

BIRMINGHAM CITY COUNCIL

BIRMINGHAM CITY COUNCIL

TUESDAY, 05 NOVEMBER 2019 AT 14:00 HOURS
IN COUNCIL CHAMBER, COUNCIL HOUSE, VICTORIA SQUARE,
BIRMINGHAM, B1 1BB

A G E N D A

1 NOTICE OF RECORDING

Lord Mayor to advise that this meeting will be webcast for live or subsequent broadcast via the Council's Internet site (www.civico.net/birmingham) and that members of the press/public may record and take photographs except where there are confidential or exempt items.

2 DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS

Members are reminded that they must declare all relevant pecuniary and non pecuniary interests arising from any business to be discussed at this meeting. If a disclosable pecuniary interest is declared a Member must not speak or take part in that agenda item. Any declarations will be recorded in the minutes of the meeting.

3 MINUTES

To confirm and authorise the signing of the Minutes of the meeting of the Council held on 10 September 2019.

4 LORD MAYOR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

(1400-1410)

To receive the Lord Mayor's announcements and such communications as the Lord Mayor may wish to place before the Council.

5 PETITIONS

(10 minutes allocated) (1410-1420)

To receive and deal with petitions in accordance with Council Rules of Procedure (B4.4 E of the Constitution)

As agreed by Council Business Management Committee a schedule of outstanding petitions is available electronically with the published papers for

the meeting and can be viewed or downloaded.

6 QUESTION TIME

(70 minutes allocated) (1420-1530)

To deal with oral questions in accordance with Council Rules of Procedure (B4.4 F of the Constitution).

- A. Questions from Members of the Public to any Cabinet Member or Ward Forum Chair (20 minutes)
- B. Questions from any Councillor to a Committee Chair, Lead Member of a Joint Board or Ward Forum Chair (10 minutes)
- C. Questions from Councillors other than Cabinet Members to a Cabinet Member (20 minutes)
- D. Questions from Councillors other than Cabinet Member to the Leader or Deputy Leader (20 minutes)

67 - 68

7 APPOINTMENTS BY THE COUNCIL

(5 minutes allocated) (1530-1535)

To make appointments to, or removals from, committees, outside bodies or other offices which fall to be determined by the Council as set out in the report.

8 EXEMPTION FROM STANDING ORDERS

Councillor Martin Straker Welds to move an exemption from Standing Orders.

69 - 88

9 TACKLING PERIOD POVERTY AND RAISING PERIOD AWARENESS

(50 minutes allocated) (1535-1625)

To consider a report of the Health and Social Care Overview and Scrutiny Committee together with an Executive commentary.

Councillor Rob Pocock to Move the following Motion:

"That the recommendations R01 to R06 be approved, and that the Executive be requested to pursue their implementation."

(break 1625 - 1655)

10 **A34 PERRY BARR HIGHWAY IMPROVEMENT SCHEME**

(50 minutes allocated) (1655-1745)

To debate a petition relating to the demolition of Perry Barr Flyover.

Councillor Morriam Jan to read out the petition attached.

Councillor Waseem Zaffar to move the following Motion:

"Council notes the petitions 2142 and 2156 submitted in support of the A34 Flyover. Pending the re-consideration of the Full Business Case for the scheme by Cabinet, following a call-in by the Sustainability and Transport Overview & Scrutiny Committee, the Council recommends that these petitions are discharged."

11 **MOTIONS FOR DEBATE FROM INDIVIDUAL MEMBERS**

(90 minutes allocated) (1745-1915)

To consider the attached Motions of which notice has been given in accordance with Council Rules of Procedure (B4.4 G of the Constitution).



**MEETING OF BIRMINGHAM
CITY COUNCIL, TUESDAY,
10 SEPTEMBER 2019**

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF BIRMINGHAM CITY COUNCIL HELD
ON TUESDAY, 10 SEPTEMBER 2019 AT 1400 HOURS IN THE COUNCIL
CHAMBER, COUNCIL HOUSE, BIRMINGHAM**

PRESENT:- Lord Mayor (Councillor Mohammed Azim) in the Chair.

Councillors

Muhammad Afzal	Mohammed Fazal	Keith Linnecor
Akhlaq Ahmed	Peter Fowler	Mary Locke
Mohammed Aikhlaq	Jayne Francis	Ewan Mackey
Alex Aitken	Peter Griffiths	Majid Mahmood
Deirdre Alden	Fred Grindrod	Zhor Malik
Robert Alden	Paulette Hamilton	Karen McCarthy
Tahir Ali	Roger Harmer	Saddak Miah
Olly Armstrong	Kath Hartley	Gareth Moore
Gurdial Singh Atwal	Adam Higgs	Simon Morrall
David Barrie	Charlotte Hodivala	Yvonne Mosquito
Baber Baz	Jon Hunt	Brett O'Reilly
Bob Beauchamp	Mahmood Hussain	John O'Shea
Matt Bennett	Shabrana Hussain	David Pears
Kate Booth	Timothy Huxtable	Robert Pocock
Sir Albert Bore	Zafar Iqbal	Julien Pritchard
Nicky Brennan	Ziaul Islam	Hendrina Quinnen
Marje Bridle	Morriam Jan	Carl Rice
Mick Brown	Kerry Jenkins	Gary Sambrook
Tristan Chatfield	Meirion Jenkins	Kath Scott
Zaker Choudhry	Julie Johnson	Mike Sharpe
Debbie Clancy	Brigid Jones	Sybil Spence
John Clancy	Nagina Kauser	Ron Storer
Liz Clements	Mariam Khan	Martin Straker Welds
Maureen Cornish	Narinder Kaur Kooner	Sharon Thompson
John Cotton	Chaman Lal	Paul Tilsley
Phil Davis	Mike Leddy	Lisa Trickett
Adrian Delaney	Bruce Lines	Ian Ward
Barbara Dring	John Lines	Mike Ward
Neil Eustace		

NOTICE OF RECORDING

- 19251 The Lord Mayor advised that the meeting would be webcast for live and subsequent broadcasting via the Council's internet site and that members of the Press/Public may record and take photographs except where there are confidential or exempt items.

The Lord Mayor reminded Members that they did not enjoy Parliamentary Privilege in relation to debates in the Chamber and Members should be careful in what they say during all debates that afternoon.

DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS

- 19252 The Lord Mayor reminded members that they must declare all relevant pecuniary and non-pecuniary interests arising from any business to be discussed at this meeting.
-

MINUTES

It was moved by the Lord Mayor, seconded and –

- 19253 **RESOLVED:-**

That the Minutes of the meeting held on 9 July 2019 having been circulated to each Member of the Council, be taken as read and confirmed and signed.

LORD MAYOR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

- 19254 The Lord Mayor indicated that he had no announcements to make.
-

PETITIONS

Petition Relating to City Council Functions Presented prior to the Meeting

The following petition was presented:-

(See document No. 1)

In accordance with the proposals by the persons presenting the petition, it was moved by the Lord Mayor, seconded and -

- 19255 **RESOLVED:-**

That the petition be received and referred to the relevant Chief Officer to examine and report as appropriate.

Petitions Relating to City Council Functions Presented at the Meeting

The following petitions were presented:-

(See document No. 2)

In accordance with the proposals by the Members presenting the petitions, it was moved by the Lord Mayor, seconded and -

19256 **RESOLVED:-**

That the petitions be received and referred to the relevant Chief Officer(s) to examine and report as appropriate.

Petitions Update

The following Petitions Update had been made available electronically:-

(See document No. 3)

It was moved by the Lord Mayor, seconded and -

19257 **RESOLVED:-**

That the Petitions Update be noted and those petitions for which a satisfactory response has been received, be discharged.

QUESTION TIME

19258 The Council proceeded to consider Oral Questions in accordance with Standing Order 10.3.

Details of the questions asked are available for public inspection via the Webcast.

APPOINTMENTS BY THE COUNCIL

The following schedule was submitted:-

(See document No 4)

19259 **RESOLVED:-**

That the appointments be made to serve on the Committees and other bodies set out below:-

Education and Children's Social Care Overview and Scrutiny Committee

Councillor Chaudhry Rashid be appointed for the period ending with the Annual Meeting of City Council in May 2020.

EXEMPTION FROM STANDING ORDERS

19260 **RESOLVED:-**

That, pursuant to discussions by Council Business Management Committee, Standing Orders be waived as follows:

- Allocate 25 minutes for item 9 (Refresh of the Council Plan)
- Allocate 20 minutes for item 11 (The Constitution)
- Allocate 5 minutes for item 12 (Political Assistants)
- Allocate 5 minutes each for items 14 and 16 (Appointment of Acting Chief Executive)

Council Business Management Committee also agreed that the meeting be extended to finish at 2000 hours.”

EXTENSION TO THE MEETING FINISHING TIME

In accordance with Standing Order 7 (Suspension of Standing Orders) the Lord Mayor asked that a Leader or Deputy Leader (or their nominee) of one of the Party Groups to move that the meeting be extended to finish at 2000 hours and that that be seconded by the Leader or Deputy Leader (or their nominee) of another Party Group.

It was moved by the Leader, Councillor Ian Ward and seconded by Councillor Robert Alden and agreed:-

19261 **RESOLVED:-**

That the meeting be extended to finish at 2000 hours

REFRESH OF THE COUNCIL PLAN

The following report from the Leader of the Council was submitted:-

(See document No. 5)

The Leader, Councillor Ian Ward moved the motion which was seconded.

In accordance with Council Standing Orders, Councillors Jon Hunt and Roger Harmer gave notice of the following amendment to the Motion:-

(See document No. 6)

Councillor Jon Hunt moved the amendment which was seconded by Councillor Roger Harmer.

A debate ensued.

The Leader, Councillor Ian Ward replied to the debate.

The amendment having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

The Motion as amended having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

It was therefore-

19262

RESOLVED:-

That City Council adopt the refreshed Council Plan as the overarching statement of intent and direction to drive forward the Council's improvement journey and deliver the right outcomes for the city and its residents subject to the inclusion on page 9 in the section "our focus as we go forward:" insert the following as the second bullet point:

- Progressing neighbourhood clean air zones around schools none charging zones, encouraging sustainable school travel and planning that maximises access to schools by foot, bicycle and public transport, this to include taking forward "no idling" campaigns to be implemented around schools and at major junctions, including the use of enforcement where the law is breached.

SCRUTINY INQUIRY: FULL COUNCIL MEETING

The following report of the Co-ordinating Overview and Scrutiny Committee together with an Executive Commentary was submitted:-

(See document No. 7)

Councillor Carl Rice moved the motion which was seconded by Councillor Deirdre Alden.

A debate ensued.

Councillor Carl Rice replied to the debate.

The Motion having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

It was therefore-

19263

RESOLVED:-

That the recommendations R01 to R09 be approved, and that the Executive be requested to pursue their implementation.

ADJOURNMENT

It was moved by the Lord Mayor, seconded and

19264 **RESOLVED:-**

That the Council be adjourned until 1705 hours on this day.

The Council then adjourned at 1637 hours.

At 1708 hours the Council resumed at the point where the meeting had been adjourned.

THE CONSTITUTION

The following report of the Council Business Management Committee was submitted:-

(See document No. 8)

The Leader, Councillor Ian Ward moved the motion which was seconded.

In accordance with Council Standing Orders, Councillors Meirion Jenkins and Robert Alden gave notice of the following amendment to the Motion:-

(See document No. 9)

Councillor Meirion Jenkins moved the amendment which was seconded by Councillor Robert Alden.

Councillor John Cotton proposed and it was seconded that in 'Part B Roles, Functions and Rules of Procedure B14 Audit Committee' paragraph 14.3 ii be deleted.

A debate ensued.

The Leader, Councillor Ian Ward replied to the debate.

The first amendment having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

The amendment by Councillor John Cotton having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

The Motion as amended having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

It was therefore-

19265 **RESOLVED:-**

That approval be given to the revised City Council Constitution as attached and that the City Solicitor be authorised to implement the changes with effect from 11th September 2019 subject to changes being made, to set out a clear right for all members of the Audit Committee to have access to any information that is relevant to their role to be discussed by Group Leaders for the wording to be agreed.

In 'Part B Roles, Functions and Rules of Procedure B14 Audit Committee' paragraph 14.3 ii be deleted.

POLITICAL ASSISTANTS

The following report of the Council Business Management Committee was submitted:-

(See document No. 10)

The Leader, Councillor Ian Ward moved the motion which was seconded.

A debate ensued.

The Leader, Councillor Ian Ward replied to the debate.

The Motion having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

It was therefore-

19266 **RESOLVED:-**

That the City Council approves the principle of appointing political assistants within the framework of the Local Government and Housing Act 1989.

That the City Council notes that should the principle stated above be approved then one post will be allocated to each qualifying Group (currently the Labour and Conservative groups) and the procedure at paragraph 8 below will be followed, should a group wish to make an appointment.

MOTIONS FOR DEBATE FROM INDIVIDUAL MEMBERS

The Council proceeded to consider the Motions of which notice had been given in accordance with Standing Order 4(i).

A. Councillor Adam Higgs and Bruce Lines have given notice of the following motion.

(See document No. 11)

Councillor Adam Higgs moved the Motion which was seconded by Councillor Bruce Lines.

In accordance with Council Standing Orders, Councillors Paul Tilsley and Zaker Choudhry gave notice of the following amendment to the Motion:-

(See document No. 12)

Councillor Paul Tilsley moved the amendment which was seconded by Councillor Zaker Choudhry.

In accordance with Council Standing Orders, Councillors John O'Shea and Phil Davis gave notice of the following amendment to the Motion:-

(See document No. 13)

Councillor John O'Shea moved the amendment which was seconded by Councillor Phil Davis.

A debate ensued.

Councillor Adam Higgs replied to the debate.

The first amendment having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

The second amendment having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

Here upon a poll being demanded the voting with names listed in seat number order was as follows:-

(See document No. 14)

The total results referred to in the interleave read:-

Yes – 57 (For the amendment)
No – 20 (Against the amendment)
Abstain – 0 (Abstentions)

The Motion as amended having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

It was therefore-

19267

RESOLVED:-

This Council shares the concerns of residents about illegal encampments on public open spaces and other areas in the city. The Council believes

everyone should be welcome in this city as long as they are law-abiding and have respect for other residents and visitors. Behaviour which blocks public access to parks, intimidates residents, damages property and leaves behind mess that has to be cleared at tax payers' expense should not be tolerated from anyone regardless of their background.

The Council condemns the damage and disruption caused by individuals and groups who unlawfully set up encampments in the city in recent years, such as on popular local places such as Daisy Farm Park and Pype Hayes Park.

This council recognises the strong relationship that we have with the West Midlands Police and that there is an existing protocol governing the response to unlawful encampments. This council recognises the outstanding work carried out by council officers responding to incursions to ensure that the legal work required to remove unlawful encampments is completed as soon as possible and that for the vast majority of cases, removal is complete within 72 hours of reporting.

Given the cost to tax payers associated with this activity – including legal fees and the cleaning costs – this Council also believes that more should be done to seek to recover the costs to the public purse from the perpetrators.

The Council notes the Government's response to its consultation on powers for dealing with unauthorised encampments and welcomes proposals for additional powers to the police, including:

- To increase the period of time in which trespassers directed from land would be unable to return (from 3 to 12 months).
- Ability to act on encampments where two or more vehicles are present (currently there has to be 6 or more).
- Allows police to remove trespassers on land which forms part of the highway.

However the Council is concerned that Government proposals for the police to be given powers to direct trespassers to suitable sites in neighbouring local authorities, may mean that some local authorities decide not to make adequate provision for the gypsy and traveller community and instead rely instead on other councils so to do.

The Council also notes that the Government intends to consult on making deliberate trespass a criminal offence, as it already the case in the Republic of Ireland where it has shown to be effective in tackling the problem of unauthorised encampments.

The Council also notes that the new Birmingham transit site will be opening at the end of September 2019. This will allow the police to use their existing powers to direct trespassers to this site.

The Council resolves to

- Write to the government expressing support for the proposed new powers listed above and for making deliberate trespass a criminal

offence, but raise concerns about the impact on cash-strapped local authorities of allowing neighbouring authorities to avoid their responsibilities towards the gypsy and traveller community. This letter should make the case for both of these to be implemented as soon as possible and also for additional funding to be provided to police services and local authorities to allow them to carry out this work effectively.

- Continue to work to revise the existing protocol agreed with the West Midlands Police. The council has a legal requirement to meet its equality duty and must consider the welfare of trespassers and is required in law to decide whether it can tolerate the encampment.
 - Continue to work on building the detailed evidence base required to gain a city wide injunction against unauthorised encampments to enable the speedy removal of such encampments and prevent the practice of moving from site to site within the city boundaries.
 - Request the relevant Director and officers to see what more can be done to recover costs through the courts from trespassers for the associated legal fees, repairs to property and cleaning costs and to report back to Housing and Neighbourhoods Overview and Scrutiny Committee.
 - Work with local councillors, friends of parks and other community groups to identify areas vulnerable to trespass and prioritise those for appropriate preventative and deterrent measures as and when funding permits. A report to be provided back to Housing and Neighbourhoods Overview and Scrutiny Committee.
 - Promote clearer reporting mechanisms for residents so that swift action can be taken at the first sign of unauthorised encampments being set up and that the relevant officers report back on steps taken to Housing and Neighbourhoods Overview and Scrutiny Committee.
 - Considers providing sufficient legal campsites to enable the Council to apply to the Courts for a City wide injunction to prohibit unauthorised campsites and incursions as a matter of urgency.
-

EXTENSION OF TIME

It was proposed by Councillor Robert Alden and seconded by the Leader, Councillor Ian Ward that the time for consideration of agenda item 13 (Motions for Debate from Individual Members) be extended by 20 minutes.

The Lord Mayor put the proposal to the vote and by a show of hands it was declared to be carried.

It was therefore-

19268

RESOLVED:-

That the time for consideration of agenda item 13 (Motions for Debate from Individual Members) be extended by 20 minutes.

B. Councillor Roger Harmer and Morriam Jan have given notice of the following motion.

(See document No. 15)

Councillor Roger Harmer moved the Motion which was seconded by Councillor Morriam Jan who declared an interest as she was an employee of a Housing Association.

In accordance with Council Standing Orders, Councillors Gary Sambrook and Matt Bennett gave notice of the following amendment to the Motion:-

(See document No. 16)

Councillor Gary Sambrook moved the amendment which was seconded by Councillor Matt Bennett.

As the time for the item had been used the Lord Mayor asked that the remaining motions and amendments be moved and seconded formally (without comment) and following which the amendments and motion would be put to the vote without discussion

In accordance with Council Standing Orders, Councillors Sharon Thompson and Nicky Brennan gave notice of the following amendment to the Motion:-

(See document No. 17)

Councillor Sharon Thompson formally moved the amendment which was formally seconded by Councillor Nicky Brennan.

The first amendment having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be lost.

Here upon a poll being demanded the voting with names listed in seat number order was as follows:-

(See document No. 18)

The total results referred to in the interleaved read:-

Yes – 19 (For the motion)
No – 55 (Against the motion)
Abstain – 0 (Abstentions)

The second amendment having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

The Motion as amended having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

It was therefore-

19269

RESOLVED:-

This Council notes with great concern the desperate shortage of socially rented housing in Birmingham and across the UK, which is having a terrible impact on its residents in housing need. This impact includes:

- The homeless having to wait for months in temporary accommodation, often outside the City, badly disrupting their lives.
- Residents having to live permanently in overcrowded accommodation, with no prospect of moving to a home large enough for their needs.

In addition, the Council notes that when replacing Birmingham homes sold under 'right to buy', housing associations are under no obligation to build the new homes in Birmingham. Instead, they are more likely to build in locations where land values are less expensive. This will result in a loss of socially rented accommodation in Birmingham.

This Council also notes that this shortage of socially rented housing has developed over 40 years, with insufficient investment in new socially rented accommodation to replace that lost to 'right to buy', year after year. This process is continuing with only a small percentage of 'affordable housing' being built each year as socially rented housing.

This Council therefore agrees:

- To continue to lobby Parliament to provide the funding to support the building of 100,000 units of socially rented housing a year nationally, with a fair share, according to need, in Birmingham;
- To continue to lobby Parliament to suspend 'right to buy' for both local authority and housing association properties until it is possible to replace the homes sold on a like-for-like basis.;
- To actively publicise not just the proportion of 'affordable housing' in each new development, but also the proportion of socially rented housing.

C. Councillor Ian Ward and Akhlaq Ahmed have given notice of the following motion.

(See document No. 19)

The Leader, Councillor Ian Ward formally moved the Motion which was formally seconded by Councillor Akhlaq Ahmed.

In accordance with Council Standing Orders, Councillors Jon Hunt and Roger Harmer gave notice of the following amendment to the Motion:-

(See document No. 20)

Councillor Jon Hunt formally moved the amendment which was formally seconded by Councillor Zaker Choudhry as Councillor Roger Harmer was not in the Chamber.

In accordance with Council Standing Orders, Councillors Deirdre Alden and Ewan Mackey gave notice of the following amendment to the Motion:-

(See document No. 21)

Councillor Deirdre Alden formally moved the amendment which was formally seconded by Councillor Ewan Mackey.

The first amendment having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

The second amendment having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be lost.

The Motion as amended having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

It was therefore-

19270

RESOLVED:-

This council notes

- Local government has endured central government funding cuts of nearly 50% since 2010. - Between 2010 and 2020, councils will have lost 60p out of every £1 they have received from central government.
- The 2019 LGA survey of council finances found that 1 in 3 councils fear they will run out of funding to provide even their statutory, legal duties by 2022/23. This number rises to almost two thirds of councils by 2024/2025 or later.
- The LGA estimates councils will face a funding gap of £8 billion by 2025.
- Faced with these cuts from central government, the local government workforce has endured years of pay restraint with the majority of pay points losing 22 per cent of their value since 2009/10.
- At the same time as seeing their pay go down in real terms, workers experience ever increasing workloads and persistent job insecurity. Across the UK, an estimated 876,000 jobs have been lost in local government since June 2010 – a reduction of 30 per cent. Local government has arguably been hit by more severe job losses than any other part of the public sector.

- There has been a disproportionate impact on women, with women making up more than three quarters of the local government workforce.

This council believes:

- Local Government workers provide an invaluable safety net for people and communities across the country and without the professionalism and dedication of our staff, the council services residents rely on would not be deliverable.
- Government funding has been cut to the extent that a proper pay rise could result in a reduction in local government services.
- The government needs to take responsibility and fully fund increases in pay; it should not put the burden on local authorities whose funding been cut to the bone.

This council resolves to

- Write to the Chancellor and Secretary of State in support of the pay claim submitted by GMB, UNISON and Unite on behalf of council and school workers for a £10 per hour minimum wage and a 10 per cent uplift across all other pay points in 2020/21 – subject to this increase being fully funded with new money from central government.
- Call on the Local Government Association to make urgent representations to central government to fund the NJC pay claim.
- Meet with local NJC union representatives to convey support for the pay claim.
- Encourage all local government workers to join a union.

EXTENSION OF TIME FOR THE MEETING

In accordance with standing Orders, it was proposed by Councillor Ian Ward and seconded by Councillor Robert Alden that the meeting time be extended by 5 minutes to 2005 hours.

The Lord Mayor put the proposal to the vote and by a show of hands it was declared to be carried.

It was therefore-

19271

RESOLVED:-

That the meeting time be extended by 5 minutes to 2005 hours.

APPOINTMENT OF ACTING CHIEF EXECUTIVE

The following report of the Council Business Management (Chief Officer and Deputy Chief Officer Appointments, Dismissals and Service Conditions Sub-) Committee was submitted:-

(See document No. 22)

The Lord Mayor requested that Members indicate if they wished to speak in the private part of the meeting. No one indicated.

The Leader, Councillor Ian Ward moved the motion which was seconded.

The Motion having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

It was therefore-

19272

RESOLVED:-

That the City Council as required by Part B, section 5.1 of the Constitution:

- (1) Approves the appointment of Clive Heaphy as Acting Chief Executive and Head of Paid Service in the period following Dawn Baxendale's departure until a new permanent Chief Executive begins working for the Council; and
- (2) Notes that the Acting Chief Executive will be employed on the usual terms and conditions agreed by the Joint Negotiating Committee (JNC) for Chief Executives as adopted and varied by the Council and this post will be paid via the Council's payroll; and
- (3) Notes that the period of notice on either side will be one month for up to six months service, and three months' notice for service beyond six months.

The meeting ended at 2003 hours.

APPENDIX

Questions and replies in accordance with Standing Order 10.2.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR EDDIE FREEMAN**

A1 Centenary Square - paving

Question:

What is the cost per slab of the paving in Centenary Square?

Answer:

Investment in Centenary Square will provide an economic benefit and jobs for the city.

The scheme has helped generate investment in surrounding developments such as Paradise, the HSBC and HMRC buildings as well as the forthcoming revamp of Symphony Hall.

The complete surface of Centenary Square is covered in granite, including the water feature, which is laid on a reinforced concrete slab.

Granite, as a natural product, was chosen for its longevity and durability – and laying it on a concrete slab ensures it can withstand the weight from any major event's infrastructure.

Several different colours/textures of granite were used, with varying costs, but the average cost for providing and laying the granite on Centenary Square is £50 per square meter.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR RON STORER**

A2 Centenary Square – Water Use

Question:

How much water is used per month for the water feature at Centenary Square?

Answer:

Investment in Centenary Square will provide an economic benefit and jobs for the city.

The scheme has helped generate investment in surrounding developments such as Paradise, the HSBC and HMRC buildings as well as the forthcoming revamp of Symphony Hall.

The water feature is designed to operate using the minimum amount of water possible, which is fed from an underground water tank. The water circulates from the tank, through the water jets, drainage channel and is then treated before returning to the tank for recirculation.

There will be a loss of water due to splash or evaporation for example, but there is also a natural top up when it rains.

The water feature designers estimate water usage (top up from the main) should be no greater than 120 cubic metres per month.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR DAVID BARRIE**

A3 Centenary Square – Energy Use

Question:

What is the monthly energy use for centenary square, including the water feature and lighting columns (please use estimated usage based on energy efficiency ratings and planned usage)?

Answer:

Investment in Centenary Square will provide an economic benefit and jobs for the city.

The scheme has helped generate investment in surrounding developments such as Paradise, the HSBC and HMRC buildings as well as the forthcoming revamp of Symphony Hall.

To keep the water feature running constantly, the water feature designers estimate that it will use 74,635 kilowatt hours (kWhrs) in power every year. However this will be reduced if the water feature is turned off to accommodate major events.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR BOB BEAUCHAMP**

A4 Centenary Square – Energy Efficiency

Question:

What energy saving measures were installed in Centenary Square (e.g. solar pv)?

Answer:

Investment in Centenary Square will provide an economic benefit and jobs for the city.

The scheme has helped generate investment in surrounding developments such as Paradise, the HSBC and HMRC buildings as well as the forthcoming revamp of Symphony Hall.

A number of energy efficiencies have been built into this scheme, including the way in which the water feature uses minimum water, which is cleaned and recycled and of course topped up by rainwater. The lighting columns in Centenary Square are installed with LED lights, which are more efficient and longer lasting than those traditionally used for street lighting. These are also fitted with light sensors, which prevent them coming on unnecessarily during daylight hours.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR ADAM HIGGS**

A5 Edgbaston Cricket Hospitality

Question:

How many tables\seats does the Council have at Edgbaston Cricket Ground?

Answer:

In 2019 the Council had one table of 12 at each of the following matches:

- Wednesday 19 June - New Zealand v South Africa
- Wednesday 26 June - New Zealand v Pakistan
- Tuesday 02 July -India V Bangladesh
- Thursday 01 August – England V Australia – Test Match

CITY COUNCIL – 10 SEPTEMBER 2019

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR ADRIAN DELANEY**

A6 Edgbaston Cricket Hospitality - Councillor Use

Question:

Which Councillors have attended which cricket matches at Edgbaston Cricket Ground in each of the last four years, using the Council's allocated seats\tables?

Answer:

The information for 2019 is as follows:

19 June 2019 - New Zealand v South Africa

Councillor Ian Ward, Councillor Zafar Iqbal

Wednesday 26 June - New Zealand v Pakistan

Councillor Ian Ward, Councillor Waseem Zaffar.

Tuesday 02 July -India V Bangladesh

Councillor Ian Ward.

Thursday 01 August – England V Australia – Test

Councillor Ian Ward, Councillor Chaman Lal.

It has not been possible to provide information for previous year as the historical information has not been retained within the city council or with Edgbaston Cricket Club.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR
JON HUNT**

A7 Perry Barr Flyover Petitions - Delay October Cabinet Decision

Question:

Given the decision of Council Business Management Committee to order a Council debate on the Perry Barr flyover petitions, will he be delaying the proposed October cabinet decision to hear the debate?

Answer:

It is not possible to delay this decision due to the need to deliver the changes on the A34 alongside the completion of the Perry Barr Residential Scheme, which will be used initially to house athletes and officials for the Commonwealth Games.

The Full Business Case for the A34 Perry Barr Highway Improvements is planned to be presented to Cabinet for decision on 15th October 2019.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE DEPUTY LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR ZAKER CHOUDHRY**

B1 Any Representations Received - effect of no deal Brexit

Question:

What, if any, representations has the council or combined authority received from representatives of industry and commerce about the effect of allowing a no deal Brexit on October 31st?

Answer:

Birmingham City Council has not received any specific representations from representatives of industry and commerce but we do have representatives from the Greater Birmingham Chambers of Commerce on the Brexit Commission. At those meetings they have highlighted the risk to businesses of supply chain disruption, significant extra paperwork, inflation costs, tariff costs, employee recruitment and retention, difficulty obtaining export certificates, amongst other issues. Greater Birmingham Chambers of Commerce have been awarded money via West Midlands Combined Authority which manages money pooled by councils from their government grants, to develop and promote the Brexit Tool Kit for local businesses to help them prepare.

Despite guarantees given by government on unspent EU funds, in the event of 'No Deal', the region could lose up to £200m of uncommitted EU funds to a centrally controlled government 'reserve', a large amount of which is support to businesses to upskill and recruit employees.

The West Midlands Mayor chairs a Brexit Economic Contingency Group with representation from business and industry stakeholders. This includes representatives from the Greater Birmingham Chambers of Commerce and Local Enterprise Partnerships. Further information should be requested from the West Midlands Combined Authority.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE DEPUTY LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR ZAKER CHOUDHRY**

B2 Any Representations Received - effect of no deal Brexit

Question:

What, if any, representations has the council or combined authority received from representatives of industry and commerce about the effect of allowing a no deal Brexit on October 31st?

Answer:

Birmingham City Council has not received any specific representations from representatives of industry and commerce but we do have representatives from the Greater Birmingham Chambers of Commerce on the Brexit Commission. At those meetings they have highlighted the risk to businesses of supply chain disruption, significant extra paperwork, inflation costs, tariff costs, employee recruitment and retention, difficulty obtaining export certificates, amongst other issues. Greater Birmingham Chambers of Commerce have been awarded money via West Midlands Combined Authority which manages money pooled by councils from their government grants, to develop and promote the Brexit Tool Kit for local businesses to help them prepare.

Despite guarantees given by government on unspent EU funds, in the event of 'No Deal', the region could lose up to £200m of uncommitted EU funds to a centrally controlled government 'reserve', a large amount of which is support to businesses to upskill and recruit employees.

The West Midlands Mayor chairs a Brexit Economic Contingency Group with representation from business and industry stakeholders. This includes representatives from the Greater Birmingham Chambers of Commerce and Local Enterprise Partnerships. Further information should be requested from the West Midlands Combined Authority.

APPENDIX TO QUESTION B2**Birmingham City Council Brexit Risk Register****No Deal Preparations**

(Category) Risk	Mitigating activity / current response	Risk Assessment			Corporate Director	Risk owner	Further information
		Likelihood	Impact	Severity			
1. <u>Trading Standards</u> 1.1 Importers: UK distributors of EU goods into the UK market will become importers and will need to comply with the resultant labelling requirements.	Business advice to these “new importers” will be provided by the Chambers of Commerce (signposting and Customs Declaration Service), Office of Product Safety and Standards, and local authority trading standards. BCC trading standards are arranging training for staff to enable them to support businesses.	5	2	10	Neighbourhoods	Sajeela Naseer	
1.2 Exporters: Exporters: UK businesses that place products on the EU market will need business advice in relation to compliance including labelling. Goods placed on the EU market originating from the UK that need third-party assessment will need to ensure an EU-recognised conformity assessment body is used. UK conformity assessment bodies will no longer be recognised by the EU after Brexit Products going through assessment of conformity by a UK notified body after exit day will need to apply the new UKCA mark that will be recognised in the UK but not the EU. Self-declared CE marks for products originating from UK will not be impacted and will continue to be recognised	Advice and guidance on these matters will be provided primarily through the Chambers of Commerce. It is believed that the Department for International Trade are in the process of establishing a hotline for business Brexit queries.	3	3	9	Neighbourhoods	Sajeela Naseer	
1.3 Product Safety: If tariffs are applied to EU goods then it is probable that importers increase imports from third party countries in the rest of the world. Products from these countries are far more unlikely to meet UK product safety requirements.	Trading Standards will have to significantly increase market surveillance to ensure product safety. Contingency funding has been requested to employ one more member of staff to deal with predicted increase in workload.	4	3	12	Neighbourhoods	Sajeela Naseer	

City Council – 10 September 2019

(Category) Risk	Mitigating activity / current response	Risk Assessment			Corporate Director	Risk owner	Further information
		Likelihood	Impact	Severity			
1.4 Product Safety: EU intelligence database- local trading standards will not have full access to EU intelligence databases through where information is shared about unsafe consumer products (e.g. RAPEX or ICSMS). The Office of Product Standards and Safety has developed and is trialing replacement UK wide system.	The new UK wide system for market surveillance be implemented shortly and training will be provided for staff by the Office of Product Safety and Standards	5	2	10	Neighbourhoods	Sajeela Naseer	
1.5 Misleading claims/fraud: Disruption in normal trading conditions provides opportunities for rogue traders to exploit consumers and in particular vulnerable adults using Brexit as a pretext for entering into unwanted/fraudulent contracts.	Intelligence led intervention will enable the most prolific offenders being identified and tackled. A rapid response service is provided to the vulnerable. Contingency funding has been requested to employ one more member of staff to deal with predicted increase in workload.	4	3	12	Neighbourhoods	Sajeela Naseer	
1.6 Regulatory Regimes: Confusion around the possibility of a number of regulatory regimes operating simultaneously to support different trade agreements.	Trading Standards will work with Chambers of Commerce and BEIS to monitor activities and mitigate as required.	2	2	4	Neighbourhoods	Sajeela Naseer	
2. Environmental health: 2.1 The ability of EH to safeguard food safety within the UK.	Potential need to recruit additional staff.	3	4	12	Neighbourhoods	Mark Croxford	
2.2 Concern regarding the significant increase in workload for officers as the export of food produce and products will require the UK to provide food health certification.	Currently BCC is reviewing food manufacturers and distributors to determine how many of them export to the EU. Work to be completed by the end of September 2019 and will provide indication of the scale of potential increased workload.	4	5	20	Neighbourhoods	Mark Croxford	

City Council – 10 September 2019

(Category) Risk	Mitigating activity / current response	Risk Assessment			Corporate Director	Risk owner	Further information
		Likelihood	Impact	Severity			
2.3 Further assistance may be required to support the Food Standards Agency which does not has the resource to complete the health certification demand for meat products premises. BCC is not currently resourced to provide this function.	Potential need to recruit additional staff.	3	5	15	Neighbourhoods	Mark Croxford	
3. <u>Procurement and Contract Management:</u> 3.1 Key suppliers to be consulted on whether servicing BCC contracts would be affected due to EU nationals being employed. Issues noted - agency staff: There could be an impact on the availability and cost of skilled labour, but it's not possible to determine what, if any impact at the moment.	Mitigation actions will need to be considered across wider work force and supply chain actions for example Travel Assist. Impact will depend on a) Any changes in taxation impacting the cost of labour and b) If any existing areas of shortages of skilled workers gets worse due to immigration restrictions over the longer term. One of the key issues longer term for the UK will be what limits are placed on skilled immigration.	3	3	9	Finance & Governance	Haydn Brown	Note: Work force issues may need to be combined to avoid duplicate risks

City Council – 10 September 2019

(Category) Risk	Mitigating activity / current response	Risk Assessment			Corporate Director	Risk owner	Further information
		Likelihood	Impact	Severity			
<p>3.2 Supply of goods and materials including medicines and food and fuel and loss of supply due to hold ups at borders. This could affect supplies of medicine and equipment for those in care settings, along with those receiving other care packages, self-funders and those not currently in contact with social care or health services. Advice from Dept of Health and Social Care is that providers (both health providers and social care establishments) should not stockpile medicines or supplies. Guidance has been re-circulated to providers. Concern that there may be some panic buying of fuel.</p> <p>HMG advice to date suggest that supply will not be affected although some stockpiling is evident. Letter received from the Department of Health and Social Care 27.03.2019 stating UK Govt have agreed to extend A50 and if Withdrawal Agreement isn't approved by the House of Commons, the legal default in UK is that UK will leave EU on 12 April. They are confident that supplies will be unaffected if 'everyone ...does what they need to do'.</p>	<p>Take further advise on the need to stockpile medication.</p> <p>Consulted key suppliers on preparedness and exposure to changes. Referred to Chamber of Commerce, Growth Hub and .GOV advice for businesses.</p> <p>City Serve confirmed on 22/2 that responses had been received from Brakes and Blakemore's providing assurances about managing their supply issues.</p>	4	4	16	Cross-Council	Various	Note: Supply issues may need to be combined to avoid duplicate risks, eg, see Adult Social Care

City Council – 10 September 2019

(Category) Risk	Mitigating activity / current response	Risk Assessment			Corporate Director	Risk owner	Further information
		Likelihood	Impact	Severity			
<p>3.3 Tariffs applied on imported goods and materials including medicines and food and fuel.</p> <p>Costs of goods, materials and equipment go up having an impact on relevant department budgets.</p> <p>Social care: where costs increase for goods, in the care of individual provider requests for uplifts, these should be dealt with as normal. Should the volume of uplift requests become abnormally large, then a review may be needed taking into account inflationary pressures post Brexit.</p> <p>Electricity and Gas: The Traded in Advance (previously locked) which includes the schools and UMS was all purchased prior to 1st April for the year. In any case the price for the current year is capped and so can't go above a certain maximum level.</p> <p>Assessment included in tenders of anticipated contract delivery impacts, both in terms of direct delivery and supply chains, with particular regard for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Workforce resilience and what steps tenderers are taking where elements of the service will be delivered by EU nationals. - The price and continual availability of goods that may be subject to import tariffs or other EU influences. 	<p>Seeking assurances from key suppliers regarding preparedness for a no-deal. In addition, working with W.Mids Heads of Procurement on joint engagement with suppliers to identify potential areas of supply that could increase in a no-deal due to application of tariffs.</p>	4	4	16	Cross-council	Various	As above re: potential duplication

City Council – 10 September 2019

(Category) Risk	Mitigating activity / current response	Risk Assessment			Corporate Director	Risk owner	Further information
		Likelihood	Impact	Severity			
3.4 Changes required to Public Contract Regulations 2015 to transfer from EU to UK legislation. This will include changes to the advertising requirements i.e. a move from publishing on OJEU to a UK e-notification system.	<p>(i) From Cabinet Office website: "The current regulations will be amended to ensure they remain operable and functional on exit. The majority of the procurement regulations and in particular the different procedures available to contracting authorities and entities, will remain exactly the same."</p> <p>(ii) InTend confirmed in writing on 1/3/19 that they are working on the new e-senders notification service and have been in contact with Cabinet Office to obtain the required details to both develop and test the new functionality within the In-tend platform to allow users access to the new service as and when it goes online.</p> <p>(iii) Next review of the thresholds will be implemented January 2020.</p> <p>(iv) BCC Standing Orders amended to replace EU procurement definitions</p>	5	2	10	Finance & Governance	Haydn Brown	
<p>4. <u>Adults, Social Care and Health</u></p> <p>4.1 Adult social care workforce: Up to 10% of nursing staff, 5% of care workers and 1% of social workers within the West Midlands are EU nationals, and therefore potentially at risk in the event of a no-deal. Although existing rights are likely to continue until December 2020, the potential loss of staff would be detrimental to social care services, and impact on service provision.</p>	<p>BCC actively re-circulated government advice and communications to social care providers encouraging them to take action to identify at-risk employees and support them through the residency application process.</p> <p>Additionally, a survey has been sent to providers asking them to identify numbers of affected staff in each role to better enable both them and BCC to plan.</p> <p>Ongoing communications and provider forums.</p>	3	2	6	Adult Social Care	Richard Doidge	Note: Consider the duplication of workforce risks

City Council – 10 September 2019

(Category) Risk	Mitigating activity / current response	Risk Assessment			Corporate Director	Risk owner	Further information
		Likelihood	Impact	Severity			
4.2 Market sustainability. Potential for increase in costs for providers, in terms of supply of food, recruitment costs and consumables. For larger providers, potential for increase in financing/ costs incurred in servicing debts.	<p>BCC has recently increased fees for providers on the Care Home, Nursing Home, Domiciliary Care, and Supported Living Frameworks.</p> <p>Ongoing communications and provider forums.</p> <p>Domiciliary Care Framework has a large number of providers (large and small) operating in each of the five Commissioning Areas. This means that there are a number of backup providers in each area in the event of provider failure.</p>	3	2	6	Adult Social Care	Richard Doidge	Note: Consider duplication re: supply cost risks
4.3 Adult social care service users, NRPF/ Vulnerable adults, childrens. There is a risk that there will be an increase in people who become ineligible for public funding and support services as a result of a no-deal Brexit. This includes benefits and housing support, potentially along with services such as alcohol and drug dependency. There is an increased risk of EU nationals losing housing support and an increase in homelessness; along with the potential for increased delays in discharge from hospital.	<p>Joint working with CCG to develop a system-wide plan to mitigate the impact of NRPF and delayed discharges.</p> <p>Staffing, carers and citizens in the Shared Lives service have been reviewed to ensure that none are likely to be affected by Brexit.</p> <p>EU citizens will retain entitlement until December 2020. Where possible, services should work with vulnerable adults to identify those and risk and assist them in accessing resources to apply for leave to remain.</p>	3	3	9	Adult Social Care	Richard Doidge	

City Council – 10 September 2019

(Category) Risk	Mitigating activity / current response	Risk Assessment			Corporate Director	Risk owner	Further information
		Likelihood	Impact	Severity			
<p>4.4 Supply chains. Risks in particular over the supply and availability of fresh fruit and vegetables. Costs may also increase. This would impact on care homes, and also pose a risk to vulnerable adults living in their own homes.</p> <p>Also risks over supply of medicines and medical supplies. Government advice is not to stockpile, as there are national contingencies around supply and transport of medicines.</p> <p>Supply of additional (non-medical) supplies, such as toilet paper, may be at greater risk. For care homes and hospitals, maintenance of equipment such as elevators may be impacted if replacement parts have to be imported from the EU.</p> <p>There may be an (unquantified) risk to fuel supplies. Impact and likelihood not known at this stage. This would have potential to impact carers driving to visit vulnerable adults and provide care and support.</p>	<p>Ongoing communication with providers, including provider forums.</p> <p>BCC catering supply contracts have been checked for supply chain viability</p> <p>Likelihood of this risk materialising is unknown. Ongoing monitoring required, including links to Trading Standards.</p> <p>Await Government advice on fuel supplies</p>	3	2	6	Adult Social Care	Richard Doidge	Note: Consider duplication of supply risks
<p>4.5 EU funding. Existing projects where funding has been agreed will continue to be supported until end of agreed period. However, at present there is no replacement funding announced by the UK Government. If no replacement funding is set up, then EU funded services will need to be reviewed and either alternative funding sought, re-commissioned on a reduced basis, or decommissioned.</p> <p>(Note: See separate section on EU Funding).</p>	<p>Await Government plans for replacement funding streams. ADASS lobbying on behalf of local authorities.</p>	4	2	8	Adult Social Care	Richard Doidge	Note: Potential duplication with EU funding section

City Council – 10 September 2019

(Category) Risk	Mitigating activity / current response	Risk Assessment			Corporate Director	Risk owner	Further information
		Likelihood	Impact	Severity			
5. <u>European Funding</u> (currently over £100 million in BCC)							
5.1 Loss of Resources Loss of vital resources for skills, Employment, Business support, Sustainable development and key projects This could potentially affect the long-term funding of some projects and key council services; this could include some run in the third sector/ community that may not be directly contracted with BCC.	Continue to liaise with Government based on latest guarantees provided. Note: HMG have provided a funding guarantee for currently funded programmes. Existing agreed EU funding will continue for the agreed duration of current contracts. However, it may become an issue when these part-funded schemes are up for re-commissioning. Consider alternative funding/ reduction of service/ de-commissioning options for end of contract terms.	4	5	20	Inclusive Growth	Lloyd Broad	
5.2 Lack of Clarity on Replacement Funding (UKSPF)	Work with LGA and Core Cities to continue to lobby Government on this.	4	5	20	Inclusive Growth	Lloyd Broad	
5.3 Lack of Clarity re: ongoing access to transnational funds e.g. Horizon, ETC etc,	Work with LGA and Core Cities to continue to lobby Government on this.	4	4	16	Inclusive Growth	Lloyd Broad	
6. <u>ICT, Digital and Customer Services</u> 6.1 IT – Concern about exchange rate fluctuation and purchasing of equipment/IT services from US and impact upon the dollar.	Further work to identify and review the level of risk and the potential impact. Based upon the level of risk, guidance to be taken on future approaches which could include brining forward purchases, agreeing a fixed exchange rate or looking for an alternative provision	3	2	6	Digital & Customer Services	Steve Halliday Simon Field	

City Council – 10 September 2019

(Category) Risk	Mitigating activity / current response	Risk Assessment			Corporate Director	Risk owner	Further information
		Likelihood	Impact	Severity			
6.2 No current change in legislation communicated regarding Housing Benefit Entitlement . This will have to be passed through legislation and there has been no preparatory work communicated to LA's, via POG or other channels as yet.	Members of and attendance at national DWP forums to receive updates as soon as possible	2	2	4	Digital & Customer Services	David Kinnair Simon Field	
6.3 Potential for increase in claims for benefits if increases in un-employment.	Further modelling of the potential impacts of this to be developed to inform a more likely risk assessment	2	4	8	Digital & Customer Services	TBC	Further work is needed - is this financial modelling happening at the regional level?
6.4 As result of Brexit possible election and potential for increase call volumes to the council and the need to support these – could possibly require 10 further staff short term but this under review.	Discussions to take place as part of election readiness work Contingency plans to be reviewed within the contact centre. <i>Potentially may be reduced levels of</i>	3	1	3	Digital & Customer Services	Wendy Griffiths Simon Field	
6.5 Overall concern about future recruitment especially around some staff at GR2 and GR3 and impacts on the call centre.	Wider workforce strategy to be developed with HR Further analysis on the level of potential impact to be considered	2	2	4	Digital & Customer Services	Wendy Griffiths	
6.6 Potential for up to x% increase in cost for Council Tax Support and Potential for up to x% drop in income from Council Tax collection.	Further financial modelling to take place based upon different potential scenarios Each new claim for Council Tax Support, on average, costs the Council £1,000 per annum through the loss of council tax income. Additional claims will put pressure on administration and costs.	2	4	8	Digital & Customer Services	Tim Savill/ Finance	Further work is needed - is this financial modelling happening at the regional level?
6.7 Potential decrease in income from - Business Rates	Further financial modelling to take place based upon different potential scenarios For every 1% of business rates loss, the councils business rates income could reduce by up to £4.8 million	2	4	8	Digital & Customer Services	Tim Savill / Finance	Further work is needed - is this financial modelling happening at the regional level?

City Council – 10 September 2019

(Category) Risk	Mitigating activity / current response	Risk Assessment			Corporate Director	Risk owner	Further information
		Likelihood	Impact	Severity			
7. <u>Data, including GDPR</u> 7.1 A no-deal scenario would result in the UK's data compliance been deemed 'inadequate'. Consequently, there would be increasing difficulty with data transfer with the EU e.g. DBS checks. Adequacy decision - An "adequacy decision" is a decision adopted by the European Commission which establishes that a third country (i.e. a country not bound by the GDPR) ensures an adequate level of protection of personal data. Such a decision is based on the country's domestic law, its supervisory authorities, and international commitments it has entered into. Implications for key services including education.	ICO Guidance: The ICO checklist sets out six steps to take to start preparing for data protection compliance if the UK leaves the EU without a deal. Key points: Continue to comply: Continue to implement GDPR compliance standards and follow current ICO guidance. The Data Protection Act 2018 will remain in place. The government intends to bring the GDPR directly into UK law on exit, to sit alongside it.	5	1	5	Digital & Customer Services	Malkiat Thiarai	
7.2 The European Data Protection Board issued a note in March in relation to the adequacy issue ahead of the earlier Brexit deadline, this will continue to apply at 31st October. It states, in the absence of an agreement between the EEA and the UK, the UK will become a third country. This means that the transfer of personal data to the UK has to be based on one of the following instruments • Standard or ad hoc Data Protection Clauses • Binding Corporate Rules • Codes of Conduct and Certification Mechanisms • Derogations	Transfers from the UK to the EU: The UK government has stated that, when the UK exits the EU, transfers to the EEA from the UK will not be restricted. There will be transitional provision for a UK adequacy decision to cover these transfers. This means we will able to continue to send personal data from the UK to the EEA without any additional requirements. Transfers to the UK: Review data flows and identify where you receive data from the EEA, including from suppliers and processors. Consider the GDPR safeguards that can put in place to ensure that data can continue to flow once we are outside the EU.	5	2	10	Digital & Customer Services	Malkiat Thiarai	

City Council – 10 September 2019

(Category) Risk	Mitigating activity / current response	Risk Assessment			Corporate Director	Risk owner	Further information
		Likelihood	Impact	Severity			
8. <u>Legal, Legislative and Regulation</u> 8.1 The Council will be monitoring any changes in law resulting from Brexit. Whilst it is anticipated that the large majority of legislation will remain in force through the EU withdrawal Act in 2018 the following areas of law will require monitoring and potential business planning. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Commercial law - State Aid - Contract Law - Company Law - Public Procurement - Education Law - Environment Law - Regulatory Services - Civil Litigation - Employment Law - Data Protection (Privacy and Information Law) 	<p>Continue to monitor and update accordingly. Further briefing note available. As new individual risks are identified they will be populated into the specific service area's risk register.</p> <p>It is difficult to predict the legislative changes particularly when even external professional legal advice and analysis do not, necessarily, agree with advice emanating from government departments.</p>	Not relevant (see previous column)	N/A	N/A	Finance & Governance	Connie Price	
9. <u>EU Settlement</u> 9.1 BCC registration responsibilities for vulnerable and looked after citizens including children to provide access to the EU Settled Status. The EU settlement scheme and rights of EU citizens to reside and receive services is an issue. We do not know how many people this may affect (it isn't recorded on council systems; nor in any other LA area). Currently there is a lack of information from government on this issue, including on what LA responsibilities will be.	<p>Agreed workshops and roundtable meetings with Home Office and key staff and stakeholders</p>	4	4	16	Cross-Council	Various	Including Children's and Adults

City Council – 10 September 2019

(Category) Risk	Mitigating activity / current response	Risk Assessment			Corporate Director	Risk owner	Further information
		Likelihood	Impact	Severity			
9.2 An additional concern is if there is repatriation of UK citizens from the EU . This could affect social care, housing and health. We have no way of knowing the extent of the issue. No clear advice from Department of Health and Social Care on this issue. It is not clear if duty will fall on local authorities and if so how affected citizens would be identified and supported. May require extra funding and resources. Question has been raised with ADASS and DOHSC -awaiting response. Additional social work resource for NRPF has been applied for.		3	5	15	Cross-Council	Various	
9.3 There is also an issue over those with no recourse to public funds; including homelessness, housing, drugs services and other public health services. Withdrawal of services to people who become ineligible may result in increased problems and severity and have knock -on effects to other services and to community cohesion. Need to review contingency plans for homelessness, drug and alcohol services esp. those with no recourse to public funds.		3	5	15	Cross-Council	Various	
9.4 Commissioning have re-circulated government advice and communications to all providers on the social care framework encouraging providers to take action to identify at-risk employees and support them through the residency application process. Additionally, a survey has been sent to providers asking them to identify numbers of affected staff in each role to better enable both them and BCC to plan.		3	2	6	Adult Social Care	Richard Doidge	

City Council – 10 September 2019

(Category) Risk	Mitigating activity / current response	Risk Assessment			Corporate Director	Risk owner	Further information
		Likelihood	Impact	Severity			
10.5 Lack of provision of support including IT / Registration access for EU citizens.	Pop-up events being arranged with Home Office in local community settings	1	5	5	Cross-Council	Various	
10.6 Libraries will not be sufficiently prepared for an increase in demand for immigration advice. LOB is in talks with a local law firm with the intention of offering free drop in immigration advice session to the public. Libraries potential for promoting social cohesion has been recognised by government. The Libraries of Sanctuary project is gaining momentum.	Libraries are leading on this and have now had funding confirmed by the City of Sanctuary Movement. Further funding via CILIP, LC, Ace and the Mi-friendly Cities project is expected to follow.	1	5	5	Education and Skills	Dawn Beaumont	
10. Work Force 10.1 Internally HR records do not capture EU nationals specifically only 'non-UK'. Further analysis however has indicated that approximately just over 1% of the BCC workforce are EU nationals (approximately 135).	Working with management to identify EU nationals and determine if any services are at risk of disruption.	4	5	20	Human Resources	Tim Normanton	Note: need to consider potential duplication of workforce risks (internal/external)
10.2 In terms of the new immigration system, under current proposals, there is concern over the recruitment and retention of staff in key sectors and their supply chains and in particular education and adult social care.	Until final proposals for extension of the points-based immigration system are confirmed, it is impossible to quantify impact; however, small proportion of BCC workers from EU suggests minimal disruption.	N/A	N/A	N/A	Human Resources	Tim Normanton	
10.3 Workforce areas expected to be impacted include, but are not limited to: adult social care, education and construction (26% of UK construction workforce is from the EU). This is of concern in view of our high-profile projects in Birmingham relying upon this e.g. CW games and HS2. Also, the Health, Adult Social Care and Education sectors remain vulnerable to workforce implications.		4	5	20	Cross Council	Various	

City Council – 10 September 2019

(Category) Risk	Mitigating activity / current response	Risk Assessment			Corporate Director	Risk owner	Further information
		Likelihood	Impact	Severity			
10.4 Social care provider market, government advice has been recirculated to all providers. Additionally, providers have been sent a survey by Commissioning, asking them to identify number of staff and job roles potentially affected, to aid providers and also to feed into BCC contingency planning		4	2	8	Adult Social Care	Richard Doidge	Note: potential duplication of workforce risks
11. <u>Waste</u> 11.1 There is not expected to be any high-level risk regarding provision of waste services	Veolia have pre-ordered parts for the plant to mitigate any problems. All our waste is processed in the UK, so no effect from Brexit discussions	2	2	4	Neighbourhoods	Darren Share	
12. <u>Cityserve</u> 12.1 Cityserve procure £10m food annually with 2 main suppliers. All suppliers continue to monitor the situation and are implementing strategies to mitigate any risk associated with Brexit. Cityserve will implement alternative menu options depending on supply line impacted with a view to maintaining the appropriate prescribed minimum standards as far as possible.	Suppliers have Brexit working groups and are undertaking their own supply chain risk assessment.	2	3	6			
13. <u>Wider Economy</u> 13.1 Impact on business preparedness and confidence.	Brexit toolkit available from Chamber of Commerce.	4	4	16	Inclusive Growth	Ian McLeod/ Richard Cowell	
13.2 Increase in unemployment due to slow down in investment etc.	Monitored by Mayors Economic Contingency Group.	4	4	16	Inclusive Growth	Ian McLeod/ Richard Cowell	

City Council – 10 September 2019

(Category) Risk	Mitigating activity / current response	Risk Assessment			Corporate Director	Risk owner	Further information
		Likelihood	Impact	Severity			
13.3 Supply chain issues, particularly just in time requirements.	Industry stakeholders engaged with Mayors Economic Contingency Group	4	5	20	Inclusive Growth	Ian McLeod/ Richard Cowell	
13.4 Product and material access leading to delays in delivery of infrastructure ad major projects and initiatives (e.g. HS2, Peddimore, Paradise, Clean Air Zone etc.)	To be determined.	4	4	16	Inclusive Growth	Ian McLeod/ Richard Cowell	
13.5 Products and materials costs increase	Monitored by Mayors Economic Contingency Group.	4	5	20	Inclusive Growth	Ian McLeod/ Richard Cowell	
13.6 Workforce issues e.g. construction. Access to key skills and fluctuations in workforce due to shifts of workers moving into different roles/sectors.	Monitored by Mayors Economic Contingency Group.	4	5	20	Inclusive Growth	Ian McLeod/ Richard Cowell	
14. <u>Communications</u>		2	2	4			
14.1 Government are accelerating their Brexit information campaign, of particular importance is the need to disseminate information about the EU Settlement Scheme.	BCC Comms Team are now liaising with WMCA Comms Team on a shared programme and shared investment in this.				Partnerships, Prevention and Insight	Eleri Roberts	
14.2 The 'Get Ready for Brexit' public information campaign was launched on 1 September		1	1	1	Partnerships, Prevention and Insight	Eleri Roberts	

City Council – 10 September 2019

(Category) Risk	Mitigating activity / current response	Risk Assessment			Corporate Director	Risk owner	Further information
		Likelihood	Impact	Severity			
15. <u>Local Resilience Forum</u> 15.1 Need to continue to monitor Government advice with regards to supply of medicines and fresh food (three quarters of all medicines come via Channel Straits).	LRF's holding weekly teleconferences with HMG. Following normal business continuity plans.	3	5	15	Partnerships, Prevention and Insight	Michael Enderby	Note, also picked up in other risks.
15.2 Potential for community unrest and possible protests.	Following normal business continuity plans.	3	5	15	Partnerships, Prevention and Insight	Michael Enderby	

Key to risk assessment rating:

Opening probability (likelihood) is how likely is it that situation will transpire, traditionally we do, 5 is guaranteed, 1 is very unlikely. Opening impact is 'if this thing were to happen, how bad would it actually be', with 5 being

'end of the world' and 1 being 'not so bad'. You then multiply these two to get the final score for severity. Thus it should be out of 25.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR EDUCATION,
SKILLS AND CULTURE FROM COUNCILLOR BOB BEAUCHAMP**

C1 Library Repairs

Question:

For the last 3 years, please provide a list of all repairs carried out on each of the council's libraries, including dates and nature of the work.

Answer:

It has not been possible to provide the detail requested in the timescale as to do so will involve a considerable amount of officer time across a number of teams, including private contractors. There are a variety of repairs undertaken, which include capital works (planned and reactive) and smaller works.

The key areas of expenditure are: statutory testing and repairs, heating (particularly boiler repairs), electrical works, fire equipment, alarms and shutters works, archive stores, air handling units, roof repairs and asbestos testing and works. Over the last 3 years at over 35 community library sites there have been over 10,000 individual items of expenditure and thousands more at the Library of Birmingham. We are happy to provide specific details of repairs and maintenance at individual libraries as requested.

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR EDUCATION, SKILLS AND CULTURE FROM COUNCILLOR MORRIAM JAN

C2 Schools - Government New Minimum Funding Proposals

Question:

How many schools in Birmingham are expected to benefit from the government's new minimum funding proposals?

Answer:

The National Funding Formula only relates to Primary and Secondary schools/academies.

Assuming no change to individual school pupil numbers and pupil characteristics used in the 2019/20 funding allocations. We have calculated that 80 Primary schools/academies and 14 Secondary schools/academies would benefit from the proposal to increase the minimum funding per pupil to £4,000 in Primary and to £5,000 in Secondary.

NB This proposal will affect Secondary schools from 2020/21 and Primary schools from 2021/22.

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR EDUCATION, SKILLS AND CULTURE FROM COUNCILLOR MORRIAM JAN

C3 Schools - Government New Minimum Funding Proposals

Question:

How many schools in Birmingham are expected to benefit from the government's new minimum funding proposals?

Answer:

The National Funding Formula only relates to Primary and Secondary schools/academies.

Assuming no change to individual school pupil numbers and pupil characteristics used in the 2019/20 funding allocations. We have calculated that 80 Primary schools/academies and 14 Secondary schools/academies would benefit from the proposal to increase the minimum funding per pupil to £4,000 in Primary and to £5,000 in Secondary.

NB This proposal will affect Secondary schools from 2020/21 and Primary schools from 2021/22.

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR EDUCATION, SKILLS AND CULTURE FROM COUNCILLOR NEIL EUSTACE

C4 Schools - New Minimum Funding Levels - reverse aspects pupil premium

Question:

To what extent do the new Minimum funding levels reverse the redistributive aspects of the pupil premium?

Answer:

The proposed National Funding Formula increases in minimum funding per pupil level will ensure that all primary pupils and secondary pupils will receive a minimum of £4,000 and £5,000 respectively regardless of other factors in the formula i.e. deprivation.

The Pupil Premium grant is a separate funding stream and the distribution is based on deprivation. As a consequence, the minimum funding per pupil changes may result in a redistribution of overall schools funding.

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR FINANCE AND RESOURCES FROM COUNCILLOR MAUREEN CORNISH

D Advertising Sites

Question:

Please provide a list of all Council owned advertising sites, including the rental value of each one, whether it is currently rented out and if not how long since it was last rented out?

Answer

The financial information related to this briefing is highly commercially sensitive. The publication of specific income or sharing details with competitors would impact on the Council's ability to procure on the open market and disadvantage the current contractors

The Council has several contractual arrangements for generating income from advertising on Council Land which have been procured competitively. All developments have planning consent and income goes directly to support council services.

1. Digital Advertising Portfolio – This is a profit share partnership contract with Ocean Outdoor. The portfolio is as follows:

A45 Road Bridge Banner
Bullring Moat Lane Banner
Fiveways/Broadstreet Digital 96
Dartmouth Circus Digital 96
Hyatt Bridge Digital Full motion
Bullring Smallbrook Queensway Digital Full Motion
Brunel Street Carpark Digital Full Motion
St Chads Digital 48
Broad Street Digital 96
Bristol Street Digital Full Motion
Paradise Circus Banner (out of commission because of roadworks)
20 City centre "loop" digital pavement advertising
Lancaster Towers Digital currently under development
120 Digital pavement advertising currently under development – separate spreadsheet attached

2. Roundabout and Boundary sign advertising for local businesses – This is a profit share partnership with Immediate Solutions.

City Council – 10 September 2019

3. Lamp post banner advertising for local businesses and the visitor economy. Banners are displayed for short periods of time as appropriate and according to individual campaign requirements. This is a profit share partnership with Bay Media.
4. City Dressing – this is sold and managed in house. The asset portfolio of flags and banners is used to dress the city for Birmingham events and sold commercially to the visitor economy when not required by the council
5. Hoarding and Digital Sites managed by Birmingham Property Services.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR HOMES AND
NEIGHBOURHOODS FROM COUNCILLOR SIMON MORRALL**

E1 InReach Embankment Development

Question:

**How many plants or other green infrastructure were installed on the
Embankment Development on St Vincent Street?**

Answer:

Ref	Species	No.
TREES	Betula Perdula	5
	Acer saccharinum	1
	Betula Utilis	2
	Sorbus Torminalis	3
	Amelanchier Lamarckii	4
	Sorbus Aria	3
	Liquidambar Styraciflua	2
	Total	20
HEDGE	Fagus sylvatica	656
	Ilex aquifolium	328
	Buxus sempervirens	84
	Ligustrum undulatum lemon & lime	294
Total		1,362
Specimen Shrub	Magnolia stellata	4
Total		4
SHRUBS	Acuba japonica	10
	Choisya ternata	12
	Cornus alba	10
	Euonymus fortunei	62
	Fatshedera lizei	12
	festuca ovina	18
	Hebe pingufolia	12
	Lavandula angustifolia	42
	Miscanthus sinensis	6
	Prunus laurocerasus	14
	Skimmia japonica	8
	Viburnum davidii	26
	Vinca major	62
	Total	294
BULBS	various	600
Total		600
GRAND TOTAL		2,280

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR HOMES AND
NEIGHBOURHOODS FROM COUNCILLOR PETER FOWLER**

E2 InReach Embankment Development – Trees

Question:

**What was the net loss\gain in trees on the site of the Embankment
Development on St Vincent Street?**

Answer:

3 existing trees lost, with 20 added, giving a net gain of **17 trees**.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR HOMES AND
NEIGHBOURHOODS FROM COUNCILLOR EDDIE FREEMAN**

E3 InReach Embankment Development – Trees

Question:

What nature enhancement\protection measures were installed on the Embankment development on St Vincent Street? (e.g. bird boxes, brown roofs)?

Answer:

- Parking management strategy – allocation for small cars, electric charging points. Approximately 60% parking allocation for total number apartments, contributing towards air quality and traffic reduction in city centre.
- Residential travel plan – to actively promote the use of more sustainable transport choices for residents. Encourage the use of modes of travel other than cars. Policy TP39 – 41 reducing dependency on cars contributing towards better air quality. Allocation of bicycle and motorcycle storage spaces.
- Refuse storage facilities – three types of waste collection options. Blue bins (paper and cardboard), green bins (plastic metal and glass), black bins for general waste. Policy TP13 – working towards Sustainable Management of the City's waste
- Sustainable drainage solution to manage risk of flooding, improve and protect water quality, improve habitat and amenity
- 8 large trees retained, and 20 new trees planted. Planted over 1000 hedging plants and 300 shrubs in the communal areas of the development. (Policy TP7) supporting the expansion of trees for many purposes including carbon uptake, ecological and biodiversity enhancement and sustainable drainage.

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR STREET SCENE AND PARKS FROM COUNCILLOR PAUL TILSLEY

F1 How many Ombudsman Complaints-Waste Collection - upheld

Question:

Could the Cabinet Member set out how many ombudsman complaints about waste collection have been upheld so far this year, at what cost, setting out the actions taken to prevent further errors?

Answer:

Since January 2019, the Local Government and Social Care Ombudsman has upheld 23 complaints against the Council and the cost has been £4906. Actions will vary depending on the nature of the complaint.

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR STREET SCENE AND PARKS FROM COUNCILLOR JON HUNT

F2 Review Waste Service - How many members to contribute

Question:

On July 3rd you promised to let me know how members could contribute to the review into the waste service. At the time of tabling this question, I am still waiting. Can the cabinet member respond?

Answer:

Wood Environmental and Infrastructure Solutions have started their review by going through all of the Services data and practices. Throughout September they will be undertaking face to face sessions with Scrutiny members and residents so invites will be sent out shortly.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR STREET SCENE AND
PARKS FROM COUNCILLOR ZAKER CHOUDHRY**

F3 Verge Cutters slicing up abandoned litter

Question:

What steps have been taken to prevent verge cutters slicing up abandoned litter?

Answer:

Now that grounds maintenance is an in house operation it has provided the opportunity to better align the programmes for litter collection and grass cutting on the highways and to ensure the verges are mown as soon as possible after the cleansing operation.

Mowing operatives have been asked to clear any litter before cutting any verges. We will continue to monitor the situation and ensure the quality of service improves.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR STREET SCENE
AND PARKS FROM COUNCILLOR ADAM HIGGS**

F4 Recycling Contamination

Question:

For each week since 1 April, how many loads of recycling were rejected due to contamination?

Answer:

Under our current contracts and processes it is unusual for a whole load to be rejected and as such this hasn't happened this financial year. The material is normally sorted and processed as governed by the material stream's route. Contamination is normally rejected during/at the end of the process; this is managed and recorded accordingly.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR STREET SCENE
AND PARKS FROM COUNCILLOR GARY SAMBROOK**

F5 Rounds missed

Question:

**For each month in the last 5 years, how many whole rounds have been missed
(broken down by residual, recycling, green)?**

Answer:

Missed collection data is currently held by residents individual property or whole road reports and not on a whole round basis.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR STREET SCENE
AND PARKS FROM COUNCILLOR PETER FOWLER**

F6 Properties Per Round

Question:

What is the average number of properties per round for each of the last 5 years? (broken down by residual, recycling, green)

Answer:

	Residual	Recycling	Garden
2015	-	-	482
2016	-	-	655
2017	-	-	654
2018	1251	1015	547
2019	779	750	581

As background, between 2015 and August 2018 rounds were designed to be completed within 9hr and 13 mins. Following changes in work patterns in September 2018 this reduced to 7hr 18 mins and is reflected in the 2019 values.

Due to the size of the data files when incremental amendments are made to rounds the previous data set is overwritten and as a result we are unable to provide an average value for each of the 5 years as requested. However the 2018 figures for residual and recycling were taken at the beginning of the year and are likely to be very similar to previous years since the introduction of wheelie bins in 2015, which is when the last wholesale redesign of routes took place.

For garden rounds, as sales occur over a number of months and as a result round sizes can change on a weekly basis. The average values above have therefore been calculated from the final count when sales have closed for each year.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR STREET SCENE
AND PARKS FROM COUNCILLOR SIMON MORRALL**

F7 WRCO Interventions

Question:

In July and August 2019 how many ‘interventions’ have been made by WRCOs to encourage recycling (broken down by whether direct face to face or via leaflet\nnotice drop)?

Answer:

Find below the amount of direct resident engagement interventions made by the Waste Reduction and Collection Officers per month, broken down by type.

Month / Year	Total Direct Resident Engagement Interventions	Face to Face Contact		Leaflet Left	
		No	Yes	No	Yes
July 19	91	88	3	7	84
Aug 19	51	51	0	3	48

Please note that recycling “intervention” does not represent the full duties carried out by WRCOs.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR STREET SCENE
AND PARKS FROM COUNCILLOR DAVID BARRIE**

F8 WRCOs

Question:

As of the first day of each month since the role was introduced, how many WRCOs were employed by the City Council?

Answer:

Month	No. WRCOs
Nov 2017	104.00
Dec 2017	105.00
Jan 2018	103.00
Feb 2018	103.00
March 2018	103.00
April 2018	101.00
May 2018	100.00
June 2018	99.00
July 2018	99.00
Aug 2018	99.00
Sept 2018	175.00
Oct 2018	175.00
Nov 2018	177.00
Dec 2018	184.00
Jan 2019	183.00
Feb 2019	184.00
March 2019	184.00
April 2019	183.00
May 2019	183.00
June 2019	183.00
July 2019	183.00
Aug 2019	183.00
Sept 2019	183.00

Information taken from People Solutions.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR STREET SCENE
AND PARKS FROM COUNCILLOR BOB BEAUCHAMP**

F9 Missed Collections

Question:

What is the cost to the Council of each reported missed collection?

Answer:

The answer varies depending on if we collect the whole road or a single bin. By moving existing resources around missed whole road collections can be achieved at no extra cost.

Individual bin collections would incur an additional cost which again would depend on travel, deviation and resources we do not hold a cost for individual missed bin collections.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR STREET SCENE AND
PARKS FROM COUNCILLOR NEIL EUSTACE**

F10 Waste Management Timetable for Independent Review

Question:

Could the cabinet member set out the timetable for the independent review into waste management reporting its findings?

Answer:

Wood Environmental and Infrastructure Solutions have started their review by going through all of the Services data and practices. Throughout September they will be undertaking face to face sessions with Scrutiny members and residents

In October they will draw their initial findings together and it is intended to bring these to October Cabinet.

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR TRANSPORT AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR BABER BAZ

G1 Amirah Foundation

Question:

When he wrote references for the Amirah Foundation was he aware of the underlying problems that led to the organisation's subsequent failure?

Answer:

No

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR TRANSPORT AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR JON HUNT

G2 Counterflow Traffic

Question:

Recent closures on the A34 between Newtown and Perry Barr have highlighted the volume of counterflow traffic at peak times ie outbound in the morning and inbound at night. Could the cabinet member set out the findings of the modelling on counterflow traffic were the A34 Transport scheme to be implemented, explaining what assumptions have been incorporated about the timings of the proposed new traffic lights linking the A34 and A435?

Answer:

The modelling undertaken for the A34 transport scheme is based upon observed traffic flows, which capture all vehicle movements including those in a counterflow direction. Traffic signal timings at the new A34/A435 junction are based upon future year iterations of the model that take account of new development, modal shift and route reassignment.

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR TRANSPORT AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR MORRIAM JAN

G3 How many representations - A34 Transport Project

Question:

How many representations of all kinds, including signatures on petitions, were received about the A34 Transport project, ie the Perry Barr flyover removal and associated works, up to the end of the consultation period in August?

Answer:

During the consultation period the Council received 1,577 responses to the consultation via the online BeHeard portal. Outside of the portal 13 bespoke written responses were received from key stakeholders including Transport for West Midlands, adjoining local authorities and elected members.

The Council has received a total of 14,695 signatures on petitions relating to the removal of the A34 flyover and Sprint, with 11,192 signatures received between the Options Appraisal Report (12th February 2019) and the end of the consultation period (2nd August 2019).

Birmingham City Council

City Council

5 November 2019



Subject: Appointments by the Council

Does the report contain confidential or exempt information? ☐ Yes ☒ No

If relevant, state which appendix is exempt, and provide exempt information paragraph number or reason if confidential :

RECOMMENDED:-

That the appointments be made to serve on the Committees and other bodies set out below:-

Council Business Management Committee

The Chair of the Coordinating Overview and Scrutiny Committee, Councillor Carl Rice be appointed on to the Committee for the period ending with the Annual Meeting of City Council in May 2020.

Standards Committees

The following are appointed as Lay Members

Stephen Atkinson	6 November 2019 – 31 October 2023
Alastair Cowan	6 November 2019 – 31 October 2023
Mohammed Khan	6 November 2019 – 31 October 2023

Safety Advisory Groups

To make appointments as follows for the period ending with the Annual Meeting of City Council in May 2020:

Aston Villa Football Club Safety Advisory Group

Councillor	(Lab)
Councillor	(Con)
Councillor	(Lib Dem)

Councillor (One Aston Ward Member)

Birmingham City Football Club Safety Advisory Group

Councillor (Lab)

Councillor (Con)

Councillor (Lib Dem)

Councillor Yvonne Mosquito (Bordesley and Highgate Ward Member)

Warwickshire County Cricket Club Safety Advisory Group

Councillor (Lab)

Councillor (Con)

Councillor (Lib Dem)

Councillor (One Edgbaston Ward Member)



Tackling Period Poverty and Raising Period Awareness



Photograph provided by Cysters

A report from Overview & Scrutiny





Contents

Preface	3
Summary of Recommendations	4
1 Background	6
1.1 Definition	6
1.2 Impact and prevalence	6
1.3 Affordability	7
1.4 Stigma	7
1.5 Birmingham context	8
2 National interventions	8
2.1 Education and tackling stigma	8
2.2 Providing access to free sanitary products – Schools	9
2.3 Providing access to free sanitary products – NHS	10
2.4 Providing access to free sanitary products – Women in custody	10
2.5 Period Poverty Taskforce	10
3 Examples of initiatives happening elsewhere	11
3.1 Other Local Authorities	11
3.2 Football Clubs	12
4 Local interventions in Birmingham	12
4.1 Addressing women and girls living in poverty	12
4.2 Providing targeted access to free sanitary products	12
4.3 Education and Awareness of Menstruation	14
4.4 Cultural and social attitudes towards menstruation	15
4.5 Environmental issues	15
5 What can Birmingham City Council do?	16
5.1 Education – Work closely with schools and teachers	16
5.2 Working with communities on cultural attitudes to menstruation	16
5.3 Co-ordination with and support for third sector	16
6 Conclusion	17

Further information regarding this report can be obtained from:

Lead Review Officer: Rose Kiely

Contact details: e-mail: @birmingham.gov.uk

Reports that have been submitted to Council can be downloaded from www.birmingham.gov.uk/scrutiny.



Preface

By Councillor Rob Pocock



When the City Council meeting of 4th December 2018 approved a resolution asking Scrutiny to investigate the issue of period poverty in Birmingham, there were still many, myself amongst them, who were largely unaware of the scale and significance of this issue.

In the year that has passed since then, this issue has undoubtedly moved from the margin to the mainstream. It is a shocking fact that despite being one of the richest economies in the world, this report has exposed the scandal that an estimated 32,000 women and young girls in our City are finding it hard to afford to buy period products.

I would like to thank Councillors Kerry Jenkins and Nicky Brennan for bringing forward that resolution. They have made sure we have now all woken up to the issue in this City and at last steps are being taken to tackle it.

We now have the Red Box project, supported by business suppliers of period products, operating actively across significant parts of Birmingham. Unions have added support. Sports clubs are now picking up the issue and making free period products available. Government has weighed in with a welcome level of support through the Period Poverty Taskforce to start addressing period poverty in schools and beyond.

However, a lot remains to be done. While schemes to support women rough sleepers are coming in, we are recommending that these are extended to the much larger pool of women who are at risk of homelessness. Women workers in low pay industries need support in the workplace. This council can do more to ensure the contractors it commissions make explicit provision to support women experiencing period poverty, and we need to ensure our own workforce and that of our partners, get this help too.

Our inquiry has been impressed by the work of local community support agencies such as Our Cysters who gave us an eye-opening package of evidence about period poverty within the minority ethnic communities in the City.

Their evidence also extended our concerns to the existence of a further problem in the stigma that can be attached to the menstrual cycle itself. This can be a no-go subject for some cultures within our City. We were therefore impressed by the bold pledge put to us by Girlguiding Birmingham, the period pledge – “I pledge to tackle period stigma by talking about periods, so that no one feels embarrassed talking about them”. Our committee had no hesitation in stating our own commitment to abide by this pledge, and we would urge members across the City to openly adopt it too.

Responding to this wider concern to promote greater levels of openness about the natural place of menstruation as part of everyday life within all societies, we have expanded the title of our report from ‘period poverty’ towards the wider goal of “tackling period poverty and period awareness”.

Finally, I would like to thank all contributors to this inquiry, and I hope this report and its recommendations will go some way towards improving the quality of life for women and girls of all communities throughout this City.



Summary of Recommendations

	Recommendation	Responsibility	Completion Date
R01	That a plan be developed, aimed at supporting schools and teachers in educating and informing students about period poverty and period awareness. This plan should, in particular, deal with stigma and provide information about the range of products, including reusable products available and their use and disposal.	Cabinet Member for Education, Skills & Culture	September 2020
R02	That the City Council should: (1) declare its support for the pledge promoted by Girlguiding Birmingham to prevent stigma around periods; and (2) initiate a programme to tackle stigma around periods in the workplace centred on the City Council workforce and that ways of developing a wider programme for partner organisations and Small and Medium Enterprises, with special reference to sectors employing significant numbers of female employees in low pay sectors, be pursued.	Cabinet Member for Health & Social Care	September 2020
R03	That the feasibility of commissioning a research programme aimed at establishing the nature and extent of period poverty in Birmingham be explored. A further focus of this review should be on the impact of cultural attitudes and ways of widening 'period awareness' within a super-diverse city.	Cabinet Member for Health & Social Care	September 2020
R04	That ways of establishing a more collaborative approach to providing co-ordination and support to third sector organisations working to alleviate period poverty across the city be developed, with particular reference to accessing marginalised communities. This should include examining whether: (1) a programme to provide free period products to the full spectrum of homeless people and those in temporary or supported accommodation can be developed through the relevant support agencies; and	Cabinet Member for Social Inclusion, Community Safety & Equalities Cabinet Member for Homes and Neighbourhoods	September 2020



	(2) a central location in Birmingham for the storage of donated products by third sector organisations can be provided.		
R05	That where a service is commissioned by the City Council the possibility of including a clause about alleviating period poverty and raising period awareness be considered for inclusion in future contracts wherever appropriate.	Cabinet Member for Finance and Resources	September 2020
R06	That an assessment of progress against the recommendations in this report be presented to the Health & Social Care Overview & Scrutiny Committee.	Cabinet Member for Health & Social Care	November 2020



1 Background

1.1 Definition

- 1.1.1 Period poverty is a complex issue with a variety of causes including uninformed attitudes and stigma around menstruation. The evidence presented to the committee by Birmingham Public Health highlighted that:

Period poverty is a harsh reflection of poverty and inequality.

- 1.1.2 'Period poverty', or menstrual hygiene management (MHM), refers to having a lack of access to sanitary products due to financial constraints. The World Health Organisation has defined MHM as:
- Women and adolescent girls being able to use clean materials to absorb or collect menstrual blood and change them in privacy as often as necessary throughout their menstrual period.
 - Being able to use soap and water for washing the body as required and having access to safe and convenient facilities to dispose of used menstrual management materials.
 - Women and girls having access to basic information about the menstrual cycle, and how to manage it with dignity without discomfort or fear.

1.2 Impact and prevalence

- 1.2.1 One impact of period poverty is around the increased risk of infections. Not using sanitary products can lead to an increased risk of infections like bacterial vaginosis. There is very limited research available but there is some evidence to suggest that there is a degree of stigma attached and that this could have an impact on access to and participation in education and social activities. The most representative research carried out by Plan International in 2017 suggested that about 1 in 10 girls and women have at some point been unable to afford sanitary wear. There was also a survey undertaken by YouGov for the Greater London Assemblies in 2018 which suggested that 17% of 16-24 year old women struggled to afford sanitary products at some point in their lives.
- 1.2.2 Members were told by Birmingham Public Health about some more recent evidence from the Department for Education in their 5th Wave Omnibus Survey of pupils and their parents which suggests that 6% of secondary school children have been unable to access sanitary hygiene products within the last 12 months. However, it was noted that the sample was incentivised towards those with free school meals, so the survey is not necessarily representative of the wider population.



1.3 Affordability

1.3.1 The only current UK-wide quantitative estimate of the extent of period poverty in the UK comes from the girls' rights charity Plan International UK:¹

- One in ten girls (10%) have been unable to afford sanitary wear.
- One in seven girls (15%) have struggled to afford sanitary wear.
- One in seven girls (14%) have asked to borrow sanitary wear from a friend due to affordability issues.
- More than one in ten girls (12%) have had to improvise sanitary wear due to affordability issues.
- One in five (19%) girls have changed to a less suitable sanitary product due to cost.

1.4 Stigma

1.4.1 It is clear that in addition to affordability, girls and women can also be subject to an experience of stigma and shame which can lead them to feel embarrassed by their periods. Statistics from Plan International UK's research on Period Poverty and Stigma indicates that:

- Nearly half (48%) of girls aged 14-21 in the UK are embarrassed by their periods.
- One in seven (14%) girls admitted that they did not know what was happening when they started their period with more than a quarter (26%) reporting that they did not know what to do when they started their period.
- Only one in five (22%) girls feel comfortable discussing their period with their teacher.
- Almost three quarters (71%) of girls admitted that they have felt embarrassed buying sanitary products.
- One in ten had been asked not to talk about their periods in front of their mother (12%) or father (11%).
- 49% of girls have missed an entire day of school because of their period of which 59% have made up a lie or an alternate excuse.
- 64% of girls have missed a PE or sport lesson because of their period, of which 52% have made up a lie or excuse.

¹ The findings are based on Opinium Research survey of representative weighted sample of 1,000 girls and young women aged 14-21, carried out online between 22-24 August 2017



1.5 Birmingham context

1.5.1 Evidence submitted on behalf of Birmingham Public Health provided some contextual information about the estimated scale of period poverty in Birmingham:

- There are an estimated 324,900 women and girls in Birmingham aged between 10-50 years, just over 56.6% of the total number of women in the city.
- Therefore, based on the 1 in 10 women and girls affected by period poverty (Plan International 2017/GLA 2018), an estimated 32,490 girls and women between 10-50 years may have experienced period poverty at some point during their life.
- In Birmingham 4.6% of women aged 16-64 years are claiming out of work benefits (March 2019), of these approximately two thirds are of reproductive age and are likely to be menstruating.
- Women in Birmingham in full-time work earn on average £2.74 less per hour than men in the city working full time. Although the average weekly gross pay for women in the city is £40 greater than the West Midlands average and £2.40 higher than the UK average (2018); these averages figures hide the inequalities experienced by the lowest earners in the city, those working less than full time and those not in employment.

1.5.2 We would expect period poverty to be closely linked to deprivation and therefore be more prevalent in the areas of the city with the highest numbers of low-income families.

2 National interventions

There are some initiatives which are already happening at a national level and some important new national developments have been announced since the Committee decided to carry out this review.

2.1 Education and tackling stigma

2.1.1 A range of organisations including **Girlguiding UK**, the UK's leading charity for girls and young women, have been part of the movement to tackle period poverty and address the stigma and shame that can be associated with periods, with a campaign calling for all pupils to be taught about periods and puberty as part of the new Relationships and Sex Education curriculum.

2.1.2 The campaign called for all pupils to receive the same information about periods in schools and that information about what to expect in puberty needed to be part of the new comprehensive Relationships and Sex Education school curriculum in England. This has been incorporated into the new curriculum and is included in the statutory guidance which was published in June 2019 which will be mandatory in schools from September 2020. (See para 2.1.5 below)



2.1.3 As part of the campaign the first ever Period Poverty badge was designed for girls and leaders to wear to show their support for the campaign and encourage others not to be ashamed or embarrassed about periods. **Girlguiding worked with the charity WaterAid** to produce an educational resource pack which can be delivered to all age groups (from 5-18 years old). Many Girlguiding groups all over Birmingham have already completed this badge curriculum designed to raise awareness of period poverty as an issue and have already been awarded their badge.

2.1.4 Language is very important in contributing to and tackling stigma and shame around periods. Girlguiding members across the country are being asked to take a pledge to always talk openly about periods and to help make sure that no one feels embarrassed or ashamed about periods. Members of the Committee were invited by **Girlguiding Birmingham** to take the pledge to end stigma around periods and were pleased to do so to demonstrate support for the work being done to tackle stigma and to be advocates alongside Girlguiding Birmingham for young women in the city. **(Link to R02)**

I pledge to tackle period stigma by talking openly about periods, so that so no one feels embarrassed talking about them.

2.1.5 In June 2019 the new curriculum and new statutory guidance was published in relation to Relationships and Sex Education (RSE) and Health Education which schools are encouraged to adopt from as early as September 2019, but which will be mandatory from September 2020. There are approximately 20 Birmingham schools which have chosen to adopt the new curriculum in September 2019 and these early adopters will receive support from the Children and Young People Directorate through a RSE working group. The section dealing with physical health and mental wellbeing includes the following:

Puberty including menstruation should be covered in Health Education and should, as far as possible, be addressed before onset. This should ensure male and female pupils are prepared for changes they and their peers will experience.

The new statutory guidance also includes the following paragraph on menstruation:

The onset of menstruation can be confusing or even alarming for girls if they are not prepared. Pupils should be taught key facts about the menstrual cycle including what is an average period, range of menstrual products and the implications for emotional and physical health. In addition to curriculum content, schools should also make adequate and sensitive arrangements to help girls prepare for and manage menstruation including with requests for menstrual products. Schools will need to consider the needs of their cohort of pupils in designing content.

2.2 Providing access to free sanitary products – Schools

2.2.1 In the government's Spring Statement in March 2019, there was a commitment to fund provision of free sanitary products in all secondary schools and colleges in England.



- 2.2.2 Subsequently in April, following feedback from teachers, students and parents, it was confirmed that the programme would be extended to all primary schools and that access to the free products would be fully-funded by the Department for Education in all primary schools across the country.
- 2.2.3 The intention is to roll-out the scheme nationwide in early 2020.
- 2.2.4 **The Red Box Project** is a national charity providing free menstrual products for young people in schools (www.redboxproject.org). The Red Box Project is currently active in Birmingham Central, Birmingham South West, Great Barr and Sutton Coldfield.

2.3 Providing access to free sanitary products – NHS

- 2.3.1 An announcement was made in March 2019 by NHS England and supported by the BMA, that from Summer 2019, all women and girls being cared for by the NHS will be given, on request, appropriate sanitary products free of charge. Many hospitals already provide them, but this will be mandated in the new standard contract with hospitals for 2019-20.

- 2.3.2 Simon Stevens, Chief Executive for NHS England said:

It is absolutely right that everyone has access to the essentials of daily life during their time in hospital, and that should include sanitary products.

It's fundamental that we give patients the best experience possible during what can be a stressful time of their life, and by providing sanitary products the NHS can prevent unnecessary embarrassment and leave people to focus on their recovery.

2.4 Providing access to free sanitary products – Women in custody

- 2.4.1 The Home Office has announced that it is set to change the law to ensure that all menstruating women and others with personal health and hygiene needs, are treated with dignity while in custody. Police forces will provide menstrual products to female detainees if required, free of charge.
- 2.4.2 The intended changes will be brought into effect when the revised Police and Criminal Evidence Act 1984 (PACE) Codes of Practice have been laid in Parliament.

2.5 Period Poverty Taskforce

- 2.5.1 Following on from the announcements that period products in schools, hospitals and police custody will be free for women and girls, the government announced a Period Poverty Taskforce to be co-chaired by Plan International UK, Procter & Gamble and the Minister for Women and Equalities.



- 2.5.2 The group will seek to work together with a range of different organisations already working on period poverty from across the public, private and third sectors. It will bring together a range of charities and businesses to tackle stigma and education around periods, alongside accessibility of period products and to develop a comprehensive and sustainable response to period poverty in the UK.
- 2.5.3 The remit for the Taskforce will include:
- looking at the evidence and data about how period poverty affects different groups in our society;
 - addressing stigma will be another area of focus; and
 - considering the role of education, access, costs, communications and role models in shifting social attitudes.
- 2.5.4 Alongside Plan International UK and Procter & Gamble, the Taskforce will include members from grass-root organisations, businesses, public bodies and consult with academics, social enterprises, retailers and manufacturers, using their expertise to drive this vital work.

3 Examples of initiatives happening elsewhere

3.1 Other Local Authorities

- Leeds City Council has entered into partnership with the University of Leeds and The Children's Society to work with children, young people, schools and other settings to conduct research to investigate the impact of poverty on attendance and is working with a Community School to discuss the prevalence of period poverty and explore the best ways to mitigate it.
- In Sheffield, there is a #periodpositive Schools Charter pilot project inviting local primary and secondary schools to join a free pilot project from #period positive, supported by Learn Sheffield and Sheffield City Council. It is aiming to turn Sheffield into Britain's first #period positive city through a new school charter to support the city to become the first place in the UK to formally develop a strategy to challenge harmful menstrual taboos and change the way young people think about periods as part of a long-term education solution.
- Bristol City Council made a unanimous decision in November 2018 to be the first English city to attempt to eradicate period poverty, with the first action being to ensure that all Bristol schools are supplied with products accessible to all children from school year 5 to year 13. Subsequently a summit was held to share ideas about accessing period products,



improving education around the availability and environmental sustainability of products and how to build closer ties between those working on period poverty.

- Nottingham City Council approved a new scheme to fight period poverty by making sanitary items more accessible to those on low incomes by placing free pads and tampons in schools and encouraging local businesses to provide free products to their staff.

3.2 Football Clubs

- 3.2.1 In March 2018 three lifelong Celtic fans and season ticket holders set up the “On the Ball” campaign to get free sanitary products in football grounds in the UK. They decided to launch their campaign after learning that not all toilets had sanitary bins and sanitary products were locked away in machines which required exact change.
- 3.2.2 They have had considerable success with their campaign and managed to get a substantial number of teams, on board and at the time of writing, a total of 91 clubs had signed up for the campaign, including locally Aston Villa and West Bromwich Albion.

4 Local interventions in Birmingham

4.1 Addressing women and girls living in poverty

- 4.1.1 It should be said that the most important step to address period poverty would be to address wider poverty in the city, especially affecting women. This could include focused work to address the employment gap affecting women and the gender pay gap affecting women working in the city.
- 4.1.2 The evidence provided by Birmingham Public Health highlighted that in 2006 Birmingham City Council jointly published a report with Sheffield Hallam University on addressing poverty affecting women which made a series of policy recommendations for action; however, there has not been any recent work to reflect on progress against these actions. Currently there is a lack of data or detailed evidence about the scale and impact of period poverty in the city and more research in this area is needed to fully understand what is happening.

4.2 Providing targeted access to free sanitary products

- 4.2.1 Everybody deserves access to safe and hygienic menstrual products and the dignity that this affords. There is potential for targeted access to free sanitary wear and some organisations are already providing direct interventions which are focused on the provision of free sanitary products at venues and spaces that are most accessed by women and girls living in poverty, such as



homeless shelters, drug and alcohol services, food banks and job centres. It was suggested that GP surgeries might also provide ideal distribution centres for free sanitary products.

4.2.2 Several Councils in England have put period poverty schemes in place (see paragraph 3.1). The most common method has been the strategic placement of free sanitary product supplies in key locations, such as schools, youth services, voluntary sector settings and food banks. Significant learning has already emerged from programmes aimed at addressing period poverty. For example, successful schemes tend to be those that make sanitary products available in a range of areas without the need for them to be requested via a teacher or other adult.

4.2.3 Neelam Heera, founder of the charitable organisation **Cysters** which works to spread awareness of reproductive health in particular among Black and Minority Ethnic (BME) Women, presented a comprehensive submission to the inquiry which gave an overview of Cysters and set out the work being undertaken to tackle period poverty through their project '**Our Cysters**'. The project works with ethnic, marginalised communities and those living under the poverty line to tackle period poverty in Birmingham by asking for donations of menstrual products and providing them to those who need them. They collect menstrual products from companies and distribute items between charities working with homeless women and schools within the Handsworth Association of Schools. They have recently expanded and been asked to support the Food Bank in Redditch by providing these products.

4.2.4 They source products in a variety of ways by:

- engaging with local businesses and organisations and asking them to collect a box of monthly donations which are collected, and the items are then given direct to the schools or organisations working directly with homeless individuals.
- Collaborating with Chambers of Commerce who have held period poverty donations drives for Cysters.
- Working with corporate organisations to utilise their Corporate Social Responsibility policies to collect products for Cysters.
- Working with various sectors within the community and working with local temples and Gurdwaras both as a donation station and to have a box of products in the temple for the community.
- Creating a partnership with Sandwell and West Birmingham NHS Trust to promote the availability of free sanitary products for patients and staff as their period poverty drive.
- Cysters have now been invited to join the government's Period Poverty Taskforce (previously referred to in paragraph 2.6.1) which is co-chaired by Plan International UK, Procter and Gamble and the Minister for Women and Equalities, to work with other members of the Taskforce to tackle the issue around period poverty and wider stigma around menstruation.



- 4.2.5 There was also evidence from **Girlguiding Birmingham** that individual groups and volunteers have worked to ensure that their members have easy and free access to period products in their weekly meeting places and during camps, residential events and other trips, but that this is not yet consistent in every group across the city.
- 4.2.6 **Change, Grow, Live**, which provides services for adults experiencing difficulties with drugs or alcohol in Birmingham, has a specialist Women's Team based in Ladywood who offer free sanitary products to the females who access this service and they also signpost families to various organisations who can support them with ongoing issues such as access to foodbanks.
- 4.2.7 Change, Grow, Live also has a dedicated Homeless Team who offer free sanitary products to women who are rough sleeping across the city and also signpost to various organisations for ongoing provision and support where needed. Their community venues and base at Scala House also provide food bank vouchers to service users which includes providing products for themselves and their families. **(Link to R04)**
- 4.2.8 Evidence was provided to the Committee by the Joint Head of **Birmingham Youth Service** that there are 15 Youth Centres throughout Birmingham which are frequented by, predominantly, 11-19 year olds of which 40% are females. Most, if not all, of the Youth Centres are located in deprived areas and are therefore within reach of people who may have an issue with period poverty. Free sanitary products have always been available in Youth Centres but, until recently, a young woman or girl would have to ask a female member of staff for a sanitary item. In response to the recent campaign around period poverty which has heightened awareness of the issue, a pilot project has been set up to provide free sanitary products more discreetly in boxes in the ladies toilet for all women using the centre. However, this is currently a pilot project and may not be sustainable if they cannot access free sanitary products. The service is continuing to explore opportunities to access free products to sustain the initiative.

4.3 Education and Awareness of Menstruation

- 4.3.1 Lack of education around menstrual health and wellbeing is an issue which can have a huge impact on women's health as well as their schooling. With this in mind, the '**Our Cysters**' project has also expanded into attending schools and delivering classes on menstrual wellbeing and reproductive health classes as part of the PHSE curriculum. This is important to address a number of issues around period poverty with evidence of girls missing school due to lack of affordable and available menstrual products and:
- 71% of girls reported that they felt embarrassed while buying these products.
 - 1 in 7 girls admitted that they do not actually know what's happening when having to buy and use products.



- 27% of girls have overused sanitary towels because they cannot afford fresh ones.²

4.4 Cultural and social attitudes towards menstruation

- 4.4.1 Amongst some faiths, traditions and cultures, people may find it difficult to talk about the menstrual cycle and, therefore, the true extent and nature of the issue in Birmingham may be invisible. Some beliefs are taught from an early age that menstruation is dirty and that blood spoils food with women being told to stay away from the kitchen when on a menstrual cycle. There are also religious beliefs around purity and women during their menstrual cycles. This can sometimes mean that a conversation around menstrual hygiene and menstrual wellbeing can be felt to be inappropriate or embarrassing.
- 4.4.2 Members received evidence from Neelam Heera from the **'Our Cysters'** project about feedback from a focus group which they held with a group of women from Black and Minority Ethnic communities on their thoughts around period poverty. A number of women reported that as children they had to use tissues etc. in place of menstrual products, but that this was not seen as poverty, rather that menstrual products were not important in the home compared with other expenses. It was said in the focus group "buying dad the good meat for the week was more essential than pads." It was felt that these are indicators that women's menstrual needs are traditionally seen as unimportant compared to the needs of the males within the family which stems from cultural attitudes towards menstruation generally within some communities.

4.5 Environmental issues

- 4.5.1 Environmental issues, and in particular issues around plastics, are an increasingly high profile and urgent concern. Disposable sanitary towels can take up to 5,000 years to bio-degrade. There are reusable products which could potentially help to both alleviate some issues arising from poverty and also contribute towards reducing avoidable waste. The products are inexpensive, long-term and environmentally friendly so it is important that children are taught about them. On average these reusable products actually last around 4 years. At the moment, many young people have not been taught about them and so don't engage with them.
- 4.5.2 In relation to reusable products, the evidence from Cysters was that in the next educational programme they will be going into schools to teach about what a reusable product is, how to use it and what you need to do to look after it. Members were also told that they use social media including Facebook, Twitter and Instagram to engage with a young audience about the work of the project and to promote reusable products.

² Plan International UK



5 What can Birmingham City Council do?

5.1 Education – Work closely with schools and teachers

5.1.1 Birmingham City Council needs to work more closely with schools and teachers to educate students about period poverty and specifically in relation to:

- raising awareness/dealing with stigma and shame;
- information about the products available and disposal of sanitary items; and
- the environmental aspects. Schools need to provide more information about reusable products which are already available and also to encourage companies to make products that are more environmentally friendly.

5.1.2 There was an offer on behalf of 'Our Cysters' to work with the Council to develop a plan to take this work forward. **(Link to R1)**

5.2 Working with communities on cultural attitudes to menstruation

5.2.1 It was highlighted in the evidence that some religious and cultural attitudes to menstruation found within the City may make conversations about the menstrual cycle difficult or be perceived to be inappropriate and, therefore, the true nature and extent of the issue in Birmingham may be invisible.

5.2.2 Concern was raised during the evidence from Birmingham Public Health that, so far, there is no in-depth research where conclusions can be drawn about the prevalence of period poverty or the physical or mental health impacts of low period awareness, amongst specific groups or different population groups. Much of the generic research carried out nationally does not focus sufficiently on specific communities where this issue may arise to pick up the nature and extent of this issue. Consideration needs to be given to ways of widening 'period awareness' within a super-diverse city and to the possibility of commissioning a research programme aimed at establishing the extent and nature of this issue in Birmingham. **(Link to R3)**

5.3 Co-ordination with and support for third sector

5.3.1 There are a large number of small third sector organisations working on period poverty doing similar work across the city. There is a need for a collaborative approach to providing co-ordination and support to these organisations which the City Council would be well-placed to provide. This was highlighted in the evidence about the 'Our Cysters' project – where collaboration and co-



ordination between the Council and the third sector would help, especially in relation to accessing marginalised communities and facilitating the upscaling of projects across Birmingham. 'Our Cysters' have a large network of volunteers and could potentially extend the project to more centres. Advice, facilitation and support with applications for grant funding by third sector organisations would be another aspect which should be examined. **(Link to R4)**

- 5.3.2 Members were told that currently Cysters volunteers store products in their own homes. Really, they require a central hub in Birmingham to store donated products where they could then be collected and distributed as needed, but that they are not in a position to pay the high fees charged by corporate organisations. They have had conversations with various corporate organisations who would charge a high fee to store and hold products which the charities cannot afford. **(Link to R4)**

6 Conclusion

The evidence highlighted that in spite of work being done and support being provided across the city, especially by a number of third sector organisations, there are still significant social restrictions that influence the management of menstruation. Some girls do not understand what is happening when they start menstruating, and they have limited knowledge of biological processes. Using education and working closely with schools and teachers to inform and improve understanding about menstruation as a natural and normal part of the reproductive cycle and that sanitary products are an important part of supporting women's health is important in tackling some of these barriers. In addition, the evidence from Birmingham Public Health also emphasised that currently there is no in-depth research where conclusions can be drawn about specific groups or different population groups and that further research is needed to explore the experiences and needs of various populations. As a City Council, there is a need to explore what can be done to facilitate a more collaborative approach to providing co-ordination and support to those organisations already working to raise awareness and open communication to avoid any stigma about menstruation, and address period poverty in the city.

Motion

That the recommendations R01 to R06 be approved, and that the Executive be requested to pursue their implementation.

A Report of the Health and Social Care Overview and Scrutiny Committee, 5th November 2019

Tackling Period Poverty and Raising Period Awareness

Executive Commentary

I welcome this review into tackling period poverty; we are all too aware that in many developing countries it is a struggle with affordability and availability of sanitary products. However, it is not something that we automatically assume is a reality in Birmingham or this country.

Periods are natural, there is nothing 'dirty' about periods, however as a society menstruation is not an issue that is discussed openly enough, leaving many young girls feeling embarrassed. There are cultural factors and many myths and taboos that thankfully organisations such as 'Cysters' are tackling as in many communities periods are associated with impurity; and girls and young women as a result are not taking part in everyday activities. Our schools, with a captive audience of children, are in a great position to ensure our children are educated and can talk openly about periods and menstruation being a completely natural process and a key element of the reproductive cycle without which none of us would be here today.

This report reflects the stark reality of how common period poverty is in Birmingham and the UK, with girls missing school due to being unable to purchase sanitary products. There are also the wider associated health implications as without sanitary products there is an increased risk of infections.

I welcome that this is being addressed with the DfE announcing free sanitary products being made available for all secondary schools, and also primary schools from next year. Climate Change and our environment and sustainability are pertinent issues that are being openly discussed and the need to educate and make more readily available menstrual cups and washable pads needs to be looked at further, as most sanitary products contain plastics and we know the damage that this does to our environment.

This report is an insightful read and I thank the Health and Social Care Overview and Scrutiny Committee for the work and time taken to gather evidence and am supportive of the recommendations proposed to help us in creating a society where periods can be talked about openly.

Councillor Paulette Hamilton
Cabinet Member, Health and Social Care



Jon Hunt
United Kingdom

CITY COUNCIL - 9 July 2019
PETITION NO. 2142

OPPOSE THE FLYOVER DEMOLITION! **- SIGN Jon and Morriam's Petition**

To the The Lord Mayor, Birmingham City Council: We the undersigned object in the strongest possible terms to the proposal to remove the Perry Barr flyover included in the Perry Barr transport reorganisation. We are deeply alarmed about the prospect of two years of disruption, believe the X51 bus service would cease to be viable and are not satisfied that the proposed replacement traffic lights will be adequate.

Name (M/s)

Address

Signature

26 Apr 2019 —

Thank you for signing the new petition objecting to the proposed demolition of Perry Barr flyover. It's now close to its first 1,00 signatures.

Can you help get more signatures by sharing it - or even printing off a petition and getting friends, family and neighbours to sign? Attached is a copy of a printable version.

Something we have noticed: when you share the link to the petition on Facebook, it doesn't always tell your friends what it's all about. Sometimes it just shows a picture. Worth checking or changing your posting when you do so.

We are still waiting for news of the council's "consultation". We will let you know as soon as we know more

Clrs Jon Hunt and Morriam Jan

• [Share](#)

Shared on Facebook

• [Tweet](#)

• [Email](#)

Keep fighting for people power!

Birmingham City Council

City Council

5 November 2019



Subject: A34 Perry Barr Highway Improvement Scheme
Report of: Cabinet Member for Transport and Environment
Report author: Philip Edwards, Assistant Director Transport and Connectivity, Tel 0121 303 6467, Email Philip.edwards@birmingham.gov.uk

Does the report contain confidential or exempt information? ☐ Yes ☒ No

If relevant, state which appendix is exempt, and provide exempt information paragraph number or reason if confidential :

1 Executive Summary

- 1.1 During the Public Consultation for the A34 Perry Barr Highway scheme, petitions 2142 and 2156 were received containing a total of 7,078 signatures. Due to the size of the petition, Business Management Committee decided that the petition was to be debated at a meeting of full Council.

2 Motion

- 2.1 Council notes the petitions 2142 and 2156 submitted in support of the A34 Flyover. Pending the re-consideration of the Full Business Case for the scheme by Cabinet, following a call-in by the Sustainability and Transport Overview & Scrutiny Committee, the Council recommends that these petitions are discharged.

3 Background

- 3.1 Cabinet report dated 15 October 2019, A34 Perry Barr Highway Improvement Scheme – Full Business Case (FBC).

Birmingham City Council

City Council

5 November 2019



Subject: Motions for Debate from Individual Members

Does the report contain confidential or exempt information? ☐ Yes ☒ No

If relevant, state which appendix is exempt, and provide exempt information paragraph number or reason if confidential :

To consider the following Motions of which notice has been given in accordance with Council Procedure Rules (section B4 G of the Constitution).

A. Councillors Paulette Hamilton and Nicky Brennan have given notice of the following Notice of Motion:-

“The Council notes:

- That although the Equality Act 2010 has specifically clarified that it is unlawful to discriminate against a woman because she is breastfeeding a child, there is some way to go until this is accepted as the norm on all premises.
- That the medical evidence supports breastfeeding as the preferred option for both mother and baby, and that this view is endorsed by the British Medical Association and the World Health Organisation.
- That breastfeeding can protect babies from infections including sickness and diarrhoea, ear infections and chest infections, and help prevent juvenile onset diabetes and obesity.
- That evidence demonstrates that breastfeeding also leads to health benefits for mothers, including a reduction in the risk of developing breast cancer.
- That breastfeeding can counteract health inequalities; leaves no ecological footprint and saves money.
- That ultimately the decision whether or not to breastfeed must lie with the mother, and no action should be taken which may make mothers feel guilty if they are unable or choose not to breastfeed.

The Council believes that:

- Birmingham should be seen as a 'Breastfeeding Friendly' city and that it should be made clear to all mothers that breastfeeding is welcomed in all public areas.
- All women should be supported to feel confident and comfortable in breastfeeding their babies in line with WHO recommendations, to help babies (and mothers) to receive the benefits of breastfeeding.

The Council therefore resolves to:

- Continue to promote and support breastfeeding in the City through the BCC commissioned 'Birmingham Forward Steps' Early Years Service and the Birmingham and Solihull United Maternity and Newborn Partnership (BUMP), in line with the UK Unicef and WHO 'Baby Friendly Initiative'.
- Ensure that all Council premises are aware of their duty under the Equality Act 2010 not to discriminate against breastfeeding mothers and display signage to indicate that breastfeeding is welcome.
- Encourage businesses, third sector organisations, schools, colleges and educational establishments to display signage to indicate that breastfeeding is welcome."

B. Councillors Robert Alden and Ewan Mackey have given notice of the following Notice of Motion:-

"This Council gives its full support to West Midlands's Mayor Andy Street's bid to build a 'Gigafactory' in the West Midlands metropolitan region."