

# WRITTEN QUESTIONS TO CABINET MEMBERS

### WRITTEN QUESTIONS

### A To the Leader of the Council

### 1. External Legal Advice

From Councillor Adrian Delaney

### 2. Representing Birmingham in the Midlands

From Councillor Robert Alden

### 3. January Conservative Motion

From Councillor Gareth More

### 4. Concerns of former Cabinet Member

From Councillor Simon Morrall

### 5. <u>Delay in decision – bin dispute</u>

From Councillor Jon Hunt

### 6. Call in exemptions

From Councillor Suzanne Webb

### 7. Enablement Worker Dispute Report

From Councillor Baber Baz

### 8. Major Events Budget

From Councillor Zaker Choudhry

### 9. Perry Barr Flyover – how many residents consulted?

From Councillor Morriam Jan

### 10. **Pool Car**

From Councillor Adam Higgs

### 11. GMB dispute 1

From Councillor Deirdre Alden

### 12. GMB dispute 4

From Councillor David Barrie

### B To the Deputy Leader of the Council

### 1. FOI Disclosure Log

From Councillor Ewan Mackey

### 2. Brexit Commission

From Councillor Simon Morrall

### C To the Cabinet Member for Education, Skills and Culture

# 1. Concerned about staff welfare and reduction in library services

From Councillor Ken Wood

### 2. School Crossing Patrols 1

From Councillor Deirdre Alden

### 3. School Crossing Patrols 2

From Councillor Bob Beauchamp

### 4. School Places

From Councillor Peter Fowler

### 5. School Crossing Patrols 3

From Councillor Adam Higgs

### D To the Cabinet Member for Finance and Resources

### 1. Policy Department

From Councillor Eddie Freeman

### 2. Communications Department

From Councillor Ewan Mackey

### 3. <u>In-house lawyers</u>

From Councillor Bruce Lines

### E To the Cabinet Member for Health and Social Care

### 1. Enablement Workers Dispute - Home Care Workers

From Councillor Roger Harmer

### 2. Fairways

**A1** 

CITY COUNCIL - 5 FEBRUARY 2019

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR ADRIAN DELANEY

"External Legal Advice"

### Question:

In response to written question A12 from 15 January 2019, you stated that if any member wishes to seek external legal advice they must have the prior approval of the City Solicitor and in response to question A15 you confirmed that the Council would not pay for any legal advice that was sought without following this process. Question A11 meanwhile confirms that nearly £14k was paid to solicitors engaged by the former Leader when he questioned the council's own legal advice over the waste dispute. Does this mean that the former Leader did have the prior approval of the City Solicitor to seek this advice?

Answer:

Yes

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR ROBERT ALDEN

"Representing Birmingham in the Midlands"

### Question:

Since becoming Leader, for each meeting of the Midlands Engine, Midlands Connect and any sub committees of these on which you have a seat, please list the date of the meeting and whether you attended, sent a substitute or apologies.

### Answer:

Councillor Roger Lawrence from Wolverhampton City Council is the Combined Authority representative on Midlands Connect.

The dates of the Midlands Engine Meetings since I became Leader are:

- 22<sup>nd</sup> Feb 2018
- 18<sup>th</sup> June 2018
- 03<sup>rd</sup> July 2018
- 09<sup>th</sup> July 2018
- 22<sup>nd</sup> November 2018

I attended the Roundtable event on 9 July 2018 but due to other commitments as Leader I have been unable to attend the other meetings of the Midlands Engine. However, I have had numerous meetings and telephone calls with Sir John Peace and other partners to discuss issues across the Midlands Engine region.

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR GARETH MOORE

### "January Conservative Motion"

Did you at any point ask the Council through any officer to seek to amend or withdraw the Conservative Group motion submitted in January?

### Answer:

The Conservative Group motion in January called for the Council to release documents subject to ongoing litigation.

Therefore, I questioned the appropriateness of the motion with the City Solicitor

**A4** 

**CITY COUNCIL - 5 FEBRUARY 2019** 

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR SIMON MORRALL

### "Concerns of former Cabinet Member"

When did Councillor Majid Mahmood, as the former Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Waste and Recycling, first raise concerns with you about proposals to seek a court injunction against Unite and Unison for 'unlawful' strike action?

Answer:

Prior to the Cabinet meeting on 15<sup>th</sup> January 2019.

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR JON HUNT

"Delay in decision - bin dispute"

### Question:

Recent reviews of the Council have laid great store on the need to implement decisions swiftly and effectively. Are you responsible for the surprising delay in implementing the decision agreed at the special Cabinet meeting held on the 15th January to seek either an injunction or binding arbitration, or both, in order to end the bins dispute?

### Answer:

Since the Cabinet Meeting on 15 January 2019 BCC has been in arbitration (ACAS) with Unite and Unison regarding Waste. The first meeting was held on the 16 January 2019 and we have been in discussion since.

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR SUZANNE WEBB

### "Call in exemptions"

Since 2012, please list all decisions that have been exempted from call-in, including the date of the decision and the date the decision was actually implemented.

### Answer:

The attached schedule sets out the information requested from June 2015. As I explained when asked a similar question by Cllr Robert Alden in January 2018, it has not been possible to provide the full information requested as far back as 2012.

Title	CMIS ref.	Decision Maker	Contact Officer	Date of Meeting	Implementation Date
Waste Management	006016/2018 & 006017/2018	Cabinet	Clive Heaphy 0121 303 2950	15/01/2019	15/01/2019 but Waste Contingency Plan partially implemented
Budget Consultation 2019+	005734/2018	Cabinet	Clive Heaphy 0121 303 2950	13/11/2018	Consultation launched 13/11/2018
Highway Maintenance and Management PFI Contract	005563/2018	Joint Cabinet Member and Chief Officer	Kevin Hicks 0121 675 3748	07/09/2018	07/09/2018
Contract Award – Commonwealth Games Closing Ceremony	004958/2018 / 004960/2018	Cabinet	Steve Hollingworth 0121 464 2023	06/03/2018	15/04/2018
Contract Award - Television Broadcast Company for the World Indoor Athletics Championships	004963/2018 004964/2018	Joint Cabinet Member and Chief Officers	Steve Hollingworth 0121 464 2023	28/02/2018	01/04/2018
Budget 2018 + Consultation	004430/2017	Cabinet	Mike O'Donnell 0121 303 2950	12/12/2017	Consultation launched 12/12/2017
Commonwealth Games 2022	004633/2017 004634/2017	Cabinet	Steve Hollingworth 0121 464 2023	08/12/2017	08/12/2017

Waste Management Services	004515/2017 004516/2017	Cabinet – Special Meeting	Jacqui Kennedy 0121 303 2047	24/11/2017	24/11/2017
Supplier Excellence Programme (SEP) – Full Business Case	002671/2016	Cabinet	Mohammed Zahir 0121 303 2956	15/11/2016	Did not proceed to implementation due to withdrawal of funding from DWP
Service Birmingham B1 Accommodation Move	000258/2015 000058/2015	Cabinet	Nigel Kletz 0121 303 7270	24/06/2015	Notice given to break the B1 lease on 24/06/2015 and B1 successfully vacated by 24/03/2016

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR BABER BAZ

"Enablement Worker Dispute Report"

### Question:

Cabinet on the 22nd January 2019 received a last minute report on the enablement worker dispute, lacking some clarity about why it had been tabled. Could the Leader clarify whether the report was based on discussions with the trade unions and proposed solutions or whether it was a unilateral proposal that has been tabled in subsequent negotiations?

### Answer:

The report was the subject of informal discussions as part of the wider consultation with Unison on the Enablement service. Unison asked for the report to be withdrawn. This did not happen, however I gave an undertaking at the Cabinet meeting that the recommendations would not be implemented until Unison had presented a final proposition to the Council. This took place on Thursday 31 January and the Council is now in discussions with Unison on that proposition.

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR ZAKER CHOUDHRY

### "Major Events Budget"

### Question:

In the 2019-2020 budget there is a proposal to "reinstate" the major events budget by £500,000 rising to nearly £1m by 2022. At a time of financial austerity in the City Council, what pressure has made this necessary that could not be funded from elsewhere?

### Answer:

A previous budget decision had reduced the major events budget to nil. Without reinstating an amount into the major events budget there would be a risk to the delivery of established events in the city such as the International Dance Festival, Birmingham Weekender and the mass participation events - the Birmingham 10k and the Birmingham Half Marathon.

In addition, Birmingham would be unable to host international athletics events in the future. Birmingham is one of only 14 cities in the world to host a Diamond League meeting. Such events enhance the reputation and standing of Birmingham in the world.

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR MORRIAM JAN

"Perry Barr Flyover - how many residents consulted?"

### Question:

At the recent Commonwealth Games residents liaison group, the Leader restated his view that the Perry Barr flyover somehow "divides" the Perry Barr community - even though it has substantial open space around it. How many residents has he consulted and found in agreement with him in order to reach this view? (For instance I don't think he gained any support at the meeting I refer to)

### Answer:

On the 12<sup>th</sup> February 2019 Cabinet will recommend a preferred option for highway works in Perry Barr and approve full public consultation in accordance with the Council's governance process. Engagement has taken place with the Ward Councillors, MP, those parties affected by the Compulsory Purchase Order, Walsall and Sandwell Councils, Transport for West Midlands, Department for Transport, Highways England along with the Commonwealth Games Residents Liaison Group and Perry Barr Ward Committee.

The public consultation responses will be reported in the Full Business Case as per normal practice.

## WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR ADAM HIGGS

"Pool Car"

### Question:

In response to written question A16 from 15 January 2019, you said that 12 pool vehicles have 'been identified to date'. If the Council does not know for sure how many vehicles it actually owns or leases, do you at least know if any more been identified since the question was asked at the last meeting?

### Answer:

The Council's Motor Insurance Database records all vehicles that are currently being operated along with their ownership status.

One of the aims of the transport review is to determine if any of the cars/vans operated by Council departments for specific services can be used more widely as pool vehicles for all staff to use.

Of the 12 previously reported vehicles which are pooled within individual directorates, 2 have so far been identified as being available to be used across several directorates. In addition, 7 further vehicles have now been identified as potentially usable Council-wide. This will be determined in March 2019 when the vehicles are due to be replaced.

Work is on-going to seek to identify further Council vehicles currently used by individual directorates which could be made available across the Council as a whole.

**A11** 

### **CITY COUNCIL - 5 FEBRUARY 2019**

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR DEIRDRE ALDEN

"GMB dispute 1"

### Question:

At Cabinet on 15 January you stated that GMB first raised their concerns with you that they had been excluded from talks regarding the settlement of the 2017 waste dispute at the request of Unite. On what date did GMB make you aware of this and when did you then raise it with officers?

### Answer:

I received an email from GMB on  $8^{\text{th}}$  January 2018 which was forwarded to the acting Chief Executive.

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR DAVID BARRIE

"GMB dispute 4"

### Question:

After GMB contacted you to raise their concerns that they were being excluded from talks over the settlement of the 2017 bin dispute did you raise this directly with Unite (if so when)?

### Answer:

The formal discussions with GMB following the settlement in 2017 were conducted through officers within their delegated authority. I have subsequently discussed this issue with Unite during the ongoing ACAS discussions.

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR BOB BEAUCHAMP

"GMB dispute 2"

### Question:

After GMB contacted you to raise their concerns that they were being excluded from talks over the settlement of the 2017 bin dispute did you discuss this with any other Cabinet member (if so who and when)

### Answer:

A meeting was held with GMB on the 31 January 2018 involving myself and Councillor Lisa Trickett. Beyond this, I have no specific recollection of discussing this matter with other Cabinet Members.

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR MATT BENNETT

"GMB dispute 5"

### Question:

Between GMB first raising their concern with you that they were being excluded in talks of the waste dispute, and the final legally binding agreement being agreed at the end of November 2017, what steps were taken to consult with them over the proposed changes?

### Answer:

The legally binding agreement was approved at Cabinet on 24 November 2017.

Exclusion of GMB from discussions immediately prior to this date was not an issue I was involved in. These discussions were at an officer level.

GMB were included in local trade union discussions with officers from December 2017.

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR DEBBIE CLANCY

"GMB dispute 6"

### Question:

Between the Cabinet decision to agree a deal with Unite at the end of November 2017, and the implementation of that deal in September 2018, what steps were taken to consult with GMB on that deal?

### Answer:

All the trades unions were part of the discussions that took place with officers regarding the implementation of the MOU in September 2018.

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR MAUREEN CORNISH

"Waste Dispute"

### Question:

What involvement did the former Cabinet Member for waste, Councillor Majid Mahmood have in any negotiations with any of the unions involved in the waste dispute (including dates)?

### Answer:

Councillor Mahmood was a member of the Joint Service Improvement Board which met once a month. Cllr Mahmood was not involved in any formal negotiations in the Waste dispute.

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR CHARLOTTE HODIVALA

"Waste Governance Review"

Question:

On what date was the Council first provided with a copy of the draft and then final copy of Waste Governance Review carried out by VWV?

Answer:

The City Solicitor was given an initial draft in August 2018 and the final report (as published) was provided on 19 December 2018

**A18** 

### **CITY COUNCIL - 5 FEBRUARY 2019**

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER FROM COUNCILLOR TIM HUXTABLE

"2012 Cabinet Decision"

### Question:

In response to question D11, we were told decisions contained within the 26 March 2012 Cabinet Report 'Fleet and Waste Management – Future Operating Model and Service Redesign' were impacted by subsequent changes within fleet and waste. Some of the decisions in that Cabinet report related to wider workforce issues and not specifically fleet and waste. Can you confirm that they were fully implemented?

### Answer:

It has not been possible to obtain the information requested with the timeframe for written questions A written answer will be provided in due course.

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR BRUCE LINES

### "Waste Contractors"

How many contractors are currently engaged by the Council for waste collections during the dispute (broken down by individual Contractors with the number of FTE, number of wagons and hours per week worked for each contractors)

Answer:

One external contractor is currently engaged during the dispute. There are 10 teams of three working an average 70 hours per week.

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR EWAN MACKEY

### "GMB Exclusion"

Was any legal officer in the room (or consulted at the time) that Unite requested GMB be excluded from discussions over the waste dispute settlement?

### Answer:

I am advised that the Unite negotiations were led by the Corporate Director of Place and the Assistant Director of HR.

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR DAVID PEARS

"Union Negotiations"

### Question:

In response to written question A13 from 15 January 2019, you stated that you have not had any formal discussions with ACAS or any Trade Unions without an officer present. How many informal discussions have you had with any of them regarding the waste or enablement disputes, either face to face or by telephone\text, without an officer present?

### Answer:

The nature of an informal meeting means that they are not recorded and are not a route to decision making. Informal meetings have taken place with the full knowledge of BCC officers.

**A22** 

### **CITY COUNCIL - 5 FEBRUARY 2019**

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR GARY SAMBROOK

### "Unlawful Strike Action"

On what date were you first advised that the Industrial Action by Unite may be unlawful?

Answer:

At the end of December 2018.

**A23** 

### **CITY COUNCIL - 5 FEBRUARY 2019**

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR RON STORER

### "Waste Contractors 2"

What monitoring does the Council have in place for the contractors currently in place as part of contingency arrangements during the waste industrial dispute to ensure appropriate performance levels and compliance with expectations around health and safety etc?

### Answer:

Our contract is with the external contractor. The City Council issues the work and monitors the progress via the number of roads completed and tonnage collected. The contractor monitors compliance to their health and safety procedures which are shared with the City Council.

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR PETER FOWLER

"2012 Cabinet Decision 2"

### Question:

With reference to the response to Question D11 from January Council, given this was now 6 years ago and you have confirmed that at least some of the recommendations were not taken forward following the change in Administration shortly after, they would no longer be private and confidential. Can all recommendations decided on in the private report of March 2012 but not implemented now please be published, along with any others that, due to the passage of time are no longer classified as confidential?

### Answer:

It has not been possible to obtain the information requested with the timeframe for written questions. A written answer will be provided in due course.

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR EDDIE FREEMAN

"Flexibility in waste"

### Question:

When the agreement with Unite was made in November 2017, introducing the new role of WRCO, we were told that this post would be flexible and could be redeployed across the city as needed to target areas where recycling needed greater attention. Indeed it is reasonable to presume that this was a reason why the post reported to the assistant service manager rather than to the Drivers as previously. The response to written question D18 to Council on 15 January confirms that it is actually a requirement under the legally binding agreement for a WRCO to be on each wagon that leaves the depot. Given the previously expressed desire for flexibility in deploying WRCOs, as well as the easily anticipated impact on the ability of waste collections crews to complete rounds during periods of high sickness or industrial action (i.e. pretty much constantly) — why was it made a condition of the legal agreement to bind the composition of each wagon in this way?

### Answer:

The decision was made to resolve the dispute at the time and that each area of the city could benefit with this role being active in their neighbourhood.

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE DEPUTY LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR EWAN MACKEY

### "FOI Disclosure Log"

At the last full council meeting we were informed that an FOI request had been submitted by Unite regarding their dispute over the GMB payments, we were also told that this FOI request was refused by the Council. Why is a copy of the refusal notice not on the Council's FOI disclosure log?

### Answer:

The Council's response is now available on the disclosure log which can be found here:

https://www.birmingham.gov.uk/info/20154/foi and data protection/1349/view freed om of information responses

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE DEPUTY LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR SIMON MORRALL

"Brexit Commission"

Question:

How much has the Council spent on its 'Brexit Commission'?

Answer:

There were no direct costs associated with leading the Brexit Commission itself as this was managed through the investment of relevant Officer and Member time.

There was a cost of £18, 565 related to the research, design and production of the 'Brexit Impact Report – Initial Analysis' which was externally commissioned but managed through the Commission.

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR EDUCATION, SKILLS AND CULTURE FROM COUNCILLOR KEN WOOD

### "Concerned about staff welfare and reduction in library services"

On a library by library basis can you list those locations where minimum staffing levels have been reduced and what changes to services/amenities have been made to enable this reduction to happen - again on a library by library basis.

### Answer:

The contracted staffing levels have not reduced from the level approved by Cabinet in 2017. In April 2018, the amount of staff increased by 8 fte to enable the service to deliver the assisted digital support service and in 2019/20 there are plans to increase the staffing levels by a further 5 fte.

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR EDUCATION, SKILLS AND CULTURE FROM COUNCILLOR DEIRDRE ALDEN

### "School Crossing Patrols 1"

How many school crossing patrol posts have been recruited to in each of the last 6 years?

### Answer:

The number of new starters in each financial year is as follows:

- April 2012 March 2013 = 20
- April 2013 March 2014 = 6
- April 2014 March 2015 = 25
- April 2015 March 2016 = 12
- April 2016 March 2017 = 21
- April 2017 March 2018 = 14

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR EDUCATION, SKILLS AND CULTURE FROM COUNCILLOR BOB BEAUCHAMP

### "School Crossing Patrols 2"

How many school crossing patrols posts have become vacant in each of the last 6 years?

### Answer:

Prior to 2015/16 the service was devolved to Districts and they determined which sites should be recruited to – the total number of crossings that became vacant in each financial year, including those equipped with pedestrian lights and those to which recruitment may not have been funded, is as follows:

- 2012/13 37
- 2013/14 42
- 2014/15 30

Since 2015/16 the number of Priority1 sites that became vacant during each financial year is as follows:

- 2015/16 25
- 2016/17 13
- 2017/18 23

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR EDUCATION, SKILLS AND CULTURE FROM COUNCILLOR PETER FOWLER

### "School Places"

For each of the last 3 years for each school in the City where distance from home is a criteria for admission, what was the maximum qualifying distance for a school place in Reception or Year 7?

Answer:

Thank you for your question.

Information on the final maximum qualifying distance for a school place in reception class and year 7 for each of the last three academic years is compiled and held by Birmingham City Council. This information is published on a n annual basis on the Council's website and is available for the last three years. This approach assists parent/carers in making an informed decision when submitting their preferences for a place in reception class or year 7.

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR EDUCATION, SKILLS AND CULTURE FROM COUNCILLOR ADAM HIGGS

### "School Crossing Patrols 3"

What was the total spend on school crossing patrols in each of the last 6 years?

### Answer:

Prior to 2015/16 the service was devolved to Districts and the level of spend on school crossing patrols was for them to determine – the net spend on the service in each financial year is as follows:

2012/13 - £1,212,993 2013/14 - £1,151,208 2014/15 - £853,672

Since 2015/16 the net spend on the school crossing patrol service in each financial year is as follows:

2015/16 - £945,158 2016/17 - £982,689 2017/18 - £966,633

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR FINANCE AND RESOURCES FROM COUNCILLOR EDDIE FREEMAN

### "Policy Department"

What is the total annual cost of the Council's policy department?

Answer:

The total annual cost of the Council's policy department in 2018/19 is £0.741m

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR FINANCE AND RESOURCES FROM COUNCILLOR EWAN MACKEY

### "Communications Department"

What is the total annual cost of the Council's communications department?

Answer:

The total annual cost of the Council's communications department in 2018/19 is £1.594m

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR FINANCE AND RESOURCES FROM COUNCILLOR BRUCE LINES

### "In-house lawyers"

How many lawyers does the council directly employ by grade, with the total cost (including on-costs) for each grade?

### Answer:

Directly Employed (Payroll) Lawyers 2019				
Grade	Headcount	Sum of FTE	Salary inc On-costs @ 40%	
GR4	15	14.4	£	631,753
GR5	34	29.6	£	1,864,246
GR6	19	16.3	£	1,270,783
GR7	5	4.9	£	437,888
JNC	2	2.0	£	259,811
Total	75	67.2	£	4,464,480

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR HEALTH AND SOCIAL CARE FROM COUNCILLOR ROGER HARMER

"Enablement Workers Dispute - Home Care Workers"

### Question:

At the Cabinet meeting on 22nd January 2019 the Cabinet Member was congratulated for her work in proposing a compromise, tabled at the meeting on that day, in the enablement workers' dispute. Two days later the Hall Green Labour Party Executive agreed a resolution stating: "We are disappointed that Birmingham City Council has continued to pursue reducing hours of low paid Home Care workers. We ask strongly that they reconsider their direction and negotiate with Unison to resolve the matter. We also commend the Councillors who have shown solidary and support to the Home Care Workers, demonstrating what real Labour values are".

Does the Cabinet Member feel that the Labour administration is supported by the Councillors referred to in this resolution?

### Answer:

As in all parties, we are all individuals and have our own opinions but we all passionate about Labour values.

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR HEALTH AND SOCIAL CARE FROM COUNCILLOR PETER FOWLER

### "Fairways"

Since the Court Order of 1 November 2018, preventing the council from taking any further steps to close the Fairways Day Centre, how many new service users have been referred to the Day Centre and how many service users have left?

### Answer:

The Consent Order was signed by both parties on 12th December and was lodged at Court by way of a letter dated 14th December 2018. However, Legal have advised that a Consent Order only takes effect upon being approved by a Judge and then stamped with the court seal. BCC has not yet received a sealed order from the Court.

Following the Consent Order preventing the council from closing the Fairways Day Centre:

- A letter dated 14<sup>th</sup> December from the Head of Service was sent to service users, carers and advocates informing them of the Consent Order, and that the proposed closure of Fairways would not be going ahead
- There have been no new referrals to Fairways Day Centre from November 2018
- 3 service users left in November 2018 and 1 service user left in January 2019.
- The introduction of the "three conversations" social care model is resulting in a reduction of referrals to formal care services including placements at day centres. Social workers are continually looking at different ways to meet people's needs and achieve their outcomes including taking an asset based approach in line with the requirements of the Care Act.

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR HEALTH AND SOCIAL CARE FROM COUNCILLOR GARETH MOORE

### "Enablement Benchmarking"

Your answer to written question G6 on 15 January, provided comparisons of costs per hour of the current Enablement service, with the model proposed at that time and external benchmarks. The cost per hour of the proposed service was given as £46 per hour, what is the cost per hour of the proposed service based on the changes agreed at the Cabinet Meeting of 22 January?

### Answer:

The revised rota proposed in the Cabinet report on January 22<sup>nd</sup>, could increase the cost of the service by approximately £3 per hour, depending on the rota choices of employees.

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR HEALTH AND SOCIAL CARE FROM COUNCILLOR SUZANNE WEBB

### "Enablement Benchmarking Carers"

Have you carried out any benchmarking to determine how many different carers an Enablement service user in other local authorities would typically see in one week? (If so please provide the average and best in class)

### Answer:

We have not carried out benchmarking on this issue.

It is worth noting that there are no national datasets on this issue and that the design and practice of enablement services varies greatly across the country. This would make meaningful benchmarking difficult.

# WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR TRANSPORT AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR MORRIAM JAN

"Perry Barr Flyover - scrutiny inquiry"

### Question:

Individual Councillors, such as myself, have been briefed on the "modelling" that lies behind the proposal to remove the Perry Barr flyover. However, we have not been offered any opportunity to reflect on the briefings we received. Given that, on reflection, it is quite clear the modelling is based on false premises and that thousands of people have signed the petition to save it, will the Cabinet Member agree to a scrutiny inquiry into the proposals so that the local Councillors can present and have assessed a reasonable alternative?

### Answer:

The traffic modelling information presented to Councillor Jan and other Ward Councillors who accepted the invitation to the meetings to discuss the proposals covers the three options considered for the A34 / A453 and A34 / A4040 junctions. The decision on which option is to be taken forward to consultation will be made by Cabinet on 12 February 2019. The briefing to Councillor Jan took place on 24 January, however the briefings with the other Ward Councillors were on the 7 and 8 January thereby giving several weeks to reflect on the options and modelling information discussed.

The modelling has been undertaken by an external consultant and each option assessed in the morning and afternoon peaks and on a Saturday using the same base traffic data.

In the event the Cabinet Report is 'called in' and subject to scrutiny I will provide responses to any questions raised.