



Subject: COMMONWEALTH GAMES (CWG) PERRY BARR HIGHWAY INFRASTRUCTURE – OPTIONS APPRAISAL REPORT
Report of: DIRECTOR, INCLUSIVE GROWTH
Relevant Cabinet Member(s): Councillor Ian Ward – Leader
Councillor Waseem Zaffar – Transport and Environment
Councillor Brett O'Reilly – Finance and Resources
Relevant O &S Chair(s): Councillor Liz Clements – Sustainability and Transport
Councillor Sir Albert Bore - Resources
Report author: Peter Parker, Head of Infrastructure Delivery,
Telephone No: 0121 303 7096
Email Address: peter.parker@birmingham.gov.uk

Are specific wards affected?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes	<input type="checkbox"/> No – All wards affected
If yes, name(s) of ward(s): Birchfield, Aston, Lozells and Perry Barr		
Is this a key decision?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes	<input type="checkbox"/> No
If relevant, add Forward Plan Reference: 005632/2018		
Is the decision eligible for call-in?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes	<input type="checkbox"/> No
Does the report contain confidential or exempt information?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
If relevant, provide exempt information paragraph number or reason if confidential :		

1 Executive Summary

- 1.1 To seek approval to the Options Appraisal for transformational highway infrastructure improvements at Perry Barr to support the Commonwealth Games (CWG) and legacy growth and to proceed with the development of a preferred option to full public consultation. The drawings are attached in Appendix B. The key objectives of this project are to improve transport connectivity between the Birchfield Retail Core, One Stop Shopping Centre and the CWG Athletes' Village and legacy residential sites; to support the successful delivery of the Games; and to act as a catalyst for further development in Perry Barr.

- 1.2 To approve the procurement strategy for the delivery of the highways and infrastructure works at Perry Barr.
- 1.3 To note and discharge the petitions received as detailed in Sections 5.8 and 5.9 in relation to the removal of the Perry Barr Flyover.

2 Recommendations

- 2.1 Approves the Options Appraisal contained in Appendix A of this report and to progress with Option 2 to full public consultation, detail design and Full Business Case stage, at a total estimated capital cost of £27.1m.
- 2.2 Approves the inclusion of the design and construction of the highway infrastructure works into the contract for the development of the Commonwealth Games Village, subject to agreement with Lendlease Ltd and a value for money appraisal and delegates:
 - (i) Authority to the Assistant Director of Transportation and Connectivity to procure, appoint and place orders with Lendlease Ltd to carry out design development, construction planning and detailed design.
 - (ii) The award of the construction works contract to Lendlease Ltd to the Leader jointly with the Director, Inclusive Growth.
- 2.3 In the event that 2.2 is not taken forward to delegate authority to the Assistant Director of Transportation and Connectivity to procure, appoint and place orders with a Design and Build Contractor to carry out design development, construction planning and detailed design using the Council's Highways and Infrastructure Works Framework Agreement.
- 2.4 Notes that Cabinet, through the Outline Business Case for the Commonwealth Games Village and the wider Perry Barr Regeneration Programme approved on 26 June 2018, delegated:
 - (i) The approval of the Full Business Case to the Leader jointly with the Director Inclusive Growth and the Chief Finance Officer
 - (ii) The award of the construction works contract through the Council's Highways and Infrastructure Works Framework Agreement to the Leader jointly with the Director Inclusive Growth.
- 2.5 Authorises the discharging of petition numbers 2073, 2088 and 2103 received as detailed in Sections 5.8 and 5.9 in relation to the removal of Perry Barr Flyover and that Councillors Jon Hunt and Morriam Jan and the first-named petitioners be informed accordingly.
- 2.6 Authorises the City Solicitor (or their delegate) to negotiate, execute and complete all necessary agreements and documentation to give effect to the above recommendations.

3 Background

- 3.1 On 26th June 2018 Cabinet approved the Outline Business Case (OBC) for the Commonwealth Games Village and the wider Perry Barr Regeneration Programme and gave authority to make a Compulsory Purchase Order (CPO) to enable the delivery of the Commonwealth Games Athletes' Village, the

upgrade of transport infrastructure and associated public realm enhancements. The OBC set out the proposed transport infrastructure including the possible removal of Perry Barr Flyover and Birchfield Underpass. This Options Appraisal presents a further examination of these options to retain/remove the flyover and underpass following the completion of detailed traffic modelling and seeks approval to proceed with a preferred option to full public consultation. Traffic Modelling Data is attached as Appendix E.

- 3.2 The CPO was made in December 2018 and includes land for the various purposes listed in paragraph 3.1 including delivery of highway improvements, Sprint bus rapid transit and cycle infrastructure. Nineteen objections have been received, some of which relate to the highway proposals. The City Council and its agents will continue to engage with all affected parties to resolve their objections as per standard processes.
- 3.3 As part of the village and legacy housing development, for which planning consent was granted on 20th December 2018, a 200m section of Aldridge Road (A453) is to be closed to through traffic. As a result of this, the A34/A453 junction needs to be reconfigured. The proposed junction works will seek to improve connectivity across the highway and will help knit the Perry Barr centre back together and will promote walking and cycling within the centre and local area and link residents to shops, the railway station, bus interchange and Perry Hall Park. In addition the proposals aim to manage the movement of cyclists, buses including Sprint and general traffic both to/from and through the area.
- 3.4 The CPO mentioned in paragraph 3.1 above was made on 7th December 2018 and the land included in the CPO is required to deliver the highway improvements including the provision of bus lanes and cycle infrastructure.
- 3.5 The Birmingham Development Plan identifies Perry Barr District Centre as a key growth area. Birmingham Connected seeks to deliver an integrated transport system to support economic growth and job creation at Perry Barr and this will take the shape of:
- The creation of a new public transport interchange integrating rail (including a redesigned station), bus and Sprint (bus rapid transit);
 - The introduction of a new Sprint route along the A34;
 - The introduction of a dedicated cycle route; and
 - Capping of Birchfield Island to create a better environment for pedestrians and cyclists through the removal of pedestrian subways and creation of at-grade crossings and dedicated cycle track.
- 3.6 These interventions provide for modal shift and behaviour change which will create a public transport-focussed environment and will enable placemaking-led infrastructure interventions to be implemented.

4 Options Considered and Recommended Proposal

- 4.1 Three options have been considered in detail as set out below, which seek to bring about significant transformation above and beyond the proposals included within the planning consent:

- Option 1: Removal of A34 flyover and the A34 underpass and replacement of the A34/A4040 roundabout with a four arm traffic signal junction;
- Option 2: Removal of A34 flyover, retention of A34 underpass and replacement of the A34/A4040 roundabout with a four arm traffic signal junction; and
- Option 3: Retention of A34 flyover and A34 underpass and replacement of the A34/A4040 roundabout with a four arm traffic signal junction.

4.2 The appraisal of the three options is outlined in Appendix A. The options drawings are attached in Appendix B.

4.3 Approval through this report is sought to proceed with Option 2 to full public consultation, as this option provides on balance a better overall scheme taking into consideration the following;

- Enabling transformational change and regeneration to the Perry Barr area and acting catalyst for further development;
- The management of the movement of people to/from Perry Barr and along the A34 using sustainable modes of transport whilst recognising the A34 as a strategic route;
- The delivery of transport infrastructure to support the development of new commercial and residential uses in the district centre, which create a sense of arrival;
- The provision of direct pedestrian crossing between the new village and the shopping centre, bus interchange and rail station, along with the creation of high quality public realm at the A34/A453 and A34/A4040 junctions to create a place where people want to visit, shop, work or live;
- The provision of a cycle track / shared footway from the District Centre connecting to the Birmingham Cycle Revolution scheme at Heathfield Road;
- The provision of bus lanes on both sides of the A34 between Birchfield Island and Aldridge Road;
- Access to One Stop Shopping Centre through the creation of a focal point all movement traffic signal junction at A34/A453;
- The removal of the convoluted pedestrian subway/footbridge arrangement at the A34/A4040 junction and introduction of at grade crossings incorporated into the proposed traffic signals thereby reducing the perception of crime/ anti-social behaviour; and
- The ability to link, and remotely control, traffic signal junctions and pedestrian crossing on the A34 to manage the flow of traffic.

4.4 In summary the removal of the Perry Barr flyover is a key element of proposed highway improvements, as well as placemaking in Perry Barr, and growth and transformation of Perry Barr district centre. The flyover is a physical and visual barrier that contributes to transport and highways infrastructure dominating and bisecting the centre. Its removal will deliver a much more attractive, legible and connected urban centre, whilst promoting sustainable forms of transport. It will create a better quality environment and access for sites fronting the highway, including residential and commercial development delivered here, and will

improve development value thereby improving viability. The introduction of the wider transport infrastructure proposals at this location are key to encouraging people to travel by bus, train and cycle. Modal shift is essential to the efficient management of traffic along the A34 and the wider movement of people in the context of growth and City Council policies.

- 4.5 The delivery of the changes to the highway will result in a period of disruption to users. The project team will work with Transport for West Midlands (TfWM) to endeavour to keep traffic disruption to a minimum through (i) a phased construction approach; (ii) co-ordination of the highway contract with adjoining contracts e.g. Village, Bus Interchange, Rail Station and Sprint and (iii) the introduction of a Travel Demand Management Strategy to promote travel time and mode shift. The contractor's temporary traffic management proposals for the highway works are subject to approval in accordance with the City Council's Traffic Management Protocol process.

5 Consultation

- 5.1 The development of the proposals has been discussed with Officers in Highways and Infrastructure, Transportation and Connectivity and Planning who are supportive of the proposals progressing to full public consultation.
- 5.2 Officers from City Finance, Legal and Governance and Corporate Procurement have been involved in the preparation of this report.
- 5.3 The Options have been discussed with Officers from TfWM, Highways England (HE), Sandwell MBC and Walsall MBC; further discussions are to be held, particularly around the traffic modelling work and developing proposals for Sprint. All parties have indicated they intend to provide a formal response at the consultation stage.
- 5.4 Officers from Transportation and Connectivity have attended Perry Barr Ward Committee and Perry Barr Residents CWG Liaison Group to explain the options being considered and that a full public consultation will be undertaken on the preferred option.
- 5.5 The Ward Councillors for Aston, Lozells, Oscott, Perry Barr, Birchfield and Kingstanding have been invited to private briefings to discuss the options. Dialogue will continue with the Ward Councillors on the preferred option and formal responses sought at the consultation stage. Discussions have taken place with the MP for Perry Barr on the options and a formal response will be sought at the consultation stage.
- 5.6 Officers have engaged with the owner / operator of One Stop Shopping Centre to discuss the options. One Stop has requested further information on the traffic modelling and has raised concerns over the access / egress arrangements. Officers will continue discussions with One Stop to seek to address the concerns raised. One Stop has objected to the CPO.
- 5.7 A full public consultation will be undertaken on the preferred option in spring 2019 and the feedback will be reported and used to inform the Full Business Case Report.

5.8 The City Council has received 4 petitions as follows;

- Petition no. 2073 to City Council on 11th September 2018 containing 451 signatures from the Perry Barr Ward Councillors requesting 'That the proposal to remove the Perry Barr flyover be halted and the flyover retained to prevent unnecessary disruption to traffic in the run-up to the Commonwealth Games, and to continue the smooth flow of traffic, especially high speed buses on the A34'.
- Petition no. 2088 to City Council on 6th November 2018 containing 2151 signatures from the Perry Barr Ward Councillors stating 'We the undersigned request proposal to remove the Perry Barr flyover be halted and the flyover retained to prevent unnecessary disruption to traffic in the run-up to the Commonwealth Games, and to continue the smooth flow of traffic, especially high speed buses on the A34'.
- Petition no. 2087 to City Council on 6th November 2018 containing 116 signatures from the Perry Barr Ward Councillors stating 'We the undersigned are deeply concerned about the combined impact of the proposal to remove the Perry Barr Flyover and introduction of SPRINT bus services (with fewer seats) on the excellent X51 service and call for proposals that improve this service'.
- Petition no. 2103 to City Council on 15th January 2019 containing 239 signatures from the Perry Barr Ward Councillors stating 'We the undersigned request proposal to remove the Perry Barr flyover be halted and the flyover retained to prevent unnecessary disruption to traffic in the run-up to the Commonwealth Games, and to continue the smooth flow of traffic, especially high speed buses on the A34'.

5.9 Petition numbers 2073, 2088 and 2103 have been discussed with the Perry Barr Ward Councillors and the Cabinet Member for Transport and Environment. Taking into consideration the representations made by the Perry Barr Ward Councillors and the benefits set out in 4.3 and 4.4 above authority is sought through this report to discharge these three petitions.

5.10 Petition number 2087 will be considered as part of the Sprint report to be presented to Cabinet in summer 2019.

6 Risk Management

6.1 The risks are set out in Appendix C.

7 Compliance Issues:

7.1 How are the recommended decisions consistent with the City Council's priorities, plans and strategies?

7.1.1 The proposals set out in this report will support the delivery of the Council Plan and Budget 2018+. They will support the delivery of the ambition set out in the adopted Birmingham Development Plan (BDP), as well as the Aston Newtown Lozells Area Action Plan (AAP), Birmingham Connected, and the city's role as Host City for the 2022 Commonwealth Games.

7.1.2 The transport infrastructure proposals support development activity that will help to create jobs and support supply chain industries, supporting the local economy.

7.1.3 Birmingham Business Charter for Social Responsibility (BBC4SR).

Compliance with the BBC4SR is a mandatory requirement that will form part of the conditions of this contract. The contractors undertaking this project work under the Commonwealth Games Village contract or using the Council's Highways and Infrastructure Framework Agreement are certified signatories to the BBC4SR and will provide additional actions proportionate to the value of each contract awarded. These additional actions will be identified by the project team and will include employment opportunities and will be monitored and managed during the contract period.

7.2 Legal Implications

7.2.1 The City Council in carrying out transportation, highway and infrastructure related work will do so under the relevant primary legislation comprising the Town and Country Planning Act 1990; Highways Act 1980; Road Traffic Act 1974; Road Traffic Regulation Act 1984; Traffic Management Act 2004; Traffic Act 2000 and other related regulations, instructions, directives, and general guidance.

7.3 Financial Implications

7.3.1 The following table shows the estimated capital cost of the three options.

	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3
Cost	£30.2m	£27.1m	£26.4m

7.3.2 This project forms a part of the overall Commonwealth Games Athletes Village project, for which Cabinet approved an Initial Business Case in June 2018 that included an indicative estimate of the cost of the highway works of £26m. The estimated capital cost of the preferred Option 2 is £27.1m, which is to be funded from Government Infrastructure Grant (£24.7m), Prudential Borrowing (to be repaid using receipts from sale of dwellings) (£1.13m) and Local Growth Fund (£1.27m, includes £1.1m LGF from Birmingham Cycle Revolution for cycle measures) as a part of the overall budget for the Commonwealth Games Athletes Village. The project team will work with the appointed design and build contractor to deliver the preferred option applying value engineering principles that meet the project objectives in bringing forward growth and transformation to Perry Barr District Centre.

7.3.3 This project will create assets that will form part of the highway upon completion of the project; as such they will be maintained within the overall highway maintenance programme. The estimated net cost of any newly created assets within the highway maintenance process will be established once the design for the preferred option has been further developed and reported in the Full Business Case report along with the

funding source. The detail design will be developed with a view to minimising the future maintenance liability on the City Council.

7.4 Procurement Implications (if required)

7.4.1 Lendlease Ltd has been awarded a contract for the residential element for the Athletes' village for the management of the construction works. It has been identified that there are synergies and efficiencies that can be realised by Lendlease operating as a managing contractor to deliver the highway infrastructure external to the village. The contract for the residential element includes the requirement to construct the private highway infrastructure within the village boundary and associated changes to the public highway. It is prudent to explore this opportunity with Lendlease to put in place the best delivery model possible to ensure that both projects are delivered simultaneously to the fixed deadline for the Games. The initial proposal is that Lendlease will procure (through competitive tender) and manage the delivery of the highway infrastructure works and the sub-contractors and this will enable co-ordination and alignment between and village works and highway infrastructure works to pre-empt and manage any issues that arise during the delivery of the projects. A value for money appraisal will be produced and approved by the Director, Inclusive Growth that will detail the options considered and demonstration of value for money (VFM) to the City Council.

7.4.2 In the event that the proposal in 7.4.1 is not taken forward, the highway infrastructure works will be tendered using the Council's Highways and Infrastructure Framework Agreement Lot 4 – Works above £500,000. It is proposed to engage a Design and Build Contractor.

7.4.3 The key stages of the procurement process with indicative dates are set out below:

- Tender Period and Evaluation – Early 2019
- Appoint Contractor for Design Only – Spring 2019
- Detailed Design and firm up target cost – Summer/Autumn 2019
- FBC Approval – Autumn 2019
- Appoint Contractor for Construction – Autumn 2019
- Construction – Early 2020 to late 2021.

7.4.4 Approval is sought through this report to delegate to the Assistant Director Transportation and Connectivity to appoint a Contractor through the Council's Highways and Infrastructure Framework Agreement or to appoint Lendlease Ltd to undertake Design Development, Construction Planning, Detail Design and to agree a target works cost.

7.4.5 The placement of a contract for the highway infrastructure construction works with either Lendlease or a contractor from the Highway and Infrastructure Framework Agreement will be subject to securing Full Business Case approval in autumn 2019.

7.5 Human Resources Implications (if required)

7.5.1 The management and delivery of the Perry Barr infrastructure works will be undertaken by officers within Transportation and Connectivity supported by external consultants for professional services.

7.6 Public Sector Equality Duty

7.6.1 An Equalities Analysis Initial Assessment has been carried out and is attached as Appendix D. This found that this report does not have any adverse impact on the protected groups and characteristics under the Equality Act 2010 and there is no requirement for a full assessment. This will be reviewed at FBC stage.

8 Background Documents

8.1 Birmingham Development Plan

8.2 Aston, Newtown and Lozells Area Action Plan

8.3 Report to Cabinet 26th June 2018- Commonwealth Games Village and the Wider Perry Barr Regeneration Programme- Outline Business Case

8.4 A34 Perry Barr Model Optioneering Report January 2019.

8.5 List of Appendices accompanying this Report:

- 1. Appendix A – Options Appraisal
- 2. Appendix B – Drawings
- 3. Appendix C – Risk Register.
- 4. Appendix D – Equality Analysis
- 5. Appendix E – Traffic Modelling Data