllr Ward, Cllr Trickett, Cllr Mahmood, Jacqui Kennedy, Waheed Nazir, Angela Probert, Nigel Kletz, Ken Lyon, Connie Price		
<b>Head of City Finance (HoCF)</b>	Guy Olivant	<b>Date of HoCF Approval:</b>	28/04/2017

## 2. Budget Summary (Detailed workings should also be supplied)

The financial case set out below covers a likely cased scenario based on a number of assumptions, including:

1. The charging model being operated as outlined within this business case, with annual reviews undertaken to review and assess the charging model to create an optimum model
2. A 50/50 surplus share arrangement with the MAC on operating surplus, with the Council funding agreed capital investment
3. Enforcement taking place as part of Birmingham's wider parking enforcement contract and incurring no additional charge, however any penalty charge notice income will be realised as part of the Parking Services budget
4. Relevant parking orders being put in place at both the car park itself and surrounding streets
5. A range of payment options being available, but where possible cashless parking will be promoted

### 6.1 Income and Expenditure:

The business case for implementing the parking scheme will include a range of income and expenditure.

Income streams will include:

- Pay on the day parking for each car
- Opportunities in the future to directly deliver event car parking at a premium price

One off expenditure to be funded on an invest to save basis of approximately £450k which will include:

- Investment in equipment/machinery
- Implementation of traffic orders
- Project Management
- Phased programme of capital investment to improve the infrastructure within the Car Park

Ongoing annual revenue expenditure will include:











- Revenue costs associated with cash collection and management
- Revenue costs associated with cashless parking
- Repairs and maintenance

	2017/18 £'000	2018/19 £'000	2019/20 – 2027/28 £'000	Total (11 years) £'000	
<b>Capital</b>					
Capital Investment (Appendix 1)	450	-	-	<b>450</b>	
Prudential Borrowing	(450)	-	-	<b>(450)</b>	
<b>Net Capital Position</b>	-	-	-	-	
<b>Revenue</b>					
Car Parking Income	(132)	(175)	(1,575)	<b>(1,882)</b>	
Operating Costs	10	15	135	<b>160</b>	
Contribution to Commercialism Team	5	0	0	<b>5</b>	
Borrowing Charges	0	49	441	<b>490</b>	
Operating Surplus share to MAC	61	80	720	<b>861</b>	
<b>Net Revenue Surplus</b>	<b>(56)</b>	<b>(31)</b>	<b>(279)</b>	<b>(366)</b>	
<b>Planned Start date for delivery of the project</b>	<i>April 17</i>		<b>Planned Date of Technical completion</b>	<i>December 17</i>	

<b>3. Checklist of Documents Supporting the FBC</b>		
<b>Item</b>	<b>Mandatory attachment</b>	<b>Number attached</b>
<b>Financial Case and Plan</b>		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Statement of required resource (people, equipment, accommodation) – append a spreadsheet or other document</li> </ul>	Mandatory	Appendix A – worksheet 3
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Milestone Dates/ Project Critical Path (set up in Voyager or attached in a spreadsheet)</li> </ul>	Mandatory	Appendix A – worksheet 1
<b>Project Development products</b>		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Populated Issues and Risks register</li> </ul>	Mandatory	Appendix A – worksheet 2





Car Parking Project - Commercialism Programme - Milestones for CHP															
Senior Responsible Officer			SD Sport, Events, Open spaces and Wellbeing	Programme Manager/Project Manager									Matt Hageney		
KEY:  completed  On target  at risk, plan in place  issue stopping delivery															
REF	DELIVERABLES/ MILESTONES	LEAD RESPONSIBILITY	BY	Jan-17	Feb-17	Mar-17	Apr-17	May-17	Jun-17	Jul-17	Aug-17	Sep-17	Oct-17	Nov-17	Dec-17
	Introduction of Charges for Car Parking in Major City Parks - CHP														
1.4.1	Engineer assigned for Phase 1	Project Manager	10.03.2017												
1.1.4	Cabinet report for Budget request	Project Manager	28.03.2017												
1.4.2	Project team set up	Project Manager	13.03.2017												
1.4.3	Site visit from project team	Project Manager	14.03.2017												
1.1.5	Full Business Case for Finance Governance	Project Manager	04.04.2017												
1.4.4	TRO (non highway) written and sent to advert	Traffic Manager	05.04.2017												
1.2.3	Consultation begins	Project Sponsor	05.04.2017												
1.4.6	TRO consultation complete ahead of decision	Traffic Manager	27.04.2017												
1.1.6	Post consultation Cabinet Member Report drawn up for Cannon Hill	Project Manager	28.04.2017												
1.4.12	Machines identified and purchased	Project Manager and Highways Engineer	22.05.2017												
1.4.13	Signage identified and purchased	Project Manager and Highways Engineer	22.05.2017												
1.4.11	Surface levelling phase 1 - Wildlife Conservation Centre car park	Project Manager and Highways Engineer	20.05.2017												
1.4.14	Installation of machines	Project Manager	22.06.2017												
1.4.15	Installation of signage	Project Manager	22.06.2017												
1.4.16	CCTV monitoring arrangements agreed	Project Manager	23.06.2017												

## Charging for Car Parking in Parks - CHP - RISK REGISTER

**Senior Responsible Officer**

SD Sport, Events, Open Spaces and Wellbeing

**Programme Manager/Project Manager**

Risk ID	Project	Date identified	Risk title and description	Risk Owner	Opening Risk Score			Mitigating Actions	Current Risk Score		
					Likelihood	Impact	Risk score		Likelihood	Impact	Risk score
1	Charging for Car Parking in Parks	01.01.2017	<b>Opposition to the scheme from interest groups or individuals</b>	SD Sport, Events, Open Spaces and Wellbeing	4	3	12	- clarity of message around the aims and objectives of the scheme - consultation on scheme to take place in the park and wit local residents	3	2	6
2	Charging for Car Parking in Parks	01.01.2017	<b>Failure to achieve anticipated income levels</b>	SD Sport, Events, Open Spaces and Wellbeing	3	3	9	- detailed research in to current car park usage and a 20% reduction modelled - review of scheme scheduled in winter 17/18 to review prices and overall strategy	2	2	4
3	Charging for Car Parking in Parks	01.01.2017	<b>Impact on use of the park</b>	SD Sport, Events, Open Spaces and Wellbeing	3	3	9	- seek to minimise impact by investing parks and car park facilities - provision of other transport options to use the park	2	3	6
4	Charging for Car Parking in Parks	01.01.2017	<b>Displacement parking negatively impacting on local neighbourhoods and residents</b>	Project Manager	3	4	12	-implementation of traffic restrictions on local roads - use of an experimental order to enable local residents to shape the scheme	3	1	3
5	Charging for Car Parking in Parks	01.01.2017	<b>Delay to scheme implementation</b>	Project Manager	4	3	12	- use of project manager to identify critical path and manage effectively - contingency options identified for critical points	3	2	6

6	Charging for Car Parking in Parks	01.01.2017	<b>Overspend of capital expenditure</b>	Project Manager	4	3	12	- Use of project manager to work with SMEs and contractors to identify costs - value engineering solutions explored where required	3	2	6
---	-----------------------------------	------------	---	-----------------	---	---	----	---	---	---	---

Car Parking Project - Commercialism Programme - RESOURCE PLAN																												
Senior Responsible Officer			SD Sport, Events, Open Spaces and Wellbeing																									
No of FTE required over 1 calendar month																												
Type	February-17		March-17		April-17		May-17		June-17		July-17		August-17		September-17		October-17		November-17		December-17		January-18		February-18		March-18	
	Required	Available	Required	Available	Required	Available	Required	Available	Required	Available	Required	Available	Required	Available	Required	Available	Required	Available	Required	Available	Required	Available	Required	Available	Required	Available	Required	Available
Business SME i.e HoS, social worker			0.7	0.7	0.4	0.4	0.4	0.4	0.4	0.4	0.3	0.3	0.3	0.3	0.3	0.3	0.2	0.2	0.2	0.2	0.2							
Communications							0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1																		
Legal			0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1																						
Property	0.1	0.1																										
Procurement																												
Programme/Project Manager	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6						
Total Resources	0.7	0.7	1.4	1.4	1.1	1.1	1.1	1.1	1.1	1.1	0.9	0.9	0.9	0.9	0.9	0.9	0.8	0.8	0.8	0.8	0.8	0.6	0	0	0	0	0	0

# Equality Analysis

## Birmingham City Council Analysis Report

<b>EA Name</b>	Introduction Of Car Parking Charges In Cannon Hill Park
<b>Directorate</b>	Place
<b>Service Area</b>	Place - Parks & Nature Conservation
<b>Type</b>	New/Proposed Function
<b>EA Summary</b>	To evaluate the impact of the introduction of car parking charges in Cannon Hill Park on citizens who identify with an equality characteristic
<b>Reference Number</b>	EA001949
<b>Task Group Manager</b>	matt.hageney@birmingham.gov.uk
<b>Task Group Members</b>	Mike.Hinton@birmingham.gov.uk , philip.beville@birmingham.gov.uk
<b>Senior Officer</b>	steve.hollingworth@birmingham.gov.uk
<b>Quality Control Officer</b>	placeequalitycontrol@birmingham.gov.uk

### Introduction

The report records the information that has been submitted for this equality analysis in the following format.

#### **Initial Assessment**

This section identifies the purpose of the Policy and which types of individual it affects. It also identifies which equality strands are affected by either a positive or negative differential impact.

#### **Relevant Protected Characteristics**

For each of the identified relevant protected characteristics there are three sections which will have been completed.

- Impact
- Consultation
- Additional Work

If the assessment has raised any issues to be addressed there will also be an action planning section.

The following pages record the answers to the assessment questions with optional comments included by the assessor to clarify or explain any of the answers given or relevant issues.

## 1 Activity Type

The activity has been identified as a New/Proposed Function.

## 2 Initial Assessment

### 2.1 Purpose and Link to Strategic Themes

#### What is the purpose of this Function and expected outcomes?

The introduction of car parking charges at Cannon Hill Park will encourage and promote greener transport options, and provide an income stream to protect and invest in car parking facilities. The expected outcome is income generation that will be reinvested in the infrastructure and health and safety of the car park, as well as the promotion of green transport usage.

For each strategy, please decide whether it is going to be significantly aided by the Function.

Children: A Safe And Secure City In Which To Learn And Grow	Yes
Health: Helping People Become More Physically Active And Well	Yes
Housing : To Meet The Needs Of All Current And Future Citizens	No
Jobs And Skills: For An Enterprising, Innovative And Green City	Yes

### 2.2 Individuals affected by the policy

Will the policy have an impact on service users/stakeholders?	Yes
---	-----

#### Comment:

We do not have any demographic data at this stage, but this project will impact on any park user across the city that parks their car at Cannon Hill Park.

Will the policy have an impact on employees?	Yes
--	-----

#### Comment:

BCC staff whose regular place of work is Cannon Hill Park will be affected by the changes. However, it is proposed to issue these staff with a parking permit, to be used for work purposes only.

Will the policy have an impact on wider community?	Yes
--	-----

#### Comment:

There is the risk that displaced parking will affect neighbouring roads in the proximity of Cannon Hill Park. As such, an experimental Traffic Regulation Order has been implemented in the roads immediately surrounding the park.

### 2.3 Relevance Test

Protected Characteristics	Relevant	Full Assessment Required
Age	Relevant	No
Disability	Relevant	No
Gender	Not Relevant	No
Gender Reassignment	Not Relevant	No
Marriage Civil Partnership	Not Relevant	No
Pregnancy And Maternity	Not Relevant	No
Race	Not Relevant	No

Religion or Belief	Not Relevant	No
Sexual Orientation	Not Relevant	No

## 2.4 Analysis on Initial Assessment

Residents of surrounding roads, Friends of Parks groups and members of the public are being consulted with through a letter drop, meetings and advertisement in press. An experimental Traffic Regulation Order has been drawn up to ensure residents are not adversely affected by displacement parking as a result of implementing charges for parking.

Disability - disabled drivers/blue badge owners are not disadvantaged by the charging policy, as they are not subject to charging in line with the city's policy on disabled parking.

Gender - no potential for discrimination or adverse impact.

Gender Reassignment - no potential for discrimination or adverse impact.

Marriage & Civil Partnership - no potential for discrimination or adverse impact.

Pregnancy & Maternity - no potential for discrimination or adverse impact.

Age - there is a risk that older citizens may be adversely disadvantaged by the charging policy, especially those from low income households. Although we have no data to support this and this is anecdotal, this issue has been raised in consultation.

Race - no potential for discrimination or adverse impact.

Religion or Belief - no potential for discrimination or adverse impact.

Sexual Orientation - no potential for discrimination or adverse impact.

The EA report will be continually updated but is up to date following the consultation that ended on 27th April.

### 3 Full Assessment

The assessment questions below are completed for all characteristics identified for full assessment in the initial assessment phase.

#### 3.1 Age - Assessment Questions

##### 3.1.1 Age - Relevance

Age	Relevant
-----	----------

**Comment:**

There is a risk that elderly citizens that regularly use the parks may be negatively impacted, particularly those on a low income. This issue was identified in the consultation.

This issue is partially mitigated by the availability of free bus travel for older citizens. Cannon Hill is well served by effective bus routes, with the number 1 (serving Five Ways, Edgbaston, Moseley and Acocks Green) and 35 (serving City Centre, Balsall Heath, Moseley and Kings Heath) stopping immediately outside the park. In addition the busses 45 and 47 stop approximately five minutes walk from the park - which serve City Centre (Carrs Lane), Selly Park, Stirchley, Cotteridge and Kings Norton. In addition the bus routes of the 62 and 63 busses stop approximately 10 minutes walk from the park.

In addition the park is on national cycle route 5 and bike racks and cycle facilities are provided at the park to enable all citizens to access the park by bicycle.

Further reviews of the scheme will take place post implementation to identify opportunities to further mitigate the impact on older people on a low income.

#### 3.1 Disability - Assessment Questions

##### 3.1.1 Disability - Relevance

Disability	Relevant
------------	----------

**Comment:**

Blue Badge holders may be impacted, but no more so than other users of the park. Disabled drivers with blue badges will not be charged to park, in line with the citywide disabled parking policy

#### 3.1 Concluding Statement on Full Assessment

An action plan is in place to mitigate potential impact on older people, including:

- . Promotion of public transport options (including amending the Birmingham City Council website to include) and working with services and partners in the park to promote these options
- . Reviewing the impact of the scheme after 3-6 months (using information from the parks service and the Mac), including giving consideration to the introduction of tariffs targeting specific groups

### 4 Review Date

05/10/17

### 5 Action Plan

There are no relevant issues, so no action plans are currently required.



**TITLE OF PAPER: BUSINESS CASE FOR RETENTION OF SURPLUS OF CANNON HILL PARKING SCHEME WITHIN THE PARKS SERVICE**

**DATE: APRIL 2017**

**Background:**

The Commercialism Board agreed on 27 March 2017 a series of principles associated with the use and retention of financial benefits realised through commercial schemes. The principles are attached in Appendix 1 of this note.

A scheme to introduce car parking charges within major city parks was approved by Commercialism Board on 23 January 2017 and by Trusts and Charities Committee on 1 March 2017. The business case for this approach outlined an intention to reinvest any surplus income after the achievement of the savings target to improve parking facilities and infrastructure within parks and also invest in the wider parks service.

Alongside the introduction of the scheme to introduce car parking charges a 10% reduction (£1.2m) of the parks service budget has been consulted on and agreed as part of the budget for 2017/18, which will have a significant impact on services and capacity to create, implement and test new schemes and initiatives.

The longer term approach for the parks service is to move towards a model of self-sustainability – where income streams are created and maximised. As part of this a commercial and strategic business plan is being developed for each major park within the city, to sit alongside a plan for the entire service.

**Proposal to Retain Surplus:**

The first scheme associated with implementing car parking charges in parks is scheduled to take place in Cannon Hill Park. It is anticipated that after costs and investment in infrastructure there will be in the region of £30k surplus income at Cannon Hill Park. After the agreed savings target has been achieved across the service it is proposed that this income is fully retained within the parks service to:

1. Fund delivery of future parking schemes in other parks
2. Enable feasibility analysis to take place for other commercial schemes within Cannon Hill Park
3. Fund the exploration of improvement to services/infrastructure in the services to the park.

The proposed uses of the income above fit with the 2<sup>nd</sup> principle of the paper agreed at Commercialism on 27 March 2017 – *‘As additional resource for the service delivering the income to invest in service improvements (including the identification and implementation of further opportunities to generate additional income)’*.

The level of anticipated surplus also falls within the £100k guideline, for which it was anticipated that the service would retain the benefit.

**Next Steps:**

It is planned to implement the scheme on 23 June 2017 and that the performance of the scheme (financial and otherwise) is reported to Commercialism Board on a quarterly basis.

The retention of income for future schemes will be considered on a case by case basis in line with the principles agreed at Commercialism Board.

## Appendix 1 - Report to Commercialism Board – 27 March 2017

### Framework for Allocation of Surpluses from Commercialism Projects

#### Background

As the Council seeks to pursue an increasingly commercial approach, it is important to ensure that services are suitably incentivised to act in the wider financial interests of the Council. It is acknowledged that each “commercialism project” undertaken will have its own specific drivers, and that different approaches may be necessary for different projects, which may be very different in scale and impact.

The approach to be taken is therefore to set out a framework for the treatment of additional income arising as a result of commercialism projects, with the detailed application of the framework required to form a part of the Business Case for the individual project.

#### The Framework – Key Principles

The framework to be adopted consists of a small number of key principles / priorities for the application of any additional income generated. Any additional income generated should first be top-sliced for two purposes (ensuring that the service generating the income is not penalised or incentivised to act perversely):

1. To meet any costs incurred in delivering the additional income, including a contribution to the costs of the Commercialism Team
2. To deliver any approved savings proposals relating to the specific project

Remaining income then represents genuine additionality for the Council’s overall financial resources and offers a range of opportunities to be considered on a case by case basis:

1. As a contingency / mitigation against any non-delivery of other savings proposals – whether within the service generating the income or otherwise
2. As additional resource for the service delivering the income to invest in service improvements (including the identification and implementation of further opportunities to generate additional income)
3. As a more general corporate resource to be made available to direct towards Council priorities

Any retention of surpluses by the service must be supported by a business case for retention / investment, with the allocation of resources (after top-slicing as set out above) dependent on the level of annual surplus generated. The allocation of resources will vary from case to case, but a typical approach may reflect the following principles:

1. The first £100,000 of surplus – 100% retention by the service
2. Surplus between £100,000 and £400,000 – split 50/50 between the service and corporate priorities
3. Surplus above £400,000 – available to meet corporate priorities

This approach ensures that the service has a direct financial incentive to generate surpluses (capped at £250,000 per annum for each initiative subject to a business case), whilst also allowing resources to be directed to meet corporate priorities.

**Recommendation**

The Commercialism Board is recommended to endorse the benefits allocation framework as set out above.

**Appendix 6 – Summary of Consultation**

<b>Internal Consultation</b>			
<b>Date and Summary</b>	<b>Who Consulted with</b>	<b>Summary of Feedback</b>	<b>Response</b>
23/01/2017 – Introduction of car parking charges in parks – including Cannon Hill Park	Commercialism Board (Deputy Leader, Cabinet Member VFM and Efficiency, Strategic Director Change and Support Services, Interim Strategic Director Place, Interim Strategic Director Economy, Head of City Finance (Place)	Supportive of proposals and implementation timescales of June, noted need to address impact of parking on local residents	Confirmed scheme would include orders to mitigate impact on residents
01/03/2017 – Introduction of car parking charges in Cannon Hill and Sutton Parks	Trusts and Charities Committee	Committee approved proposal.  No objection to scheme in Cannon Hill Park.	Non required
16/03/2017 – Introduction of scheme and surrounding traffic management orders	Local members, Cllr Lisa Trickett, Cllr Claire Spencer	Supportive of scheme.  Requested details of proposed surrounding traffic orders and other measures to support issues residents facing.	Details provided.  Agreed to hold residents meeting approx. 2 months post implementation.
31/03/2017 – Overview of information provided to residents	Local members, Cllr Lisa Trickett, Cllr Claire Spencer, Cllr Martin Straker Welds	Information is appropriate	Non required
Ongoing and 27/04/2017 – Overview of scheme	Head of City Finance, Head of Legal, Head of Procurement	Supportive of scheme, minor amends to structure, approaches	Changes incorporated

		taken.  Approved scheme	
Ongoing – Traffic and Highways Officers – Implementation of TRO's	Project Leader – Traffic Management Service  Senior District Engineer, District Engineer	Information to shape TRO restrictions and consultation response	All proposals considered and incorporated

External Consultation			
Date and Summary	Who Consulted with	Summary of Feedback	Response
08/03/2017 – Overview of scheme and proposed timescales	Chief Executive – Midlands Arts Centre	Supportive of proposals	Noted
14/03/2017 – Implementation issues and operational concerns	Director of Operations – Midlands Arts Centre	Supportive of proposals, operational needs to be considered	Issues noted and scheme designed to meet
31/03/2017 – TRO statutory consultees	Statutory consultees regarding TRO (i.e. Police, Fire Service)	No objections	Noted
06/04/2017 – 6-12 month public consultation on temporary TRO for surrounding roads	Local residents on Russell Road, Moorcroft Road, The Russells, users of the park and general public	See below	All comments/objections responded to via email and respondents were offered a follow up phone conversation
06/04/2017 – 3 week public consultation regarding TRO in park	Users of the park and general public	See below	All comments/objections responded to via email and respondents were offered a follow up phone conversation

#### Summary of public consultation:

The consultation took place on 6th April and we received 13 responses, of which 5 related to the charging in the park and 8 related to the experimental TRO for surrounding roads. They were varied in their responses, from positive to negative and raised a variety of concerns and views that have been considered as part of the scheme and consultation will continue to shape future developments.

