



**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF BIRMINGHAM CITY COUNCIL HELD  
ON TUESDAY 12 SEPTEMBER 2017 AT 1400 HOURS IN THE COUNCIL  
CHAMBER, COUNCIL HOUSE, BIRMINGHAM**

**PRESENT**:- Lord Mayor (Councillor Anne Underwood) in the Chair after the break.  
Deputy Lord Mayor (Councillor Carl Rice) in the Chair until the break.

**Councillors**

Muhammad Afzal	Mohammed Fazal	Bruce Lines
Uzma Ahmed	Mick Finnegan	John Lines
Deirdre Alden	Des Flood	Mary Locke
John Alden	Carole Griffiths	Ewan Mackey
Robert Alden	Peter Griffiths	Majid Mahmood
Tahir Ali	Paulette Hamilton	Karen McCarthy
Sue Anderson	Andrew Hardie	Gareth Moore
Gurdial Singh Atwal	Roger Harmer	Yvonne Mosquito
Mohammed Azim	Kath Hartley	Brett O'Reilly
David Barrie	Barry Henley	John O'Shea
Bob Beauchamp	Des Hughes	David Pears
Kate Booth	Jon Hunt	Robert Pocock
Steve Booton	Shabrana Hussain	Victoria Quinn
Sir Albert Bore	Timothy Huxtable	Hendrina Quinnen
Barry Bowles	Mohammed Idrees	Habib Rehman
Randal Brew	Zafar Iqbal	Fergus Robinson
Marje Bridle	Ziaul Islam	Gary Sambrook
Mick Brown	Morriam Jan	Rob Sealey
Alex Buchanan	Kerry Jenkins	Mike Sharpe
Andy Cartwright	Meirion Jenkins	Sybil Spence
Tristan Chatfield	Simon Jevon	Claire Spencer
Zaker Choudhry	Julie Johnson	Stewart Stacey
Debbie Clancy	Brigid Jones	Sharon Thompson
Liz Clements	Carol Jones	Paul Tilsley
Lyn Collin	Josh Jones	Karen Trench
Maureen Cornish	Nagina Kauser	Lisa Trickett
John Cotton	Tony Kennedy	Margaret Waddington
Basharat Dad	Ansar Ali Khan	Ian Ward
Phil Davis	Changese Khan	Mike Ward
Diane Donaldson	Mariam Khan	Fiona Williams
Peter Douglas Osborn	Narinder Kaur Kooner	Alex Yip
Barbara Dring	Chaman Lal	Waseem Zaffar

**City Council – 12 September 2017**

Neil Eustace

Mike Leddy

\*\*\*\*\*

**NOTICE OF RECORDING**

18888 The Deputy Lord Mayor advised that the meeting would be webcast for live and subsequent broadcasting via the Council's internet site and that members of the Press/Public may record and take photographs except where there are confidential or exempt items.

---

**INTERIM APPOINTMENT OF LEADER OF THE COUNCIL**

The Deputy Lord Mayor advised the meeting that following yesterday's resignation of Councillor John Clancy as Leader of the Council, he was to call upon Councillor Stewart Stacey to move an appropriate Motion which was seconded by Councillor Brigid Jones.

The Motion having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

Here upon a poll being demanded the voting, with names listed in seat number order, was as follows:-

(See document No 1)

NB The documents have been amended to show that Councillor Ian Cruise had not taken part in the voting as he was not in attendance.

Therefore, the total results referred to in the interleave should read:-

Yes – 58 (For the Motion);

No – 25 (Against the Motion);

Abstain – 8 (Abstentions).

It was therefore –

18889 **RESOLVED:-**

That the City Council confirms the interim appointment of Councillor Ian Ward as Leader of the Council pending a permanent appointment at a future meeting.

---

**MINUTES**

It was moved by the Deputy Lord Mayor, seconded and –

18890 **RESOLVED:-**

That the Minutes of the meeting of the City Council held on 11 July 2017, having been printed and a copy sent to each Member of the Council, be taken as read and confirmed and signed.

---

**LORD MAYOR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS**

18891 There were no announcements to be made.

---

**PETITIONS**

**Petitions Relating to City Council Functions Presented at the Meeting**

The following petitions were presented:-

(See document No 2)

In accordance with the proposals by the Members presenting the petitions, it was moved by the Deputy Lord Mayor, seconded and -

18892 **RESOLVED:-**

That the petitions be received and referred to the relevant Chief Officers.

---

**Petitions Update**

The following Petitions Update was submitted:-

(See document No 3)

It was moved by the Deputy Lord Mayor, seconded and -

18893 **RESOLVED:-**

That the Petitions Update be noted and those petitions for which a satisfactory response has been received, be discharged.

---

**QUESTION TIME**

18894 The Council proceeded to consider Oral Questions in accordance with Standing Order 9

Details of the questions asked are available for public inspection via the Webcast.

## **City Council – 12 September 2017**

During question time Councillor Gareth Moore as a point of order asked if the unallocated time for parts A and B (30 Minutes) could be allocated to parts C and D. The Deputy Lord Mayor indicated that he generally did that at all meetings.

At the conclusion of part C of oral questions Councillor Jon Hunt queried why the written questions and answers had not been circulated around the Chamber. The Deputy Lord Mayor indicated that the questions were still been printed and following further consideration the Deputy Lord Mayor indicated that he would adjourn the meeting to allow time for the written questions to be circulated/emailed to Members.

At 1450 the meeting was adjourned.

At 1520 the meeting was reconvened.

At the invitation of the Deputy Lord Mayor, the Interim Leader, in response to a question from Councillor Sir Albert Bore seeking clarification as to the accuracy of the answers to the questions, explained that the answers given to the questions in section A had been provided by the former Leader. He particularly drew Members attention to the answer to written question A1 which he believed was factually incorrect.

Councillor Stewart Stacey sought guidance as he felt that that the answer to written question A1 was in variance with the answer he had provided in written question J1 and verbally to Councillor Alex Yipp earlier in the meeting which could be used against him in the future. The Deputy Lord Mayor indicated that any Member who had similar concerns should email the City Solicitor who would advise on any action that needed to be taken.

Question time continued.

---

### **APPOINTMENTS BY THE COUNCIL**

The following schedule was submitted:-

(See document No 4)

The Interim Leader, Councillor Ian Ward, responded to queries from Councillors Randal Brew and Robert Alden relating to when he intended to appoint a Deputy Leader.

There being no further nominations it was -

18895 **RESOLVED:-**

That the following persons be appointed until the Annual Meeting of the City Council in 2018 as set below:-

<b><u>Body</u></b>	<b><u>Representative</u></b>
<b><u>Independent Remuneration Panel</u></b>	David Grainger to be reappointed for the term of office 1 September 2017 – 31 August 2021.
<b><u>Schools, Children’s and Families Overview and Scrutiny Committee</u></b>	Councillor Mike Sharpe to replace Councillor Nagina Kauser for the remainder of the 2017/2018 Municipal Year.  Adam Hardy to replace Richard Potter as the Roman Catholic Diocese representative.
<b><u>Association of Councillors</u></b>	Councillor Diane Donaldson to replace Councillor Julie Johnson for the period ending May 2020.

---

**EXEMPTION FROM STANDING ORDERS**

18896 The Deputy Lord Mayor advised that there were no exemption from Standing Orders required.

---

**REPORT OF THE OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

**The Impact of Poor Air Quality on Health**

The following report of the Health and Social Care and Economy, Skills and Transport Overview and Scrutiny Committees together with a commentary from the Executive was submitted:-

(See document No 5)

Councillor John Cotton moved the motion which was seconded by Councillor Sue Anderson:-

In accordance with Council Standing Orders, Councillors Timothy Huxtable and Robert Alden gave notice of the following amendment to the Motion:-

(See document No 6)

Councillor Timothy Huxtable moved the amendment, which was seconded by Councillor Robert Alden.

A debate ensued.

Councillor John Cotton replied to the debate.

The amendment having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be lost.

Here upon a poll being demanded the voting, with names listed in seat number order, was as follows:-

(See document No 7)

NB The documents have been amended to show that Councillor Barry Henley had voted against the amendment and had not abstained.

Therefore, the total results referred to in the interleave should read:-

Yes – 26 (For the amendment);

No – 60 (Against the amendment);

Abstain – 4 (Abstentions).

The Motion having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

It was therefore -

18897 **RESOLVED:-**

That recommendations R01 to R15 be approved, and that the Executive be requested to pursue their implementation.

---

### **ADJOURNMENT**

It was moved by the Deputy Lord Mayor, seconded and

18898 **RESOLVED:-**

That the Council be adjourned until 1730 hours on this day.

The Council then adjourned at 1705 hours.

At 1730 hours the Council resumed at the point where the meeting had been adjourned.

The Lord Mayor, Councillor Anne Underwood, assumed the Chair for the remainder of the meeting. She noted that she had just come from a successful ceremony with His Royal Highness the Duke of Gloucester presenting MBEs and BEMs and all involved had been impressed with the Council house and how they had been treated.

**MOTIONS FOR DEBATE FROM INDIVIDUAL MEMBERS**

The Council proceeded to consider the Motions of which notice had been given in accordance with Standing Order 4(1).

Prior to beginning the item Councillor Alex Yip rose on a point of order and asked whether, given the involvement of Unite in the matter to be discussed, Members should declare an interest in accordance with Departments for Communities and Local Government's guidance 'Openness and Transparency on Personal interests'.

The Lord Mayor indicated that Members would indeed have to declare an interest if they were in a union and a pecuniary interest if they had received funding for elections. The Lord Mayor asked for the following motion to be moved and seconded:-

"That, in accordance with paragraph 6 (2) of the Constitution relating to the declaration of interests, page 73, and paragraph 14 regarding dispensations, page 78, that those Members of Council who are members of Unite the union be granted a dispensation approved in the case of urgency by the Independent Chair, Peter Wiseman, in order that they can participate in debate and vote where appropriate at full Council. The grounds for this dispensation are that the representation of different political groups on the decision making body would be so upset as to alter the likely vote on the matter before it."

The Lord Mayor responded appropriately to queries from Councillor Robert Alden and the Interim Leader Councillor Ian Ward.

Councillor Sir Albert Bore moved the Motion which was seconded by Councillor Paul Tilsley.

The Motion having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

It was therefore -

18899

**RESOLVED:-**

That, in accordance with paragraph 6 (2) of the Constitution relating to the declaration of interests, page 73, and paragraph 14 regarding dispensations, page 78, that those Members of Council who are members of Unite the union be granted a dispensation approved in the case of urgency by the Independent Chair, Peter Wiseman, in order that they can participate in debate and vote where appropriate at full Council. The grounds for this dispensation are that the representation of different political groups on the decision making body would be so upset as to alter the likely vote on the matter before it.

Members then declared interests as follows

**City Council – 12 September 2017**

<b>Councillor</b>	<b>Union</b>	<b>Interest</b>
Carl Rice	Unite	Non-Pecuniary
Ian Ward	Unite	Pecuniary-in a number of trade unions
Mohammed Idrees	Unite	Non-Pecuniary
Hendrina Quinnen	Unite	Non-Pecuniary
Gurdial Singh Atwal	Unite	Non-Pecuniary
Chaman Lal	Unite	Non-Pecuniary
Rob Pocock	Unite	Non-Pecuniary
Zafar Iqbal	Unite	Non-Pecuniary
Lisa Trickett	GBM	Possible Pecuniary-partner is a Director of firm taking trade union legal action
Brigid Jones	Unite	Non-Pecuniary
Mary Lock	Unison	Pecuniary-Election campaign funding
Tony Kennedy	Unite	Non-Pecuniary
Andy Cartwright	Unite	Non-Pecuniary
Waseem Zaffar	Unite	Non-Pecuniary
Claire Spencer	Unite	Non-Pecuniary
Kath Hartley	Unite	Non-Pecuniary
John O'Shea	Unite	Pecuniary-2012 election campaign
Barbara Dring	GMB	Non-Pecuniary
Mike Leddy	Unite	Pecuniary-Part funded election campaign
Diane Donaldson	Unite/Unison	Non-Pecuniary
Majid Mahmood	Unite	Non-Pecuniary
Stewart Stacey	Unite	Non-Pecuniary
Karen McCarthy	Unison	Pecuniary-2012 election campaign
Mick Brown	Unite	Non-Pecuniary
Ansar Ali Khan	Unite	Non-Pecuniary
Tristan Chatfield	Unite	Pecuniary-2012 election campaign
Josh Jones	Unite	Non-Pecuniary-Indicated that his girlfriend was in Unison and he had been Jack Dromey MP's election agent in 2015 and 2017 and the MP worked for Unite
Carole Griffiths	GMB	Non-Pecuniary
Peter Griffiths	GMB	Non-Pecuniary
Marje Bridle	Unison	Non-Pecuniary
Ziaul Islam	Unison	Non-Pecuniary
Mick Finnegan	Unison	Non-Pecuniary
Liz Clements	Unison	Non-Pecuniary

**A. Councillors Deidre Alden and Gary Sambrook have given notice of the following Motion:-**

(See document No 8)

Councillor Deidre Alden moved the Motion, which was seconded by Councillor Gary Sambrook.

In accordance with Council Standing Orders, Councillors Robert Alden and Randal Brew gave notice of the following amendment to the Motion:-

(See document No 9)

Councillor Robert Alden moved the amendment which was seconded by Councillor Randal Brew.

In accordance with Council Standing Orders, Councillors Roger Harmer and Neil Eustace gave notice of the following amendment to the Motion:-

(See document No 10)

Councillor Roger Harmer moved the amendment which was seconded by Councillor Neil Eustace.

In accordance with Council Standing Orders, Councillors Ian Ward and Lisa Trickett gave notice of the following amendment to the Motion:-

(See document No 11)

Councillor Ian Ward moved the amendment which was seconded by Councillor Lisa Trickett.

A debate ensued.

**THE QUESTION BE NOW PUT**

Councillor Diane Donaldson proposed the following Motion which was seconded:-

‘That the question be now put.’

The Motion having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried and it was-

18900

**RESOLVED:-**

That the question be now put.

Councillor Deirdre Alden replied to the debate.

The first amendment having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be lost.

## City Council – 12 September 2017

Here upon a poll being demanded the voting, with names listed in seat number order, was as follows:-

(See document No 12)

The total results referred to in the interleave are:-

Yes – 33 (For the amendment);

No – 59 (Against the amendment);

Abstain – 0 (Abstentions).

The second amendment having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be lost.

The third amendment having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

The Motion as amended having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

It was therefore -

18901 **RESOLVED:-**

The Council recognises that a key priority for citizens of Birmingham is cleaner streets.

The Council further recognises that the resolution of the current industrial dispute is essential for achieving cleaner streets in Birmingham.

---

### **EXTENSION OF TIME**

18902 Councillor Mike Ward proposed the following Motion which was seconded:-

‘That the time for consideration of the item be extended by 15 minutes.’

The Motion having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be lost.

**B. Councillors Paul Tilsley and Jon Hunt have given notice of the following Motion:-**

(See document No 13)

Councillor Paul Tilsley moved the Motion, which was seconded by Councillor Jon Hunt

A debate ensued.

## City Council – 12 September 2017

Councillor Paul Tilsley replied to the debate.

The Motion having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

It was therefore –

18903 **RESOLVED:-**

This Council believes that much of the atmospheric pollution is caused during morning and evening "rush hours" and could be eased if motorists switched off their engines, when at traffic lights, known traffic problem sites and parents waiting to pick up children from school.

It will support a campaign in the following terms:

Stopped for more than a minute!

Don't be an idler, switch off your engine when stationary, loading or waiting at the roadside. Do the right thing, help to make Birmingham greener, save lives and put a stop to idling engines and atmospheric pollution.

---

The meeting ended at 1858 hours.

## **APPENDIX**

Questions and replies in accordance with Standing Order 9(A).

### **WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR ZAKER CHOUDHRY**

#### **A1 ACAS Statement - which Cabinet members were involved**

##### **Question:**

**The ACAS statement of Wednesday, 16th August 2017, states that "Birmingham City Council Cabinet members have agreed in principle..." Which other Cabinet members were involved?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

Every Cabinet Member was involved in reaching the agreement in principle.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
PAUL TILSLEY**

**A2 Decision Letter to Depot Managers from Leader**

**Question:**

**Can the Leader confirm reports that he signed a letter to depot managers on August 18th referring to a 'decision' of the City Cabinet the previous evening, indicating, if so, where and when this Cabinet meeting took place?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

The email referred to an informal meeting of Cabinet Members, not a formal Cabinet Committee meeting.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
ROGER HARMER**

**A3     Discussions with Unite**

**Question:**

**Could the Leader give details of when he had discussions with Unite between 16th August and 1st September, stating what other individuals were involved eg ACAS arbitrators?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

I was not personally involved in discussions between these dates.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
JON HUNT**

**A4     Discussions with Unite Officials**

**Question:**

**Could the Leader state what discussions he had with Unite officials between 16th August and 1st September?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

I was not personally involved in discussions between these dates.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
SUE ANDERSON**

**A5 Low Figure for Clearing Rubbish**

**Question:**

**According to the paper tabled to Cabinet on 24th August, and not discussed by Cabinet, the Council spent just £21,000 a week during July in clearing the rubbish left by the refuse collectors' strike from the streets. Does he consider this rather low figure suggests his response to crisis was extremely slow?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

Please see answer E31 in response to your question.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
EWAN MACKEY**

**A6 Commonwealth Games**

**Question:**

**On 15 August 2017, a late report on the Commonwealth Games was submitted to Cabinet with no reasons for lateness or urgency listed in the heading of the report. According to Section B12 1B of the Constitution the Chair of the meeting should use this information ‘to decide if special circumstances for lateness do exist as outlined in the heading to the report and proceed if appropriate or otherwise postpone consideration of the report to the next meeting.’**

**In the absence of the relevant public information in the heading of the report in accordance with the Constitution, how did you as Chair of the Cabinet Committee reach your decision to allow this report to proceed?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

As stated by Deputy Leader at the Cabinet meeting, the reason for urgency and lateness was set out in paragraph 1.9 of the report.

The deadline we were working to for the submission of bids was imminent, and what a good job we managed to take the report through when we did, or we might not have had the wonderful news we received on Thursday 7<sup>th</sup> September that Birmingham has successfully been chosen as the UK city to go through to the next round! I am sure you will join me in congratulating the team involved in our successful bid.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
ROBERT ALDEN**

**A7     Meetings**

**Question:**

**How many times and on what dates have you met personally with Unite the Union to discuss a resolution to the current industrial action within the waste collection service?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

In order to attempt to resolve a very difficult industrial dispute, I spoke on a number of occasions with union officials at both a local and national level.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR JOHN ALDEN**

**A8     Legal Advice**

**Question:**

**What was the cost of the legal advice the Leader sought from David Lock QC?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

The final bill for external legal costs will be reported in due course

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
LYN COLLIN**

**A9 Equal Pay Liabilities**

**Question:**

**On what dates since January 2017 have you been provided with briefings on the potential for equal pay liabilities in relation to reorganisation of the waste collection service?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

I have been provided with briefings on equal pay liabilities stemming from the 2011 waste management reorganisation approved by the former Conservative/Liberal Democrat coalition - the most recent and detailed of which was provided on 29 August 2017.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
GARY SAMBROOK**

**A10 Disciplinary Hearings**

**Question:**

**On taking office, the Leader promised the Improvement Panel and the Council that his leadership style would be more outward looking and strategic, giving the Chief Executive and senior managers the space and responsibility to manage delivery of the Council's agreed plans and day to day business. Does he believe that decisions over the disciplinary proceeding against an individual member of staff fall into the category of 'outward looking and strategic' or 'day to day business'?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

Attempting to resolve a difficult industrial dispute falls into both categories.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
DAVID BARRIE**

**A11    Legal Advice 2**

**Question:**

**With whom has the legal advice that the Leader sought from David Lock QC regarding the industrial dispute been shared?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

With Cabinet Members and senior management.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
BOB BEAUCHAMP**

**A12 Confidential Information**

**Question:**

**Will the Leader publish the legal advice provided to him by David Lock QC regarding the industrial dispute? If the advice is subject to Legal Professional Privilege and so cannot be made available publicly, can he share it with elected Members on a confidential basis?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

This advice is confidential and subject to legal and professional privilege.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
DES FLOOD**

**A13    Framework**

**Question:**

**What procurement framework/process was used to commission the legal advice from David Lock QC?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

There is no information available on this at this time.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
ANDREW HARDIE**

**A14 Council Matters**

**Question:**

**Has the Leader sought any other\* legal advice regarding Council matters without going through the Council's legal team? (\*other than that from David Lock QC regarding the current industrial action within the waste collection service.)**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

No.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
DEIRDRE ALDEN**

**A15    ACAS Meetings**

**Question:**

**How many meetings, out of how many held in total, between the Council and ACAS have you attended personally?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

Meetings are ongoing. I have personally met with ACAS officials twice.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
TIMOTHY HUXTABLE**

**A16 Report on Waste Collection**

**Question:**

**How many hours before the Cabinet meeting of 24 August 2017 did you first discuss with any other Cabinet Member or Officer your intention to seek to defer the report on waste collection, which members of the press, public, unions and staff groups had travelled to the council house to see discussed?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

A meeting took place between Cabinet Members and Counsel in the two hours prior to the start of the Cabinet meeting on 24 August. It was decided that, to properly reflect on the advice given at that meeting, it would be necessary to defer the report.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
SIMON JEVON**

**A17    Statements**

**Question:**

**Given the numerous statements from Unite praising you for the 'deal' they believe had been struck, and further criticising the Chief Executive for trying to 'scupper' that deal, why did you not make any statement until the 1 September saying that no such deal had been agreed and that Unite were wilfully misinterpreting your position?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

Birmingham City Council issued a statement regarding the agreement in principle on Wednesday 16 August 2017.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
BRUCE LINES**

**A18    Deal**

**Question:**

**Given the numerous statements from Unite praising you for the 'deal' they believe had been struck, and further criticising the Chief Executive for trying to 'scupper' that deal, did you at any point prior to 1 September contact Unite or ACAS personally to clarify your position?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

Birmingham City Council issued a statement regarding the agreement in principle on Wednesday 16 August 2017.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR JOHN LINES**

**A19    Minutes**

**Question:**

**Were minutes taken of your meeting with Unite and ACAS and if so will you publish these so that the public can decide for themselves whether Unite 'wilfully misinterpreted' what you offered?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

I personally did not take minutes.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
GARETH MOORE**

**A20    Statements**

**Question:**

**When Unite issued statements praising you and criticising the chief executive for the report originally published for the cabinet meeting on 24 August, did you personally at any point prior to 1 September, privately or publicly contact Unite to defend the Chief Executive and ask them to withdraw their 'scandalous' attacks against her? Please include when and what was said.**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

I personally spoke to the interim Chief Executive, making it clear that I found the personal criticism unacceptable.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
DAVID PEARS**

**A21    Interview**

**Question:**

**Your Cabinet Member stated in a BBC interview on the bin strike that the 'deal agreed was regrettable' but speaking to the same broadcaster 2 hours later you stated the 'deal was never there.' Who was correct?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

Having checked a transcript of the interview, I do not agree the Cabinet Member said that the agreement in principle was regrettable.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
FERGUS ROBINSON**

**A22 Meeting**

**Question:**

**Following your meeting with ACAS and Unite on 16 August what specifically did you feedback to officers on what had been agreed? Please include the exact wording used to ensure your message cannot be misinterpreted (wilfully or otherwise).**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

Birmingham City Council cabinet members have agreed in principle that the grade 3 posts will be maintained. Consequently there are no redundancy steps in place.

In addition the parties will now look to discuss, through ACAS, how the service can be improved, with the intention of improving efficiencies in performance of the bin collection service generally, including what savings can be made, and specifically how best the current Grade 3 roles can now be maintained and developed so that they take forward the ambition to deliver cleaner streets and align to wider Total Place principles.

Unite have also agreed in principle to recommend to their members work pattern changes, including consideration of a 5 day working week. Both parties agree the working week should be designed to maximise service delivery.

To assist in the resolution of outstanding issues both parties will go to ACAS.

These discussions will be with the intention of incorporating any agreement as an amendment to the Waste Management Service Cabinet Report in September 2017.

Both parties are pleased to be recommencing industrial relations and pleased that the bin collection can resume without disruption.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
ROB SEALEY**

**A23    Wording**

**Question:**

**Following your meeting with ACAS and Unite on 16 August what specifically did you feedback to other Cabinet members on what had been agreed? Please include the exact wording used to ensure your message cannot be misinterpreted (wilfully or otherwise).**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

Birmingham City Council and Unite the Union have today made sufficient progress in their talks for the Shop Stewards to pause industrial action.

Birmingham City Council cabinet members have agreed in principle that the grade 3 posts will be maintained. Consequently there are no redundancy steps in place.

In addition the parties will now look to discuss, through ACAS, how the service can be improved, with the intention of improving efficiencies in performance of the bin collection service generally, including what savings can be made, and specifically how best the current Grade 3 roles can now be maintained and developed so that they take forward the ambition to deliver cleaner streets and align to wider Total Place principles.

Unite have also agreed in principle to recommend to their members work pattern changes, including consideration of a 5 day working week. Both parties agree the working week should be designed to maximise service delivery.

To assist in the resolution of outstanding issues both parties will go to ACAS.

These discussions will be with the intention of incorporating any agreement as an amendment to the Waste Management Service Cabinet Report in September 2017.

Both parties are pleased to be recommencing industrial relations and pleased that the bin collection can resume without disruption.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
RON STORER**

**A24    Video**

**Question:**

**Your video put out on the 1st Sept states the agreement agreed with ACAS was merely an agreement to 'sit round a table and talk'. From the Acas agreement on 16th August and 1st Sept please list all meetings you held with Acas and or unite including dates and length of meetings and who attended?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

Several meetings were held between Birmingham City Council, ACAS and/or Unite between 16 August and 1 September. The meetings were attended by a number of council, union and ACAS officials.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
MEIRION JENKINS**

**A25    E-mail**

**Question:**

**Your email to the depot managers of 18 August, leaked to the media, which instructed them to reinstate the suspended worker immediately referred to 'unusual circumstances' that meant you had to instruct them yourself rather than going through the senior officers as is normal protocol. What were those 'unusual circumstances' specifically?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

Efforts to resolve an industrial dispute do not constitute 'business as usual'. I was acting on legal advice.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
KEN WOOD**

**A26    Communication**

**Question:**

**Prior to emailing the depot manager in 18 August instructing them to reinstate the suspended worker, did you first communicate with other officers? If so please provide a copy of that communication along with their response.**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

I did contact senior officers. As the communication concerns an ongoing disciplinary matter it would not be appropriate to make it public.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
RANDAL BREW**

**A27 Statement**

**Question:**

**Did you personally agree – prior to its release - the statement put out by Acas on the 16 August regarding the agreement reached?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

Yes.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
PETER DOUGLAS OSBORN**

**A28    Improvement Panel Letter**

**Question:**

**Since the last letter from the Improvement Panel to the Secretary of State on 4 August, what has been the nature and content of any conversations you have had with the panel, or any members of it, regarding the industrial dispute with Unite?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

No such conversations have taken place.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
MARGARET WADDINGTON**

**A29 Information request**

**Question:**

**What information regarding the industrial dispute have the Independent Improvement Panel requested from the Council since 4 August 2017?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

I have not personally been asked to supply any information.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
ALEX YIP**

**A30 Brummie Bonds**

**Question:**

**Since 30 June 2017 how much of the money raised from the ‘Brummie Bonds’ issued to Phoenix Life has been spent\*, including what it has been spent on?**

**\*not including the £7.8m spent up to 30 June according to the answer to Written Question A3 at City Council on 11 July 2017**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

As described in the Answer A3 on 11 July 2017, the Phoenix loan finances part of the approved borrowing in the Financial Plan 2017+ capital programme. It meets part of the Council’s planned borrowing needs. Like almost all the Council’s borrowing, the Phoenix loan is not restricted to funding particular capital projects. In these circumstances it is not possible to relate spending on particular projects to individual borrowing instruments.

The Council’s capital programme for 2017/18 includes prudential borrowing for a number of projects, with the larger ones being the Enterprise Zone, non-HRA housing, and swimming pools and sports facilities. A further £4.5m has been spent to date on the above projects in addition to the £7.8m spent up to 30 June reported in the answer to Written Question A3.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
MATT BENNETT**

**A31    Breakdown**

**Question:**

**In your response to Written Question A2 at 11 July City Council, asking for the repayment structure for the ‘Brummie Bonds’, the figures you gave were for the bond amount only and excluded any interest payments or other fees associated with the Bond issue. Can you provide a full breakdown of what will be paid and when over the life time of the Bonds?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

The £45m loan from Phoenix comprises three separate agreements of £15m each as follows:

1. £15m repayable at maturity on 20 April 2035 plus interest at 2.292% of £343,800 per annum payable semi-annually;
2. £15m repayable at maturity on 20 April 2037 plus interest at 2.347% of £352,050 per annum payable semi-annually;
3. £15m repayable at maturity on 20 April 2041 plus interest at 2.443% of £366,450 per annum payable semi-annually.

The interest cost averages 0.16% below the equivalent PWLB certainty rate available to the Council.

The terms of these loans have now been reported in the Capital and Treasury Management Monitoring Quarter 1 report to Cabinet on 13 September 2017, in line with the Council’s treasury management reporting practice for new long term loans.

The only other costs associated with the loan are legal fees of £17,925 which were paid in May 2017.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
DEBBIE CLANCY**

**A32    External Legal Advice**

**Question:**

**Broken down by the Officer or Member asking for the advice, what has been the total cost of external legal advice commissioned in relation to the equal pay liabilities arising from the industrial dispute within the waste collection service?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

I refer you to my answer to written question A8.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
MAUREEN CORNISH**

**A33    Approval**

**Question:**

**Part 3, Section 6 of the Constitution requires that any ‘key decision’ not on the forward plan and held in private, has the agreement of the Chair of the relevant Overview and Scrutiny Committee that the report is urgent and cannot reasonably be deferred. Ahead of the Cabinet Meeting which apparently took place on 17 August 2017, at which you stated the deal with ACAS was agreed as a ‘key decision’ did you seek and receive approval from the Scrutiny Chair?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor John Clancy)

No Cabinet Committee meeting took place on 17 August 2017.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE DEPUTY LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM  
COUNCILLOR ROBERT ALDEN**

**B1     Overspend**

**Question:**

**What is the projected overspend on the 2017/18 directorate revenue budgets as of the end of August 2017?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor Ian Ward)

The Month 4 position (up to 31<sup>st</sup> July 2017) will be reported to Cabinet on 13<sup>th</sup> September 2017. This reflects a projected net forecast overspend of £15.7m, of which £9.2m relates to Directorates. This overall position is an improvement of £4.5m compared with the total projected overspend at Month 3 of £20.2m.

The Month 5 position (up to 31<sup>st</sup> August 2017) will be reported to Budget Board in early October.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO DEPUTY LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM  
COUNCILLOR RANDAL BREW**

**B2 Waste Management Overspend**

**Question:**

**What additional in year savings have been identified so far to mitigate for the projected overspend within waste management?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor Ian Ward)

A number of management actions have been implemented and reflected in the projected year end overspend of £2.9m at Month 4 for Waste Services. These include a freeze on all back office vacancies, controls on non-essential expenditure, the generation of additional sale of paper income, reductions in overtime, selective use of agency staff to cover for operational vacancies and the efficient use of vehicles (reducing fuel, repair and hire costs).

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO DEPUTY LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM  
COUNCILLOR DEIRDRE ALDEN**

**B3 Council Tax**

**Question:**

**For the months of July and August in both 2016 and 2017, how many people did not pay their Council Tax on time?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor Ian Ward)

For the financial years 2016 and 2017 the numbers of cases progressing within the council tax recovery system for the months of July & August are shown in the table below.

As can be noted in the table below the numbers of citizens subject to recovery action for council tax for the months of July and August has reduced when comparing 2016 with 2017.

Year	Month	Citizens subject to recovery action
2016	July	40,324
	August	48,290
2017	July	38,364
	August	41,549

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE DEPUTY LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM  
COUNCILLOR PETER DOUGLAS OSBORN**

**B4     Constitution**

**Question:**

**Part 3, Section 6 of the Constitution requires that any ‘key decision’ not on the forward plan and held in private, has the agreement of the Chair of the relevant Overview and Scrutiny Committee that the report is urgent and cannot reasonably be deferred. Ahead of the Cabinet Meeting on 15 August 2017, at what point was the approval of the Chair of the Corporate Resources and Governance Overview and Scrutiny Committee sought and received for the late Cabinet report on the Commonwealth games?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor Ian Ward)

The Commonwealth Games report was identified as being a key decision and as such it was included on the Forward Plan and had been since April 2017. In July it was noted for consideration at Cabinet on 15<sup>th</sup> August 2017.

The process for late reports is clearly set out in the constitution in the executive reports process. This states the report should include details of the lateness and the reason for the urgency.

The public report considered at Cabinet on 15<sup>th</sup> August shows at para 1.9 that it ‘was late and urgent due to late developments in relation to funding and budgets and the need to decide on the further progression of the CWG.’ The bid had to be submitted by 18<sup>th</sup> August 2017.

All late reports have to be agreed and authorised by either the Leader or Deputy Leader of the Council or the Cabinet Member for Value for Money & Efficiency, as advised by the Monitoring Officer. I understand that communication took place between the City solicitor and Cllr Mahmood and it was agreed that the report could be submitted.

In these circumstances as it was already on the Forward Plan there is no specific requirement for approval by the O&S chair – only for approval by the portfolio holder re lateness and urgency.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE DEPUTY LEADER FROM COUNCILLOR ALEX YIP**

**B5     Leaked e-mail**

**Question:**

**The leaked email from the Leader to the depot managers sent on 18 August stated that Cabinet had taken the decision the night before (17 August) to support the compromise which he had negotiated through ACAS. As a member of that Cabinet, did you support this ‘decision’ at the meeting to which he refers?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor Ian Ward)

No.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE DEPUTY LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM  
COUNCILLOR MARGARET WADDINGTON**

**B6 Cost of Meetings**

**Question:**

**Including staff preparation time, senior officer attendance, live streaming etc.  
what is the approximate cost of hosting a meeting of Cabinet?**

Answer: (Response provided by Councillor Ian Ward)

The approximate cost of hosting a meeting of Cabinet is £2000.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE ASSISTANT LEADERS FROM COUNCILLOR  
ROBERT ALDEN**

**C      Ward Plans**

**Question:**

**What briefings have been provided to the Labour Group on the format and content of proposed new Ward Plans?**

**Answer:**

Thank for your question, however matters discussed within the Labour Group are internal matters of the Labour Group.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR CHILDREN, FAMILIES  
AND SCHOOLS FROM COUNCILLOR ALEX YIP**

**D      E-mail**

**Question:**

**The leaked email from the Leader to the depot managers sent on 18 August stated that Cabinet had taken the decision the night before (17 August) to support the compromise which he had negotiated through ACAS. As a member of that Cabinet, did you support this ‘decision’ at the meeting to which he refers?**

**Answer:**

I did take part in discussions over the summer around resolving the bin dispute and a proposed compromise to secure negotiations at ACAS. From the limited information available to me at that time, I did not agree to support this decision.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR JON HUNT**

**E1 How many wheelie bins damaged since introduced**

**Question:**

**How many wheelie bins have been reported damaged, by month, since they were introduced?**

**Answer:**

**Please find attached table detailing the numbers of bins reported as damaged by month since their introduction.**

	JAN	FEB	MARCH	APRIL	MAY	JUNE	JULY	AUGUST	SEPT	OCT	NOV	DEC
<b>2013</b>	No information held											
<b>2014</b>	0	0	2	6	7	11	21	19	15	21	25	30
<b>2015</b>	36	39	35	32	41	88	77	66	66	77	111	105
<b>2016</b>	200	207	193	179	149	149	168	159	107	144	183	117
<b>2017</b>	142	139	217	198	183	180	199	168	-	-	-	-

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR ZAKER CHOUDHRY**

**E2 Current & Forecast Cost of Wheelie Bin Replacement**

**Question:**

**What is the current and forecast cost of wheelie bin replacement?**

**Answer:**

The cost of replacement wheelie bins are as follows:

180 litre	£16.77
240 litre	£17.77
360 litre	£32.30
Pod	£4.43

Each time we replace large numbers of bins a competitive procurement process takes place.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR JOHN ALDEN**

**E3     At Risk**

**Question:**

**Of the 200 council jobs reportedly open to the 106 'At Risk' Refuse workers, how many were full time permanent posts?**

**Answer:**

Of the 201 Council jobs, five are part time posts, therefore 196 are full time permanent posts.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR DEBBIE CLANCY**

**E4     At Risk 2**

**Question:**

**Of the 200 council jobs reportedly open to the 106 'At Risk' Refuse workers, how many were posts in areas not currently expecting job losses as part of the existing 4 year financial plan?**

**Answer**

All areas of the City Council are subject to significant review over the next four years which may result in future staffing reductions.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR LYN COLLIN**

**E5 Overtime**

**Question:**

**How much has been paid in overtime to non-refuse collection staff employed by Birmingham City Council (e.g. Parks staff, street cleaning etc.) to work on waste collection as a result of the current industrial action?**

**Answer**

The cost of BCC non-refuse collection staff employed to work on waste collection as a result of the current industrial action is estimated at £77,500 (this relates to work completed mainly over the weekends and evenings between 22<sup>nd</sup> July and 12<sup>th</sup> August).

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR MAUREEN CORNISH**

**E6 Private Contractor**

**Question:**

**For each private contractor used to tackle the backlog caused by the current industrial action, how many members of staff have been used from each?**

**Answer:**

There are 8 Contractors that have been bought in to tackle the backlog and provide contingency arrangements. The number of staff they have used is not known to us as it would be in keeping with their own operating principles. However, those contractors are not only working on the backlog, they are also actively working on contingency arrangements.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR PETER DOUGLAS-  
OSBORN**

**E7     Backlog**

**Question:**

**What is the breakdown of where additional staff used to tackle the backlog caused by industrial action have come from? (i.e. % agency staff, % street cleansing staff, % additional non-Unite waste collection crew, % management, and any other sources not listed)?**

**Answer:**

There are no additional staff that have been brought in to Birmingham City Council to tackle the backlog caused by the industrial action. We have contracted with 8 service providers to provide a variety of services covering Bulky Waste, Refuse Collection, Tower Blocks and red carded properties (those with no wheelie bin).

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR DES FLOOD**

**E8     Additional Staff**

**Question:**

**What is the total number of additional staff being used to tackle the backlog caused by the industrial action?**

**Answer:**

There are no additional staff that have been brought in to Birmingham City Council to tackle the backlog caused by the industrial action. We have contracted with 8 service providers to provide a variety of services covering Bulky Waste, Refuse Collection, Tower Blocks and red carded properties (those with no wheelie bin).

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR ROBERT ALDEN**

**E9     Meetings**

**Question:**

**How many times and on what dates have you met personally with Unite the Union to discuss a resolution to the current industrial action within the waste collection service?**

**Answer:**

I have not met with Unite the Union on their own, or within a personal capacity.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR MEIRION JENKINS**

**E10    Spending**

**Question:**

**The Council's bid to DCLG for the c£30m grant for the roll out of wheelie bins quoted a figure of £73.55 per head on waste management. What is the actual spend per head in 2017/18 using the same calculation?**

**Answer:**

The figure of £73.55 is the amount per year and relates to 2010/11 (it is also inclusive of all waste collection, waste disposal and street cleaning services).

The Council has reduced the net cost of Waste Management Services considerably since 2010/11 and the equivalent for 2017/18 is estimated at £57.60 per head (this is based on the approved budget for 2017/18).

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR ANDREW HARDIE**

**E11 Missed Collections**

**Question:**

**Since 30 June 2017 how many reports of missed collections have the council received from residents, broken down by ward?**

**Answer:**

Please find below the number of reported missed collections for all waste streams between the 30 June 2017 and the 6 September 2017, broken down by ward. Please note that Residents' reports are made either for their individual premises or for the whole road, and as such many will be duplicate reports of the same incident of a missed collection by multiple residents.

	<b>Individual Property Reports</b>	<b>Whole Road</b>
Acocks Green	474	2341
Aston	145	1111
Bartley Green	1346	5220
Billesley	326	4074
Bordesley Green	1321	2640
Bournville	1222	4293
Brandwood	1345	3812
Edgbaston	780	2250
Erdington	565	2730
Hall Green	528	2661
Handsworth Wood	405	2140
Harborne	1099	3801
Hodge Hill	421	2785
Kings Norton	1265	4527
Kingstanding	485	2187
Ladywood	103	467
Longbridge	1348	4789
Lozells and East Handsworth	219	1591
Moseley and Kings Heath	461	2050
Nechells	211	1226
Northfield	1802	4873
Oscott	552	2630
Perry Barr	512	2422
Quinton	1333	4863
Selly Oak	245	2157
Shard End	630	4104
Sheldon	1124	3343
Soho	685	1305
South Yardley	509	2503
Sparkbrook	1085	2225
Springfield	191	2415
Stechford and Yardley North	360	2749
Stockland Green	524	2722

**City Council – 12 September 2017**

Sutton Four Oaks	493	4048
Sutton New Hall	737	4406
Sutton Trinity	955	3083
Sutton Vesey	424	3423
Tyburn	511	3011
Washwood Heath	329	2552
Weoley	1391	4732

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR TIMOTHY HUXTABLE**

**E12    Agency Staff**

**Question:**

**Since 30 June 2017 how much was spent week by week on Agency Staff for the refuse collection service?**

**Answer:**

The amounts spent on agency staff per week by the refuse collection service (excluding green, trade, recycling) since 30<sup>th</sup> June 2017 were:

<u>Week</u> <u>Ending</u>	£
7/7/17	57,834
14/7/17	56,415
21/7/17	53,912
28/7/17	50,770
4/8/17	50,737
11/8/17	51,326
18/8/17	61,222
25/8/17	65,081
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>447,297</b>

It should be noted that the majority of these costs are funded from the existing approved budget for posts that are currently vacant and being filled by agency staff.

The additional external resources brought in as a response to industrial action have been employed directly by the contractors and not by the Council.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR SIMON JEVON**

**E13 Managers**

**Question:**

**Since 30 June 2017 how much has been spent on overtime for managers within the refuse collection service?**

**Answer:**

The amount paid to managers (Grade 5 and above) within the refuse collection service in August 2017 was £630.65.

These payments are made in arrears and could relate to any period up to July in the current financial year as this is dependent on when the claims for payment were submitted by the employees concerned.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR BRUCE LINES**

**E14 Recycling**

**Question:**

**Since 30 June 2017 what percentage of household waste collected has been recycled?**

**Answer:**

Based on the latest tonnage information available, up to 27<sup>th</sup> August 2017, the percentage of household waste that was recycled in the period from 30<sup>th</sup> June 2017 to 27<sup>th</sup> August 2017 is 10.32 %. This excludes street cleansing and household waste recycling centre wastes.

Percentage of all household waste that was recycled (including street cleansing and household waste recycling centre wastes) is estimated to be 19%. This figure is an estimate because we do not have all tonnage figures for the household waste recycling centres as the latest information is still being calculated and verified.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR JOHN LINES**

**E15    Pest Problems**

**Question:**

**Since April 2011 how many reports of pest problems have been received by month, including the current year to date?**

**Answer:**

Please find attached in appendix 1 the numbers of pest control jobs per month broken down into rats and all other pests. Appendix 2 provides this information in a graphical format.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR EWAN MACKEY**

**E16 Disciplinary Cases**

**Question:**

**Since 30 June 2017 how many disciplinary cases have been opened against staff working within the refuse collection service?**

**Answer:**

There have been 31 disciplinary investigations. These vary from informal investigations to gross misconduct.

As at 06/09/2017 there are 21 disciplinary cases still open, at various stages of investigation.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR GARETH MOORE**

**E17 List of Missed Collections**

**Question:**

**As of the end of 30 June 2017, and for the same point for each week after that, how many reported missed collections were yet to be collected?**

**Answer:**

From the 18 June to the 2 September the number of reported missed collections for all waste streams split by individual property and whole road reports, per week is as follows. Please note: That the data contains reports of where the same missed collection either individual or whole road may have been made by different residents.

Week Ending (Saturday)	Individual Property	Whole Road
24/06/2017	1553	4430
01/07/2017	1821	6921
08/07/2017	2859	10752
15/07/2017	3371	16413
22/07/2017	3405	16376
29/07/2017	3399	18026
05/08/2017	3212	16367
12/08/2017	3398	14815
19/08/2017	3004	10345
26/08/2017	2606	8550
02/09/2017	2268	6835

Since the start of the Industrial Action we have moved away from the normal round collections towards a ward based collection service. As a result of this and due to the volume of reports, we have temporarily suspended the process which updates our system when collections have been rectified. We are therefore unable to provide specific information on outstanding missed collections.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR DAVID PEARS**

**E18 Blitz**

**Question:**

**Following the move to a ward-by-ward ‘blitz’ approach for waste collection during the first phase of industrial action, for each depot please list the order in which each ward was tackled?**

**Answer:**

			<b>Monty</b>	<b>Lifford</b>	<b>Perry Barr</b>	<b>Redfern</b>
<b>Week 1</b>	24-Jul-17	Mon	Ladywood	Quinton	Kingstanding	Hodge Hill
	25-Jul-17	Tues	Ladywood	Bartley Green	Sutton Trinity	Washwood Heath
	26-Jul-17	Wed	Soho	Northfield	Sutton Four Oaks	Acocks Green
	27-Jul-17	Thurs	Soho	Brandwood	Handsworth Wood	Moseley/Kings Heath
	28-Jul-17	Fri	<b>Catch Up</b>			
	29-Jul-17	Sat				
	30-Jul-17	Sun				
<b>Week 2</b>	31-Jul-17	Mon	Aston	Edgbaston	Oscott	Shard End
	01-Aug-17	Tue	Aston	Bournville	Erdington	Stetchford/Yardley North
	02-Aug-17	Wed	Nechells	Longbridge	Lozells and East Handsworth	South Yardley
	03-Aug-17	Thu	Nechells	Billesley	Sutton Vesey	Sparkbrook
	04-Aug-17	Fri	<b>Catch Up</b>			
	05-Aug-17	Sat				
	06-Aug-17	Sun				
<b>Week 3</b>	07-Aug-17	Mon	Ladywood	Harborne	Stockland Green	Sheldon
	08-Aug-17	Tue	Ladywood	Weoley Castle	Sutton New Hall	Springfield
	09-Aug-17	Wed	Soho	Selly Oak	Tyburn	Bordesley Green
	10-Aug-17	Thu	Soho	Kings Norton	Perry Barr	Hall Green
	11-Aug-17	Fri	<b>Catch Up</b>			
	12-Aug-17	Sat				
	13-Aug-17	Sun				
<b>Week 4</b>	14-Aug-17	Mon	Aston	Quinton	Kingstanding	Hodge Hill
	15-Aug-17	Tue	Aston	Bartley Green	Sutton Trinity	Washwood Heath
	16-Aug-17	Wed	Nechells	Northfield	Sutton Four Oaks	Acocks Green
	17-Aug-17	Thu	Nechells	Brandwood	Handsworth Wood	Moseley/Kings Heath
	18-Aug-17	Fri	<b>Catch Up</b>			
	19-Aug-17	Sat				

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR FERGUS ROBINSON**

**E19    Productivity**

**Question:**

**Based on the methodology for the ‘properties per round’ productivity figures used in the Cabinet report on changes to the waste collection operating model, what has been the productivity of the external contractors used during the industrial dispute verses the regular service prior to the commencement of industrial action?**

**Answer:**

We are monitoring the productivity of the external contractors, however because our current collection service is operating to a ward based plan which is collecting all waste at each property rather than our historic round based approach it is not possible to draw comparisons between the external contractors and our regular service.

Currently each crew is collecting all waste which has been presented, which means that at each property there are multiple bins and large amounts of accumulated waste. This results in each crew spending more time at each property and having to return to the ‘tip’ more frequently to empty the vehicles, all of which will have an impact on perceived productivity.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR GARY SAMBROOK**

**E20    Cost of Overtime**

**Question:**

**Since the suspension of industrial action on 16 August, how much overtime has been paid to staff who were previously on strike?**

**Answer:**

Bank Holiday Monday is a normal day of operation for Refuse Collection which attracts an additional payment and as such 25 staff received this payment for working. The cost of the work has not yet been calculated. Timesheets have been submitted to payroll for payment at the end of this month.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR ROB SEALEY**

**E21 Missed Green Collections**

**Question:**

**How many green waste collections have been missed each month since the resumption of collections after the winter break in March 2017?**

**Answer:**

Please find below the number of reported missed garden waste collections between 6 March 2017 and 6 September 2017 by month. Please note that the data contains reports of where multiple reports of the same missed collection have been made.

Month	Total Number of Reported Missed Garden Collections
March	1424
April	1589
May	1063
June	2606
July	8181
August	8167
September	1064

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR RON STORER**

**E22 Pre-Booking System**

**Question:**

**On what date was the pre-booking system for vans to use household waste and recycling centres suspended?**

**Answer:**

The new van process was introduced on the 10<sup>th</sup> July at all five Household Waste and Recycling centre (HWRC) sites. Working with Veolia we relaxed the process on the 26<sup>th</sup> July, whereby any residents taking black bag (residual waste) into the HWRC site in a van would be able to dispose of the waste, with Veolia pointing them to the booking system for further trips.

The system enables Veolia to help to control the amount of vans on site at any one time, which helps to improve the time spent on site by all residents and improve the service provided and waiting times where possible.

For larger vans the height restrictions are still in place at all sites, apart from Tyseley HWRC, which is – in business as usual – the dedicated site for larger vans.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR KEN WOOD**

**E23    Grade 3 Staff**

**Question:**

**For each of the three grades of staff in the waste collection service, how many (out of how many) employees have taken part in the industrial action?**

Answer:

GR2 – 58 out of 64

GR3 – 95 out of 126

GR4 – 153 out of 177

A total of 306 out of 367 staff have taken part in industrial action up to 31<sup>st</sup> July 2017. The August information is being collated for the September payroll deadline.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR MARGARET  
WADDINGTON**

**E24    Job Evaluation**

**Question:**

**On what dates were the job descriptions for each of the two roles on the wagon (i.e. 1 x driver and 2 x loaders) in the proposed operating model for refuse collection service put through job evaluation to confirm their grade?**

**Answer:**

The Driver and Loader job descriptions were evaluated in February 2012. As part of the current Waste Management restructure these were reviewed by Managers and remain unchanged.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR DAVID BARRIE**

**E25    Usage of Household and Recycling Centres**

**Question:**

**How many vans (that would now be liable for a charge) used the Household Waste and Recycling centre per month in the year preceding the introduction of the charge and booking system?**

**Answer:**

The van procedure at the Household Waste and Recycling centres was introduced on the 10<sup>th</sup> July. The system is only chargeable for Trade/Business waste and as such none of these vehicles would have knowingly been allowed to enter the site, as this was prohibited and managed by our contractors, Veolia.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR BOB BEAUCHAMP**

**E26 Fly-Tipping**

**Question:**

**How many reports of fly-tipping were received in the months of July and August for each year between 2011 and 2017 inclusive?**

**Answer:**

The table shows the number of reports of dumped rubbish (fly-tipping) received by the service.

Number of reports of fly-tipping raised with the service							
Financial Year	2011*	2012*	2013*	2014	2015	2016	2017
Jul	1348	920	1482	2792	2179	2041	1528
Aug	1163	885	1074	1997	1872	1877	1185

\*Please Note: The service introduced a new IT system mid-August 2013 as a result we only currently hold data from when this was implemented and are therefore only able to provide a full months' worth of data from July 2014. We have included information from between 2011 and 2013, however this has been collected from previous responses and due to the slightly different way of recording fly-tipping shouldn't strictly be used by way of comparison.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR MATT BENNETT**

**E27 Damaged Bins**

**Question:**

**For each bin type how many bins have been returned damaged each year since the introduction of wheelie bins?**

**Answer:**

The attached spreadsheet shows the numbers of bins reported as damaged.

	<b>2013</b>	<b>1/1/14 - 31/12/14</b>	<b>1/1/15 - 31/12/15</b>	<b>1/1/16 - 31/12/16</b>	<b>1/1/17 - 31/08/17</b>
<b>Residual</b>	<b>No information held</b>	<b>43</b>	<b>324</b>	<b>1047</b>	<b>832</b>
<b>Recycling</b>		<b>15</b>	<b>124</b>	<b>446</b>	<b>274</b>
<b>Pod</b>		<b>27</b>	<b>144</b>	<b>289</b>	<b>209</b>
<b>Garden</b>		<b>72</b>	<b>181</b>	<b>173</b>	<b>111</b>

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR RANDAL BREW**

**E28    Loss of Income**

**Question:**

**What has been the estimated loss of income from recycling during the period of industrial action due to recycling being mixed with residual waste?**

**Answer:**

Based on the latest tonnage information available, during the period of industrial action (1<sup>st</sup> July 2017 to 27<sup>th</sup> August 2017) the kerbside collection service collected 697.17 tonnes of mixed paper and cardboard. During the period of 1<sup>st</sup> July 2016 to 27<sup>th</sup> August 2016 the kerbside collection services collected 3,853.21 tonnes of mixed paper and cardboard. There has therefore been a reduction of 3,156.04 tonnes during the period of industrial action compared to the same period last year. Birmingham City Council receives an income of £95.00 per tonne (this is a variable rate), therefore the estimated income lost is £299,823.80.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR ALEX YIP**

**E29 Negotiations**

**Question:**

**Prior to meeting with ACAS and Unite on 15 August, did the Leader consult with you on what concessions the Council could afford to make in the negotiations?**

**Answer:**

I advised the Leader on a number of occasions on the legal, financial and operational constraints under which we were operating.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR DEIRDRE ALDEN**

**E30 Market Testing**

**Question:**

**As part of the £30m grant from Government for the roll out of the wheelie bin service, the Council committed to a market testing exercise for the service. What was the result of this market testing?**

**Answer:**

The bid did make reference to the Council carrying out market testing for its collection services. The bid recognised the benefits from looking at other services across the country to ensure an efficient and value for money service. The proposals laid down in the current waste management reorganisation business case presented to Cabinet in June 2017 delivers that efficiency. A separate market testing exercise for collection services has not taken place.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS,  
RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR SUE ANDERSON**

**E31 Low Figure for Clearing Rubbish**

**Question:**

**According to the paper tabled to Cabinet on 24th August, and not discussed by Cabinet, the Council spent just £21,000 a week during July in clearing the rubbish left by the refuse collectors' strike from the streets. Does he consider this rather low figure suggests his response to crisis was extremely slow?**

**Answer:**

Your question was originally directed to the Leader, but as it relates to my portfolio, I can tell you that the cost of clearing the refuse left by the refuse collectors started at £21,000 a week and rose to its current spend of £311,000 a week as the contingency plan was developed in response to the industrial action and the commitment to deliver cleaner streets.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR HEALTH AND SOCIAL CARE FROM COUNCILLOR ALEX YIP**

**F1     E-mail**

**Question:**

**The leaked email from the Leader to the depot managers sent on 18 August stated that Cabinet had taken the decision the night before (17 August) to support the compromise which he had negotiated through ACAS. As a member of that Cabinet, did you support this ‘decision’ at the meeting to which he refers?**

**Answer:**

I was on holiday out of the country in mid-August. However, I did take an urgent call from the Leader to discuss resolving the bin dispute and compromise negotiations at ACAS. From the limited information that I was given over the phone from the Leader I agreed to support this decision.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR HEALTH AND SOCIAL CARE FROM COUNCILLOR LYN COLLIN**

**F2      Measures**

**Question:**

**What measures are you taking to ensure that the current and future rubbish accumulations on our streets will not lead to a Public Health crisis involving flies, maggots and rats for the residents of our city?**

**Answer:**

I asked the Director of Public Health to work with Public Health England to assess the current situation and provide appropriate advice to our citizens as set out below and is also available on the council website,

[https://www.birmingham.gov.uk/info/20009/waste\\_and\\_recycling/1314/public\\_health\\_advice\\_regarding\\_household\\_waste\\_from\\_public\\_health\\_england](https://www.birmingham.gov.uk/info/20009/waste_and_recycling/1314/public_health_advice_regarding_household_waste_from_public_health_england)

We understand the concerns of citizens about the accumulation of uncollected refuse on the streets of Birmingham. Piles of rubbish are unsightly, result in very unpleasant odours and can attract flies and rodents.

By following the advice below, the risk to public health will be kept low:

- Good hygiene is important to reduce risk of becoming ill from bugs, in particular regular hand washing with soap and water.
- Keep food preparation areas clean using a disinfectant, don't leave food on surfaces at home unwrapped, including pet food and use bin lids as accumulated waste can attract flies
- Use two bin bags, especially when preparing waste for taking outside as this reduces the risk of vermin breaking into bin bags.
- In particular, ensure waste products such as nappies, sanitary towels and condoms are 'double bagged' for example put in a smaller bag first before placing in the household rubbish bin.
- Use gloves if you pick up rubbish that has spilled into your driveway or street.
- Take extra precaution with children who may be playing in areas near where rubbish has accumulated and especially if you notice exposed waste.
- Where possible, keep wheelie bins / outside bins out of direct sunlight to reduce smells.
- If you or your child cuts themselves on waste in the street, wash the wound thoroughly with soap and water and apply a sterile adhesive dressing, such as a plaster. For more information about how to deal with cuts visit NHS Choices. If there is a risk the wound could become infected or you think it is already infected call NHS 111 or visit your local walk-in centre, minor injuries unit or GP surgery or download the free 'Ask NHS' app for advice if you begin to feel unwell.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR HOUSING AND HOMES  
FROM COUNCILLOR ALEX YIP**

**G1     E-mail**

**Question:**

**The leaked email from the Leader to the depot managers sent on 18 August stated that Cabinet had taken the decision the night before (17 August) to support the compromise which he had negotiated through ACAS. As a member of that Cabinet, did you support this ‘decision’ at the meeting to which he refers?**

**Answer:**

I did take part in discussions over the summer around resolving the bin dispute and a proposed compromise to secure negotiations at ACAS. From the limited information available to me at that time, I agreed to support this decision.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR HOUSING AND HOMES  
FROM COUNCILLOR SIMON JEVON**

**G2     Housing Land**

**Question:**

**The Cabinet Member will be aware that for many months there has been an issue with travellers across the City encroaching onto what is designated as “housing land.” Can the Cabinet Member tell us how much the Housing Directorate has been charged this financial year to date for the clearing up of the mess left behind and can he explain what measures are being/will be taken to protect this “housing land” from these continued invasions?**

**Answer:**

The estimated costs that have been incurred in this financial year are £30,000 (the majority at almost £20,000 were costs of legal action, evictions and clear ups).

A number of measures are being implemented to reduce the potential risk of further unlawful encampments and these include the installation of concrete rings, building of earth mound barriers, securing of sites and properties and temporary road closures as necessary.

The Council is also working with national agencies to encourage the greater use of existing designated sites and to develop new potential sites for the future.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR JOBS AND SKILLS  
FROM COUNCILLOR ALEX YIP**

H      E-mail

**Question:**

**The leaked email from the Leader to the depot managers sent on 18 August stated that Cabinet had taken the decision the night before (17 August) to support the compromise which he had negotiated through ACAS. As a member of that Cabinet, did you support this ‘decision’ at the meeting to which he refers?**

**Answer:**

I did take part in discussions over the summer around resolving the bin dispute and a proposed compromise to secure negotiations at ACAS. From the limited information available to me at that time, I agreed to support this decision.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER FOR TRANSPARENCY,  
OPENNESS AND EQUALITY FROM COUNCILLOR EWAN MACKAY**

**I1 Freedom of Information**

**Question:**

**Shortly after assuming his new role, the Cabinet Member stated that he intended to begin publishing a disclosure log of all Freedom of Information Requests and that he hoped to have this in place by the end of summer. When does the Cabinet Member believe the disclosure log will be available to the public?**

**Answer:**

The Council is currently testing a new solution that will enable the publication of a disclosure log of all Freedom of Information requests. It is anticipated that, subject to satisfactory implementation of the new solution, the disclosure log will be available shortly with a formal launch to follow.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR TRANSPARENCY,  
OPENNESS AND EQUALITY FROM COUNCILLOR ALEX YIP**

**I2     E-mail**

**Question:**

**The leaked email from the Leader to the depot managers sent on 18 August stated that Cabinet had taken the decision the night before (17 August) to support the compromise which he had negotiated through ACAS. As a member of that Cabinet, did you support this ‘decision’ at the meeting to which he refers?**

**Answer:**

I did take part in discussions over the summer around resolving the bin dispute and a proposed compromise to secure negotiations at ACAS. From the limited information available to me at that time, I agreed to support this decision.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR TRANSPORT AND  
ROADS FROM COUNCILLOR ALEX YIP**

**J1      E-mail**

**Question:**

**The leaked email from the Leader to the depot managers sent on 18 August stated that Cabinet had taken the decision the night before (17 August) to support the compromise which he had negotiated through ACAS. As a member of that Cabinet, did you support this 'decision' at the meeting to which he refers?**

**Answer:**

I did take part in discussions over the summer around resolving the bin dispute. At the time in question I was on holiday in Spain, so was unable to participate in the decision.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR TRANSPORT AND ROAD FROM COUNCILLOR TIMOTHY HUXTABLE**

**J2     Information**

**Question:**

**How many hours before the Cabinet meeting of 24 August 2017 did you first discuss with the Leader or any other Cabinet Member, raising your motion to defer the report on waste collection which members of the press, public, unions and staff groups had travelled to the council house to see discussed?**

**Answer:**

A meeting took place between Cabinet Members and Counsel in the two hours prior to the start of the Cabinet meeting on 24 August. It was decided that, to properly reflect on the advice given at that meeting, it would be necessary to defer the report.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR VALUE FOR MONEY  
AND EFFICIENCY FROM COUNCILLOR ALEX YIP**

**K      E-mail**

**Question:**

**The leaked email from the Leader to the depot managers sent on 18 August stated that Cabinet had taken the decision the night before (17 August) to support the compromise which he had negotiated through ACAS. As a member of that Cabinet, did you support this ‘decision’ at the meeting to which he refers?**

**Answer:**

I did take part in discussions over the summer around resolving the bin dispute and a proposed compromise to secure negotiations at ACAS. From the limited information available to me at that time, I agreed to support this decision.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CHAIR OF AUDIT COMMITTEE FROM  
COUNCILLOR MEIRION JENKINS**

**L1 Corporate Risks**

**Question:**

**Following my 3 emails to you without response concerning the corporate risks associated with the industrial dispute and equal pay claims, can you please let me know what conversations you have had, when and with whom concerning this matter and the possibility of it being brought before Audit Committee as requested?**

**Answer:**

I have held a meeting (31/8/2017) with the head of Audit and Risk Management where we discussed the Committee's role in relation to risk, corporate governance and value for money.

The Corporate Risk Register records and monitors risks around equal pay, specifically risk 5 – Further Equal Pay Claims, and Industrial Relations (risk 7). The risk owners have been contacted on my behalf to seek assurance that the risks are adequately scoped and are being actively managed / mitigated.

The Annual Governance Statement also covers these issues and is on the agenda for approval at our September meeting.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CHAIR OF AUDIT COMMITTEE FROM  
COUNCILLOR ALEX YIP**

**L2     Dispute**

**Question:**

**Have you had any conversations with the District Auditors regarding the ongoing industrial dispute within refuse collection?**

**Answer:**

I'm meeting the external auditors with officers on Monday 11<sup>th</sup> September 2017.

The external auditor has been meeting with officer colleagues to seek the necessary assurances as he is entitled to do in the course of his work.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO CHAIR OF PLANNING COMMITTEE FROM  
COUNCILLOR RANDAL BREW**

**M      Enforcement Actions**

**Question:**

**Since 2012, for each year how many enforcement actions have been taken within the City's conservations areas against breaches of conservation planning laws or Article 4 Directives, broken down by each Conservation area?**

**Answer:**

I can report that across all of the City's conservation areas, within the last 5 years we have received 915 cases for investigation, which has resulted in the serving of 61 various Notices.

As with other enforcement work, the serving of formal Notices is, and should be, a last resort, with many cases closed following negotiation with officers to reach an acceptable outcome.

Figures are available for each conservation area (summary table attached below)

<b>Conservation Area</b>	<b>Cases Received</b>	<b>Notices (ALL)</b>
Anchorage Road, Sutton Coldfield Conservation Area	6	0
Aston Hall And Church Conservation Area	4	0
Austin Village Conservation Area	19	0
Barnsley Road, Edgabsaton Conservation Area	20	4
Bournville Tenants Conservation Area	1	0
Bournville Village Conservation Area	16	4
Colmore Row And Environs Conservation Area	19	2
Digbeth, Deritend And Bordesley High Streets Conservation Area	23	0
Edgbaston Conservation Area	70	7
Four Oaks Conservation Area	162	1
Greenfield Road, Harborne Conservation Area	20	2
Harborne Old Village Conservation Area	2	0
High Street, Sutton Coldfield Conservation Area	16	1

**City Council – 12 September 2017**

Ideal Village, Bordesley Green Conservation Area	25	1
Jewellery Quarter Conservation Area	116	6
Kings Norton Conservation Area	4	0
Lozells And Soho Hill Conservation Area	35	1
Moor Pool, Harborne Conservation Area	43	2
Moseley Conservation Area	117	8
Old Yardley Conservation Area	12	0
Ryland Road Conservation Area	1	0
School Road, Hall Green Conservation Area	18	4
Selly Park Avenues Conservation Area	23	2
Selly Park Conservation Area	63	6
St Agnes, Moseley Conservation Area	30	2
St Augustine's Edgbaston Conservation Area	28	4
Steelhouse City Centre Conservation Area	18	1
Warwick Barr Conservation Area	4	3
Total	915	61

A further, more detailed breakdown has been made available, though this does contain a significant amount of information. I can, however, provide these annual breakdowns in correspondence for each area should this be required by Members, and I would be happy to deal with those requests subsequent to this meeting.