



**MEETING OF BIRMINGHAM
CITY COUNCIL, TUESDAY,
7 NOVEMBER 2023**

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF BIRMINGHAM CITY COUNCIL HELD
ON TUESDAY, 7 NOVEMBER 2023 AT 1400 HOURS IN THE COUNCIL
CHAMBER, COUNCIL HOUSE, BIRMINGHAM**

PRESENT:- Lord Mayor (Councillor Chaman Lal) in the Chair.

Councillors

Akhlaq Ahmed	Adrian Delaney	Narinder Kaur Kooner
Alex Aitken	Diane Donaldson	Mary Locke
Deirdre Alden	Barbara Dring	Ewan Mackey
Robert Alden	Jayne Francis	Basharat Mahmood
Gurdial Singh	Sam Forsyth	Majid Mahmood
Atwal	Ray Goodwin	Lee Marsham
Raqeeb Aziz	Rob Grant	Karen McCarthy
Shabina Bano	Colin Green	Saddak Miah
David Barker	Fred Grindrod	Shehla Moledina
David Barrie	Roger Harmer	Gareth Moore
Baber Baz	Deborah Harries	Richard Parkin
Matt Bennett	Kath Hartley	Rick Payne
Jilly	Adam Higgs	David Pears
Birmingham	Des Hughes	Miranda Perks
Marcus	Jon Hunt	Rob Pocock
Bernasconi	Mumtaz Hussain	Julien Pritchard
Bushra Bi	Mahmood Hussain	Hendrina Quinnen
Sir Albert	Shabrana Hussain	Lauren Rainbow
Bore	Timothy Huxtable	Darius Sandhu
Nicky	Mohammed Idrees	Kath Scott
Brennan	Zafar Iqbal	Rinkal Shergill
Kerry Brewer	Katherine Iroh	Sybil Spence
Marje Bridle	Ziaul Islam	Ron Storer
Martin Brooks	Morriam Jan	Saima Suleman
Zaker	Kerry Jenkins	Jamie Tennant
Choudhry	Meirion Jenkins	Sharon Thompson
Debbie	Brigid Jones	Paul Tilsley
Clancy	Jane Jones	Lisa Trickett
Liz Clements	Amar Khan	Penny Wagg
Maureen	Ayoub Khan	Ian Ward
Cornish	Mariam Khan	Ken Wood
John Cotton	Saqib Khan	Alex Yip
Phil Davis	Izzy Knowles	Waseem Zaffar
Jack Deakin	Bruce Lines	

NOTICE OF RECORDING

- 190 The Lord Mayor advised that the meeting would be webcast for live and subsequent broadcasting via the Council's Public-I website and that members of the press/public may record and take photographs except where there were confidential or exempt items.
-

DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS

- 191 The Lord Mayor reminded Members that they must declare all relevant pecuniary and non-pecuniary interests relating to any items of business to be discussed at the meeting.

Councillor Jack Deakin declared a non-pecuniary interest in relation to agenda item 10 (Motion B). Councillor Deakin was a member of the Councillors Network of Labour Friends of Israel.

Councillor Liz Clements declared a non-pecuniary interest in relation to agenda item 10 (Motion A). Councillor Clements was a Trustee of the City of Birmingham Symphony Orchestra and was also an observer on the boards of the Birmingham Opera Company and Ex Cathedra Choir.

Councillor Jayne Francis declared a non-pecuniary interest in relation to agenda item 10 (Motion A). Councillor Francis was a trustee of the Arts Council Regional Board and a trustee of Birmingham Repertory Theatre and the Icon Gallery.

MINUTES

It was moved by the Lord Mayor, seconded and –

- 192 **RESOLVED:**

That the Minutes of the City Council meetings held on 11 July 2023, 12 September 2023 and the extraordinary meeting held on 25 September 2023 be taken as read and confirmed and signed.

LORD MAYOR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

There were no announcements from the Lord Mayor.

PETITIONS

Petitions Relating to City Council Functions Presented at the Meeting

The following petitions were presented:-

(See document No. 1, 'Additional Meeting Documents')

In accordance with the proposals by the Members presenting the petitions, it was moved by the Lord Mayor, seconded and:-

193 **RESOLVED:-**

That the petitions were received and referred to the relevant Chief Officer(s).

Petitions Update

A Petitions Update had been made available electronically:-

(See document No. 2, 'Additional Meeting Documents')

It was moved by the Lord Mayor, seconded and

194 **RESOLVED:-**

That the Petitions Update be noted and those petitions for which a satisfactory response has been received, be discharged.

QUESTION TIME

195 The Council proceeded to consider Oral Questions in accordance with Council Rules of Procedure (B4.4 F of the Constitution).

Details of the questions asked are available for public inspection via the webcast.

APPOINTMENTS BY THE COUNCIL

Councillor Gareth Moore addressed the Council and it was-

196 **RESOLVED:-**

That the appointments be made to serve on the Committees and other bodies set out below:-

Replace Cllr Bruce Lines with Cllr Robert Alden on Audit Committee.

Replace Cllr Darius Sandhu with Cllr Deirdre Alden on Co-ordinating O&S Committee.

Replace Cllr Deirdre Alden with Cllr Darius Sandhu on the Neighbourhoods O&S Committee.

LEAD MEMBER REPORT: WEST MIDLANDS POLICE AND CRIME PANEL

A report of Councillor Sam Forsyth, Lead Member, West Midlands Police and Crime Panel was submitted:-

(See document No. 3, agenda item 8)

Councillor Sam Forsyth moved the recommendation which was seconded by Councillor Nicky Brennan.

A debate ensued.

Councillors Deirdre Alden, Izzy Knowles, Julien Pritchard, Liz Clements, Gareth Moore, Morriam Jan, Marcus Bernasconi, Richard Parkin, Ziaul Islam, David Pears and Shabina Bano spoke during the debate.

The Lord Mayor invited Councillor Sam Forsyth to sum up.

It was therefore-

197 **RESOLVED:-**

1.) That City Council agreed to note the report.

ADJOURNMENT

198 It was moved by the Lord Mayor, seconded and-

RESOLVED:-

That the Council be adjourned until 1650 hours on this day.

The Council then adjourned at 1620 hours.

At 1650 hours the Council resumed at the point where the meeting had been adjourned.

**LEAD MEMBER REPORT: WEST MIDLANDS COMBINED AUTHORITY
TRANSPORT DELIVERY COMMITTEE**

A report of Mary Locke, Lead Member, West Midlands Combined Authority Transport Delivery Committee was submitted.

(See document No. 4, agenda item 9).

Councillor Mary Locke moved the recommendation which was seconded by Councillor Timothy Huxtable.

A debate ensued.

Councillors Julien Pritchard, Liz Clements, Robert Alden, David Barker, Zaker Choudhry, Narinder Kaur Kooner and Lee Marsham spoke during the debate.

The Lord Mayor invited Councillor Mary Locke to sum up.

It was therefore-

199

RESOLVED:-

1.) That City Council noted the report.

MOTIONS FOR DEBATE FROM INDIVIDUAL MEMBERS

The Council proceeded to consider the Motions of which notice had been given in accordance with Council Rules of Procedure (B4.4 G of the Constitution).

Councillor Ray Goodwin left the Chamber for Motion A.

A. Councillors Darius Sandhu and Richard Parkin had given notice of the following Notice of Motion:-

(See document No. 5, agenda item 10)

Councillor Darius Sandhu moved the Motion which was seconded by Councillor Richard Parkin.

In accordance with Council Rules of Procedure, Councillors Saima Suleman and David Barker gave notice of the following amendment to the Motion:-

(See document No. 6, 'Amendments – City Council')

Councillor Saima Suleman moved the amendment which was seconded by Councillor David Barker.

In accordance with Council Rules of Procedure, Councillors Deborah Harries and Morriam Jan gave notice of the following amendment to the Motion:-

(See document No. 7, 'Amendments – City Council')

Councillor Deborah Harries moved the amendment which was seconded by Councillor Morriam Jan.

In accordance with Council Rules of Procedure, Councillors Julien Pritchard and Rob Grant gave notice of the following amendment to the Motion:-

(See document No. 8, 'Amendments – City Council')

Councillor Julien Pritchard moved the amendment which was seconded by Councillor Rob Grant.

A debate ensued.

Councillors Marje Bridle, Robert Alden, Phil Davis and Debbie Clancy spoke during the debate.

During the debate Councillor Robert Alden declared a non-pecuniary interest. Councillor Alden was a Council appointed trustee of Birmingham Museums Trust and his wife worked for the Birmingham Museums Trust.

During the debate, Councillor Phil Davis declared a non-pecuniary interest. Councillor Davis was one of two Council trustees of Birmingham Museums Trust.

The Lord Mayor invited Councillor Darius Sandhu to sum up.

The amendment to the Motion in the names of Councillors Saima Suleman and David Barker having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

The amendment to the Motion in the names of Councillors Deborah Harries and Morriam Jan having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

The amendment to the Motion in the names of Councillors Julien Pritchard and Rob Grant having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be lost.

The Motion as amended having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

RESOLVED:-

“This Council believes that the City’s heritage and cultural assets are fundamental to our ambitions to attract investment and visitors and essential to the physical and mental well-being of our residents.

Moreover, the Council notes that many of these cultural assets were gifted to the people of Birmingham to be enjoyed in perpetuity, not to be used to balance the books for any one single Administration. Once they are gone, they are gone.

Libraries, public open spaces, playing fields, parks, theatres, orchestras, museums, and galleries, serve as the vibrant core of the communities they are located in.

During a cost-of-living crisis, access to arts, culture and recreation is more important than ever. However, we recognise that there is a disparity in access to the arts and green spaces across our city.

All communities should have free access to the information and skills that they need to support their local assets, including access to central government funding.

Council therefore commits to continue to look at all possible ways to:

- Protect all cultural and heritage assets, including all libraries, parks, playing fields, public open spaces and museum sites, from any capital disposals.
- Work with community campaigns such as the ‘Save Birmingham – protect our community places’ campaign by Cooperatives West Midlands, by supporting community asset transfers and other community-led governance models where these can be shown to be the best and most sustainable solution to protecting the long-term future of these assets.
- Work closely with Arts and Culture organisations, the community sector, external funding organisations and other partners to promote that the city is open for business despite the Council’s own challenges and that its arts and culture offering remains rich and vibrant, with world-class performances and exhibitions with something for everyone.

- Replicate Friends of Parks and/ or Birmingham Open Spaces Forum resident volunteer models to help manage and maintain cultural and heritages sites and services, and;
- Develop a work programme for Scrutiny to review the policy plans of the “Digital, Culture, Heritage and Tourism” portfolio to assess the current ‘health’ of our arts, heritage and cultural assets, their risk of disposal and strategies to protect their provision in the short-, mid- and long-term.”

B. Councillors Robert Ayoub Khan and Izzy Knowles had given notice of the following Notice of Motion:-

(See document No. 9, agenda item 10)

Councillor Ayoub Khan moved the Motion which was seconded by Councillor Izzy Knowles.

In accordance with Council Rules of Procedure, Councillors Majid Mahmood and Mariam Khan gave notice of the following amendment to the Motion:-

(See document No. 10, ‘Amendments – City Council’)

Councillor Majid Mahmood moved the amendment which was seconded by Councillor Mariam Khan.

In accordance with Council Rules of Procedure, Councillors Richard Parkin and Rick Payne gave notice of the following amendment to the Motion:-

(See document No. 11, ‘Amendments – City Council’)

Councillor Richard Parkin moved the amendment which was seconded by Councillor Rick Payne.

In accordance with Council Rules of Procedure, Councillors Nicky Brennan and Saima Suleman gave notice of the following amendment to the Motion:-

(See document No. 12, ‘Amendments – City Council’)

Councillor Nicky Brennan moved the amendment which was seconded by Councillor Saima Suleman.

In accordance with Council Rules of Procedure, Councillors Julien Pritchard and Rob Grant gave notice of the following amendment to the Motion:-

(See document No. 13, 'Amendments – City Council')

Councillor Julien Pritchard moved the amendment which was seconded by Councillor Rob Grant.

A debate ensued.

During the debate, a 30-minute extension to the meeting was proposed by Councillor Roger Harmer. This was seconded by Councillor Julien Pritchard.

As the debate continued, Councillor John Cotton proposed another 30-minute extension to the meeting. This was seconded by Councillor Robert Alden.

Councillors Robert Alden, Councillor John Cotton, Sharon Thompson, Richard Parkin, Baber Baz, Kerry Jenkins, Waseem Zaffar, Liz Clements, Amar Khan, Shehla Moledina, Saqib Khan, Jack Deakin spoke during the debate.

The Lord Mayor invited Councillor Ayoub Khan to sum up.

The amendment to the Motion in the names of Councillors Majid Mahmood and Mariam Khan having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

The amendment to the Motion in the names of Councillors Richard Parkin and Rick Payne having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be lost.

Names were called and the Chamber doors were locked.

Here upon a poll being demanded the voting was as follows:-

For the amendment (18)

Bruce Lines	Robert Alden	Ewan Mackey
Timothy Huxtable	Alex Yip	Deirdre Alden
David Barrie	Rick Payne	Ken Wood
Adrian Delaney	Adam Higgs	Darius Sandhu
Kerry Brewer	Gareth Moore	David Pears
Debbie Clancy	Richard Parkin	Matt Bennett

Against the amendment (66)

Rob Grant	Julien Pritchard	Mariam Khan
Saddak Miah	Lauren Rainbow	Sir Albert Bore
Karen McCarthy	Sharon Thompson	Kath Hartley
Sam Forsyth	Des Hughes	Saqib Khan
Jane Jones	Marcus Bernasconi	Mary Locke
Jayne Francis	Kath Scott	Diane Donaldson
Liz Clements	Ziaul Islam	Shehla Moledina
Phil Davis	David Barker	Barbara Dring
Jamie Tennant	Mohammed Idrees	Rob Pocock
Mahmood Hussain	Majid Mahmood	Brigid Jones
Basharat Mahmood	Narinder Kaur Kooner	Shabrana Hussain
Zafar Iqbal	Fred Grindrod	Miranda Perks
Amar Khan	Raqeeb Aziz	Kerry Jenkins
Nicky Brennan	Hendrina Quinnen	Ray Goodwin
Waseem Zaffar	Shabina Bano	Saima Suleman
Jilly Bermingham	Lee Marsham	Sybil Spence
John Cotton	Rinkal Shergill	Rashad Mahmood
Lisa Trickett	Martin Brooks	Marje Bridle
Bushra Bi	Colin Green	Izzy Knowles
Mumtaz Hussain	Ayoub Khan	Penny Wagg
Paul Tilsley	Baber Baz	Zaker Choudhry
Morriam Jan	Roger Harmer	Deborah Harries

Abstentions (1)

Jack Deakin

The amendment to the Motion in the names of Councillors Nicky Brennan and Saima Suleman having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

The amendment to the Motion in the names of Councillors Julien Pritchard and Rob Grant having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be lost.

The Motion as amended having been moved and seconded was put to the vote and by a show of hands was declared to be carried.

It was therefore-

RESOLVED:-

“This council recognises that the horrors and repercussions of the conflict in Palestine and Israel have had a profound affect across all communities, but notably the Muslim and Jewish communities here in

Birmingham.

West Midlands Police, and organisations like the CST and Tell Mama have reported a rise in both Islamophobic and antisemitic hate incidents.

In Birmingham, we have seen incidences of antisemitic and Islamophobic graffiti, with more than two hundred tags of a racist, offensive, antisemitic or Islamophobic nature reported and removed since October 7th. We must not allow the tragic events in the Middle East to divide our communities in the city, and we understand and feel the pain of all people in the city, especially the Muslim and Jewish communities.

This Council condemns those who have used this crisis to whip up hatred, sow division, and spread misinformation in our city.

This council acknowledges that it has a duty of care to the people of Birmingham, and must lead the way in promoting peace, tolerance and respect.

This Council notes:

1. There is a humanitarian catastrophe in Gaza. It is likely that this will impact Gazans throughout 2023 and beyond.
2. An immediate and sustainable ceasefire is needed, so that aid can get into Gaza, the hostages can be freed, and work can take place to deescalate this horrific conflict. Save the Children have highlighted that more children have been reported killed in this conflict than the annual number of children killed across the world's conflicts zones since 2019. The international community has a responsibility to work towards a peace process and a two-state solution.
3. It is unlikely that many Palestinians will be able to return home for a substantial time.
4. With Birmingham having a proud status as a City of Sanctuary for people fleeing war torn countries and persecution. It is important that we in Birmingham, together with other communities in the UK, prepare to accommodate any refugees from this conflict that seek re-location.
5. Building on the success of the Homes for the Ukraine Scheme, a similar package must be offered to refugees choosing to flee the conflict.

This Council therefore:

6. Will write to the Government seeking the provision of a support package for refugees fleeing the conflict and provide further aid to assist the UN Agencies in their humanitarian work so that British citizens can get home safely, and Palestinian people are able to stay in their homeland.”.
7. Will support the active engagement of the voluntary sector in delivering aid and support to refugees from the conflict.
8. Will proactively engage with any Government schemes to house refugees from the conflict to ensure that all refugees are given a warm welcome in Birmingham.
9. Calls on everyone in Birmingham to show tolerance and respect at this time of significant stress to many communities; especially those of the Muslim and Jewish faiths.
10. Will work with faith communities to explore setting up more third-party hate crime reporting mechanisms and write to the Home Secretary to urge Government to reverse its decision to downgrade the monitoring of non-crime hate incidents specifically related to antisemitism and Islamophobia so they can be logged by the police.”

The meeting ended at 2015 hours.



CITY COUNCIL

**7 NOVEMBER
2023**

**WRITTEN
QUESTIONS TO
CABINET
MEMBERS**

OFFICIAL

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

WRITTEN QUESTIONS

A To the Leader of the Council

1. Assets

From Councillor Debbie Clancy

2. Job Evaluation Advice

From Councillor Adam Higgs

3. Option 3

From Councillor Bruce Lines

4. JE Addendum

From Councillor Rick Payne

5. Best Value Assessment

From Councillor Ron Storer

6. Job Evaluation Forward Plan

From Councillor Darius Sandhu

7. Council House

From Councillor Adrian Delaney

8. Pay Equity Presentation

From Councillor Richard Parkin

9. s114 warnings

From Councillor Robert Alden

10. Peer Reviews

From Councillor Deirdre Alden

11. Trade Union conversations

From Councillor Gareth Moore

12. JE Best Value Assessment

From Councillor Timothy Huxtable

13. Statutory Recommendation 2019

From Councillor Ken Wood

14. Dispute payments

From Councillor Kerry Brewer

15. Staff questions

From Councillor David Barrie

16. Perry Barr Scheme Inreach

From Councillor David Pears

17. Perry Barr Scheme Budget

From Councillor Alex Yip

18. Library lit up for Israel

From Councillor Ewan Mackey

19. New Ways of Working

From Councillor Meirion Jenkins

20. Ladywood engagement meetings

From Councillor Morriam Jan

21. External legal advice

From Councillor Matt Bennett

22. Yardley conservation society

From Councillor Deborah Harries

B To the Deputy Leader of the Council

1. S114 warnings

From Councillor Robert Alden

2. FOIs

From Councillor Darius Sandhu

C To the Cabinet Member for Children, Young People and Families

1. **MOVED TO J4**
2. **Right Help. Right Time**
From Councillor Adrian Delaney
3. **Home to School Transport**
From Councillor Adam Higgs
4. **Home to School Transport Appeals**
From Councillor Ron Storer
5. **Probation services**
From Councillor Morriam Jan
6. **Actions following trauma motion**
From Councillor Roger Harmer

D To the Cabinet Member for Digital, Culture, Heritage & Tourism

MOVED TO B2

E To the Cabinet Member for Environment

1. **MHRC costs**
From Councillor Meirion Jenkins
2. **MHRC fly tipping**
From Councillor Adrian Delaney
3. **New Ways of Working**
From Councillor Alex Yip
4. **Fleet and Waste Night time allowance**
From Councillor Adam Higgs
5. **Depot Health and Safety**
From Councillor Robert Alden
6. **Fleet and Waste Home Working**
From Councillor David Pears
7. **MOVED TO A22**

8. **Old Yardley Park**
From Councillor Izzy Knowles
9. **Tree removal in Yardley East**
From Councillor Colin Green
10. **Recycling stations in the city**
From Councillor Penny Wagg
11. **MHRC vehicles**
From Councillor Morriam Jan
12. **Deykin Avenue**
From Councillor Mumtaz Hussain
13. **Perry Park**
From Councillor Jon Hunt
14. **Moseley trees**
From Councillor Zaker Choudhry
15. **Cannon Hill Park**
From Councillor Baber Baz

F To the Cabinet Member for Finance and Resources

1. **Oracle budget**
From Councillor David Barrie
2. **Oracle budget**
From Councillor Matt Bennett
3. **Oracle budget**
From Councillor Alex Yip
4. **Spend control board diesel fuel for parks vehicles**
From Councillor Deirdre Alden
5. **Moved to A21**
6. **Manual bank reconciliations**

From Councillor David Pears

7. **Direct Debits**

From Councillor Ron Storer

8. **s114 warnings**

From Councillor Robert Alden

9. **Write-offs**

From Councillor Ewan Mackey

10. **Car Parking**

From Councillor Adam Higgs

G To the Cabinet Member for Health and Social Care

NONE SUBMITTED

H To the Cabinet Member for Housing and Homelessness

1. **Families in temporary accommodation**

From Councillor Roger Harmer

2. **Homelessness**

From Councillor Ayoub Khan

3. **Homelessness**

From Councillor Morriam Jan

**I To the Cabinet Member for Social Justice, Community
Safety and Equalities**

1. MOVED TO C5

2. MOVED TO C6

3. **Dealing with legacy issues relating to slavery and law
breaking**

From Councillor Jon Hunt

4. **Actions that can be taken on legacy issues**

From Councillor Zaker Choudhry

5. **Law breaking and dishonourable conduct**

From Councillor Baber Baz

J To the Cabinet Member for Transport

1. **Traffic Enforcement Cameras**

From Councillor Jon Hunt

2. **Moseley Village car park**

From Councillor Izzy Knowles

3. **Moseley Village car park**

From Councillor Colin Green

4. **School Crossing Patrols**

From Councillor Debbie Clancy

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR DEBBIE CLANCY**

“Assets”

Question:

Please provide a list of all assets the council owns outside the city boundaries, and the estimated value of each.

Answer:



Copy of BCC
Properties outside bh

The values provided are indicative and where available. In some instances, in particular for assets where there is unlikely to be any comparable open market evidence, valuations are based on depreciated replacement cost methodology, and therefore do not represent a realistic sale price achievable from a third party.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR ADAM HIGGS**

“Job Evaluation Advice ”

Question:

On how many occasions, and on what dates, did Officers recommend to you the Hay Job Evaluation scheme as the quickest, best value approach to resolving equal pay, and on how many occasions did you reject this?

Answer:

The decision with regard to methodology rested in the first instance with the Council Business Management Committee, and members of that committee chose not to proceed with an outsourced option at the meeting held on 1st September 2023.

The City Council subsequently confirmed this approach, with the endorsement of Government appointed commissioners, at the EGM on 12th October 2023.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR BRUCE LINES**

“Option 3”

Question:

Prior to putting forward Option 3 for Job Evaluation on the CBMC report, did you have any discussions with any of the recognised Trade Unions regarding this option?

Answer:

All negotiations relating to potential job evaluation options were conducted through formal officer channels.

I have regular scheduled meeting with our recognised Trade Unions in my capacity as Leader and as portfolio holder for HR. A variety of issues are discussed at these meetings.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR RICK PAYNE**

“JE Addendum”

Question:

At what date and time did each of the three recognised trade unions formally sign the addendum to the job evaluation scheme, and the date and time and person who signed on behalf of the city council?

Answer:

All three of the Council's recognised trade unions agreed the terms of the addendum electronically between Friday 20th October and Saturday 21st October 2023.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR RON STORER**

“Best Value Assessment”

Question:

At what date and time did you receive, and read, the best value assessment for the Job Evaluation Scheme agreed on 22 October 2023?

Answer:

I suggest that Cllr Storer re-reads the Commissioner commentary at the front page of the report tabled at the Council EGM, if he requires reassurance on these matters.

Also he will recall that the Commissioners were appointed by the Secretary of State to ensure the City Council complies with the Best Value Duty.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR DARIUS SANDHU**

“Job Evaluation Forward Plan”

Question:

The January 2023 Forward Plan shows a proposed decision on Job Evaluation to be taken at Cabinet on 14 February 2023. This was first added to the forward plan in December 2022. Why was this item removed from the February agenda?

Answer:

Key decisions are required to be included on the forward plan at least 28 days prior to taking a report to cabinet, however it does not mean that it needs to be taken on that date. At the time it was felt that some adjustments to the proposals in the paper submitted in April 2022 may be necessary.

Therefore no paper was submitted and officers began consultations in February with the trade unions with a view to reach agreement on possible adjustments to the Job Evaluation programme expecting to lead to a renewed cabinet paper at their conclusion.

A proposed decision on Job Evaluation remained on the forward plan.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR ADRIAN DELANEY**

“Council House”

Question:

Please provide a copy of the options produced in partnership with Glenn Howell Architects and Arcadis for the re-imagining of the Council House, including when the work was commissioned, the original brief for the work provided by the council, and the data the options were presented to the council.

Answer:

The “OFCP – Reimagining the Council House” report dated December 2022 is attached. The work was commissioned in December 2021 as part of a wider commission providing baseline studies for the “Our Future City Plan” work which supported the production of the “Our Future City: Draft Central Birmingham Framework 2040” launched in May 2023. The project involved a Cross-party Working Group including leaders of the main political groupings, and the final report was presented to the Working Group and also in separate briefings with the former Leader and Deputy Leader of the Council, and with the Leader of the Opposition Group.

The part of the brief relating to the Council House stated:

“Future of the Council House

B53 Provide input to the development of proposals to re-imagine the Council House as a community hub with a range of activities and uses that opens the use of the building to the city and its residents, workers and visitors by bringing in knowledge of best-practice, international examples and testing the boundaries to maximise the un-tapped potential of the building, its location and relationship to the surrounding public realm including Victoria Square. This will include identification of high-level costs and consideration of viability.”



OFCP-Council House
Complex-Final Design

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR RICHARD PARKIN**

“Pay Equity Presentation”

Question:

The 25 July Cabinet Report on Pay Equity contained at Appendix 4 an extract of slides from a presentation. Please provide a full copy of the full slide deck from which they were taken.

Answer:

These two slides, as presented on 25th July 2023 as Appendix 4 of the paper, represent the full presentation.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR ROBERT ALDEN**

“s114 warnings”

Question:

Please list all dates and times of meetings or correspondence in which the possibility of a s114 notice needing to be issued was raised with you by any officer, either as Leader or Cabinet Member before that?

Answer:

Following the announcement of the Equal Pay Liability in June 2023, the Section 151 Officer was in ongoing conversation with myself and the Deputy Leader around the circumstances in which a s114 notice would be triggered, as a result of this liability. This included during weekly meetings with myself and during the development of the report in relation to a new Pay Equity Scheme. At the Cabinet Member / CLT Away Day on 13th July, Cabinet were informed of the circumstances in which a S.114 noticed might be triggered.

Further, two formal letters from the Statutory Officers to myself and the Deputy Leader were issued on 17th July 2023 and 11th August 2023 outlining the consequences of a Section 114 notice and the potential of this arising as a result of the Equal Pay liability.

The Deputy Leader and I were informed of a S.5 and a second S.114 being triggered if a date was not set for the Pay Equity report to be considered by CBMC, on Wednesday 20th September after 5pm. As soon as this meeting took place, I sent an email to the statutory officers at 5:35pm taking on board their advice and requested that the CBMC meeting be convened on 28th September to enable the requisite five clear working days' notice for calling the meeting.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR DEIRDRE ALDEN**

“Peer Reviews”

Question:

Please provide a copy of all peer reviews of the City Council since 2012.

Answer:

Since 2012 the organisation has had 5 Peer reviews, which can be made available for Councillor Alden following the meeting:

- Children’s Services Peer Review – 2014
- Education and School Strategy and Improvement Plan peer challenge - 2015
- Planning Improvement Peer Challenge – 2019
- Legal Service Peer Review – 2019
- Governance Peer Challenge – 2019

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR GARETH MOORE**

“Trade Union conversations”

Question:

Please list all dates since May 2022 on which you have had conversations, whether in person, call or via messaging, with anyone from the Trade Unions regarding Equal Pay and Job Evaluation, and on each occasion confirm if a council officer was present, or copied into the conversation.

Answer:

I have regular scheduled meetings with our recognised Trade Unions in my capacity as Leader and portfolio holder for HR, as outlined in my answer to question A3.

These include the Corporate Consultative Committee – a formal Council consultative forum which is attended by officers of the Council.

Since May 2022, the Committee has met on the following dates:

22 September 2022, 8 December 2022, 9 March 2023, 29 June 2023

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR TIMOTHY HUXTABLE**

“JE Best Value Assessment”

Question:

Please provide a copy of the Best Value Assessment for the Job Evaluation Scheme agreed on 22 October 2023.

Answer:

The Job Evaluation Scheme agreed on 22 October 2023 was supported and endorsed by the Commissioners appointed by the Secretary of State to ensure that the City Council complies with the Best Value Duty.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR KEN WOOD**

“Statutory Recommendation 2019”

Question:

In 2019 the Council received a third set of statutory recommendations from Auditors. One of these recommendations was to complete the development of a contingency plan to minimise the effects of equal pay risks should they occur. Please provide a copy of this contingency plan along with an update with the date each identified action was completed.

Answer:

During 2019 a number of reports were brought to Audit Committee with regards to the topic of Equal Pay. The contents of which are available for viewing on CMIS.

A specific report in relation to this statutory recommendation was not presented to Audit Committee, and current officers are unable to identify such a contingency plan.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR KERRY BREWER**

“Dispute payments”

Question:

In each year since 2012, how many COT3 or similar payments have been made to employees within the fleet and waste service to settle disputes and what was the total value of these in each year?

Answer:

As equal pay settlements are role specific rather than service area specific, we are unable to confirm how many settlements have been paid to employees in generic, non-frontline roles (e.g. admin assistant) in Fleet and Waste since 2012. However, we can confirm that there have been no occasions where a payment has been made to settle a legal claim for equal pay from an employee in a frontline role in Fleet and Waste in return for agreeing to withdraw legal action for equal pay since 2012.

The number of settlements made under Employment Tribunals, Failure to consult claims and impact on Service Deliver are:

Year	Amount	Claimant(s)	Reason
2018	£3,538.40	7 Claimants	Failure to consult claims
2018	£4,577.46	8 Claimants	Failure to consult claims
2019	£3,000	261 Claimants	Parity payment claims
2019	£500	1 Claimant	Parity payment claims
2019	£3,000	17 Claimant	Parity payment claims
2019	£500	17 Claimant	Parity payment claims
2019	£9,000	1 Claimant	Settlement of ET claim
2019	£14,000	1 Claimant	Settlement of ET claim
2022	£16,863.04	1 Claimant	Impact on service delivery

2022	£20,071.47	1 Claimant	Impact on service delivery
2023	£5,500	1 Claimant	Settlement of ET claim
2023	£7,500	1 Claimant	Settlement of ET claim
2023	£9,261.75	1 Claimant	Settlement of ET claim
2023	£6,000	1 Claimant	Settlement of ET claim

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR DAVID BARRIE**

“Staff questions”

Question:

Please provide a list of all questions submitted, whether answered or not, to the last 3 Chief Exec webinars, with names anonymised.

Answer:

All questions from the webinars are answered here: [General | Frequently asked questions about section 114 | Birmingham City Council Portal](#)

Where the same or similar questions are received, they are collated to provide one answer.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR DAVID PEARS**

“Perry Barr Scheme Inreach”

Question:

How many of the properties in the Perry Barr residential scheme (former athletes village) does the council plan to sell to Inreach?

Answer:

The Council is currently in dialogue with InReach to explore the potential to lease the 270 apartments within Plot 7 of the PBRS Development to InReach for an interim period in order to deliver much needed rental homes quickly, increase InReach’s operational platform, and start to create a real sense of “place” in this exciting new housing scheme.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR ALEX YIP**

“Perry Barr Scheme Budget”

Question:

Please provide the most up-to-date breakdown of the budget for the Perry Barr residential scheme, including the amount spent so far, final forecasted gross cost (including those costs associated with the original plan for the games and associated infrastructure), amount expected to be recouped through property sales (net of any agency costs), amount recouped to date from property sales (including breakdown of the number sold by unit type), and any write-off of budget losses.

Answer:

An updated Full Business Case (FBC) for the Perry Barr Regeneration Scheme was approved by Cabinet on 27 July 2021. This set out estimated total costs (including those already incurred at that time) of £539.9million, with associated funding (mainly from grants and expected disposal proceeds) amounting to £494.1million, resulting in a net scheme cost of £45.8million. This report did however identify a range of options for the further development of subsequent phases of the regeneration scheme, with the potential to realise additional net receipts of up to £64.5million.

Work is currently underway to review and update the overall FBC for the regeneration scheme, including setting out the proposals for the delivery of the next phases, and this will be presented to Cabinet and Commissioners in due course.

To date, the main activity on the overall scheme has been focussed on land acquisition and construction of accommodation on the first four plots of the core site, with work now focussed on progressing the disposal of the first 968 apartments that have been constructed (and that are at differing stages of fit-out in preparation for occupation).

By 31 March 2023, total costs of £482.5million had been incurred, offset by income generated (principally grants, contributions and disposal proceeds) of £212million – with the balance of £270.5million funded through prudential borrowing.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR EWAN MACKEY**

“Library lit up for Israel”

Question:

Whilst we are grateful you answered our request to light up the Library of Birmingham in the colours of the Israeli flag to mark the barbaric terrorist attack on 7 October 2023, why did neither the Library of Birmingham or the main Council twitter accounts promote this, as they did on numerous other occasions for example Black Lives Matter, OneDay4Children, Nelson Mandela, Srebrenica, the Commonwealth Games, Indian Independence Day, Polio, and... Flybe's inaugural flight from BHS to Belfast.

Answer:

The Council, as we have done for other counties and cities following terror attacks, wanted to show the city's solidarity with Israel and the citizens in our city who were impacted by the actions of Hamas, a recognised terrorist organisation. We also followed national guidance on raising the flag and lighting up of public buildings and landmarks, so following the attack on the 7th Oct we, along with other cities, raised the flag of Israel outside Council House for 24hrs. We also lit up the Library of Birmingham in the colours of the Israeli flag.

Birmingham is a multi-diverse place and we are proud of the fact we have many different nations, religions and backgrounds making up our wonderful city. Since October 7th representatives from BCC have also met with Jewish Leaders and our key Mosques in the city, to ensure all communities within our city are feeling heard and officers will maintain contact with them.

Also during national hate crime awareness week – 14th October – we used our social media to call on everyone to celebrate the uniqueness of our city and continue to make it a place that everyone feels safe. As a City of Sanctuary Birmingham has long been known for its warm welcome and for being a place where people fleeing from war and persecution can come and build new lives.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR MEIRION JENKINS**

“New Ways of Working”

Question:

Please provide a copy of any documentation detailing ‘new ways of working’ shared with staff in any department outlining changes in working practices.

Answer:

The “New Ways of Working” programme was established, over 3 years ago to support Our Future Council proposals underpinned by a communication framework and cascade plan.

This programme initially took the lead role in cascading communications for reopening and closure of buildings outlining new ways due to Covid restrictions.

Early 2021 the New Ways of Working programme launched further messaging related to “Moving from Lockdown to the New Norm”. All colleagues were directed to access [this link](#) on our intranet pages. At this point the [New Ways of Working intranet pages](#), Yammer Group and NWOW Bulletin Board also went live which you will be able to access.

Since its launch circa. 350-650 (3-5 per week) new ways of working bulletins have been cascaded supported with a [FAQs page](#) on the intranet updated which is updated.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR MORRIAM JAN

“Ladywood engagement meetings”

Question:

“In the last set of written questions, I asked about engagement events with residents in Ladywood and was advised that events were going to be set up: I see that these events took place between Mon 16 Oct and Wed 1 Nov.

Can the Leader please provide attendance data relating to each event. Can this data be broken down by demographic group/ resident ward/ consultation event date and can it make clear the number of staff who were present at each event, separate to the public attendances?”

Answer:

Following the ward forum in July 2023, a door knocking exercise took place around homes in the Ladywood Estate between mid-September 2023 to early October 2023.

The purpose of these sessions was to provide direct engagement with residents in each of the proposed development phases, to understand communication preferences, accessibility needs and the way in which residents wanted to be kept informed moving forward.

This exercise was followed by an initial block of 12 workshops at the Ladywood Methodist Church, attendance was limited for most sessions to a maximum of 25 people, to enable residents to ask questions, share concerns and discuss key issues in a meaningful way.

Workshops finished on the 1st November 2023 and were well attended.

Between now and January 2024, the Council will be working on collating the information from these sessions, sharing this across the broader estate and sense checking whether this is a representative view across the board.

We will then work closely with Berkeley Homes, using workshop outcomes to inform development of a Community Charter; setting out what our offer will be to residents throughout the life of the project, the different ways in which they can be involved and how we will be sharing information moving forward.

Given that these sessions required specific registration from residents and that we have not had their consent to share details, it would not be appropriate to share specifics at this time.

The sessions were split up into tenure groups to enable people to have more specific conversations about their circumstances - these sessions were delivered by Council officers who had experience in engagement, supported by those who had technical expertise in the relevant field and tenure type.

Residents will be given the opportunity to share their feedback on the success of these sessions moving forward.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR MATT BENNETT**

“External legal advice”

Question:

What was the total cost of the external legal advice referenced in the Auditor's statutory recommendations, that the political leadership sought to challenge the advice of the council officers? Please break with down by individual instructions and the date each was requested.

Answer:

The Council's external lawyers, who are supporting the Council on equal pay, were instructed by the City Solicitor to advise further on the Council's Best Value Duty following a letter from Minister Rowley on 29th August 2023 and not to challenge previous advice from Council Officers. This advice was provided, in a conference call on 31st August 2023. The cost of this advice was £10,000.00.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR DEBORAH HARRIES**

“Yardley conservation society”

Question:

“As one of the oldest Conservation Areas in Birmingham, having been so designated in 1969, can you please confirm the date upon which the appraisal and management plan, in development for the best part of a year, will be completed in order for residents and interested groups, such as the Yardley Conservation Society, to be consulted on the plan?”

Answer:

Work has commenced on the Old Yardley Conservation Appraisal and Management Plan. Owing to a resource pressure within the Conservation team, there has been a delay in getting a draft of this document completed and a draft circulated for consultation. The team are progressing with this work now with a target consultation point of the first quarter of 2024.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE DEPUTY LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR ROBERT ALDEN**

“s114 warnings”

Question:

Please list all dates and times of meetings or correspondence in which the possibility of a s114 notice needing to be issued was raised with you by any officer, either as Deputy Leader or Cabinet Member before that?

Answer:

Following the announcement of the Equal Pay Liability in June 2023, the Section 151 Officer was in ongoing conversation with the Leader and myself around the circumstances in which a s114 notice would be triggered, as a result of this liability. This included during weekly meetings with the Leader, and during the development of the report in relation to a new Pay Equity Scheme. At the Cabinet Member / CLT Away Day on 13th July, Cabinet were informed of the circumstances in which a S.114 notice might be triggered.

Further, two formal letters from the Statutory Officers to Leader and myself were issued on 17th July 2023 and 11th August 2023 outlining the consequences of a Section 114 notice and the potential of this arising as a result of the Equal Pay liability.

I was advised by the Chief Executive on Monday 4th September at 10:30am of a potential S.114 notice being issued. The Leader and I were informed of a S.5 and a second S.114 being triggered if a date was not set for the Pay Equity report to be considered by CBMC, on Wednesday 20th September after 5pm. As soon as this meeting took place, the Leader sent an email to the statutory officers at 5:35pm taking on board their advice and requested that the CBMC meeting be convened on 28th September to enable the requisite five clear working days' notice for calling the meeting.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE DEPUTY LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM
COUNCILLOR DARIUS SANDHU**

“FOIs”

Question:

The Council has stated that it has seen an increased number of FOI requests since the publication of the s114 notice on 5 September and this has resulted in some delays in response times. For the period 5 September to 31 October 2023, and for the same periods in 2022 and 2021, please state the number of FOI requests received and the percentage of response sent that were within 20 working days.

Answer:

Due to the press coverage about Birmingham City Council's current financial situation, this generated an increase in FOI requests relating to equal pay and information relating to advice sought on S114.

Period	Number of FOIs	% Responded within 20 working days
5 Sept to 31 Oct 2023	423	52%. *
5 Sept to 31 Oct 2022	313	82%
5 Sept to 31 Oct 2021	307	76%

*Please note a number of FOIs for this period are still within the 20 working day timescales for responding and therefore this will affect the % for this period.

C1

**PLEASE NOTE WRITTEN QUESTION C1 – CYPF - HAS NOW BEEN
REDIRECTED TO J4 – CABINET MEMBER FOR TRANSPORT**

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR CHILDREN, YOUNG PEOPLE AND FAMILIES FROM COUNCILLOR ADRIAN DELANEY

“Right Help. Right Time”

Question:

In May 2023, in response to a legal claim seeking Judicial Review on behalf of an 11-year-old boy who was refused support, the Council said that it was reviewing the criteria for the provision of services by the Children's Disabilities Team and the Right Help Right time policy to address the issues raised. They also advised that a new threshold criterion for the provision of services would be published the following month (June 2023) Please can you provide an update on this review and the changes to the threshold, including the dates of consultation and publication of the thresholds and policy.

Answer:

Birmingham Children's Trust has undertaken a fundamental review of relevant legal obligations, policy and procedures and has sought independent legal advice in relation to the new draft policy.

The interdependencies between policies and other documents relating to disabled children and their families, both within the Trust and elsewhere, are complex. Officers have therefore sought to ensure consideration is given to more than the threshold criteria document and Right Help Right Time framework. This deliberately careful approach has meant the timeline for producing and publishing the policy publication has been extended.

The Trust is working with parents and with the Council for Disabled Children and will be consulting more widely on the new policy and procedures later this month (November 2023).

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR CHILDREN, YOUNG PEOPLE AND FAMILIES FROM COUNCILLOR ADAM HIGGS**“Home to School Transport”****Question:**

Since September 2022, how many complaints/reports have been made about children on the home-to-school transport service due to a) lateness b) not being collected c) being dropped at the wrong place d) concerns about their safety on the journey.

Answer:

The Children and Young People’s Travel Service currently supports 5,177 children and young people with transport each day, with a further 200 students supported with Personal Transport Budgets. 1278 transport routes operate each day.

Complaints received by Children and Young People’s Travel Service from Sept 2022 – October 2023 are listed below.

Month	Lateness	Not being collected	Being dropped at the wrong place	Concerns about safety on journey
Sep-22	6	0	0	6
Oct-22	4	1	0	2
Nov-22	4	2	0	15
Dec-22	1	7	0	9
Jan-23	0	20	0	19
Feb-23	1	5	0	7
Mar-23	1	0	0	2
Apr-23	2	1	0	2
May-23	0	0	0	1
Jun-23	1	3	0	1
Jul-23	0	2	0	1
Aug-23	0	1	0	0
Sep-23	5	1	0	2
Oct-23	2	3	0	3

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR CHILDREN, YOUNG PEOPLE AND FAMILIES FROM COUNCILLOR RON STORER

“Home to School Transport Appeals”

Question:

Please list all eligible providers for home-to-school transport under the new framework contract commenced on 1 November 2023.

Answer:

The Children and Young People's Travel Service framework of providers that commenced on 1 November 2023 is comprised of two 'lots'.

Lot 1 is for suppliers of Public Service Vehicles (vehicles that can provide 9 passenger seats or more). 10 providers have been appointed to this lot:

- AFJ Ltd
- Community Transport
- Gray Essex Ltd
- Green Destinations Ltd
- HATS Group Ltd
- Lawrence Garage
- London Hire Community Services
- Shencare Community Transport
- Star Cars and Coaches
- Travel SOS

Lot 2 is for suppliers of smaller vehicles, Private Hire Vehicles (“PHV”) and Taxis (vehicles with 8 passenger seats or less). 18 providers have been appointed to this lot:

- 247 Cars
- AFJ Ltd
- Akaash Travel
- Droach Travel
- Elite Radio Cars
- Grays Essex Ltd
- Green Destinations Ltd
- Halo Transfers
- HATS Group Ltd
- Lawrence Garage

- London Hire Community Services
- Select Private Hire
- Smart Kids Group
- Solihull Cars
- Star Cars & Coaches
- Take Me Services Ltd
- Taxie Ltd
- Touch Wood Private hire

C5

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR CHILDREN, YOUNG PEOPLE AND FAMILIES FROM COUNCILLOR MORRIAM JAN

“Probation services”

Question:

“In full council on 12 September, I included a reference in my speech to the August 2022 report on probation services. I correctly stated that the result of this inspection was inadequate.

You stopped the meeting to correct the record to “requires improvement” but as you will see from the attached report, I was indeed quoting accurately. Can you re-correct the record? An inspection of probation services in: Birmingham North, East and Solihull PDU (justiceinspectorates.gov.uk)”

Answer:

As we were discussing youth justice, I misunderstood the point to be about the recent HM Inspector of Probation’s report on the Youth Offending Service. I am happy to correct the record.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR CHILDREN, YOUNG PEOPLE AND FAMILIES FROM COUNCILLOR ROGER HARMER

“Actions following trauma motion”

Question:

“On 12 September in full council, a motion was passed on trauma. Please advise what actions the council has taken that relate directly to the motion since it was passed.”

Answer

:

Since the motion was approved on September 12th, we are currently in the process of coordinating dates with service areas to explore ways in which the council can enhance its trauma-informed approach. Additionally, we aim to assess the required training programs during this initiative.

**PLEASE NOTE WRITTEN QUESTION D - HAS NOW BEEN REDIRECTED
TO B2 – DEPUTY LEADER**

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR ENVIRONMENT
FROM COUNCILLOR MEIRION JENKINS**

“MHRC costs”

Question:

What is the current monthly cost of the MHRCs?

Answer:

The basic average monthly cost of the 8 MHRC vehicles is £41,600.

All other costs are amalgamated within the overall costs for the street cleansing service and will vary depending on the number of staff employed on the MHRC, whether they are full-time or agency, and the tonnage of waste collected.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR ENVIRONMENT
FROM COUNCILLOR ADRIAN DELANEY**

“MHRC fly tipping”

Question:

On how many occasions, by month since they commenced, have MHRC crews arrived to find fly tipping ahead of their scheduled collection times?

Answer:

Although we are aware of it having happened on rare occasions, no record is kept of the frequency or quantity of waste deposited at MHRC locations outside the collection times. All promotional material for the service does however include information regarding the illegality of this activity and that all waste should only be brought to the MHRC during prescribed times.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR ENVIRONMENT
FROM COUNCILLOR ALEX YIP**

“New Ways of Working”

Question:

Please provide a copy of the New Ways of Working in the Fleet and Waste Department published following the emergence from covid restrictions, including the date this was shared with staff and cabinet members.

Answer:

The operational memo below was issued to staff working within the service on 27 June 2022.



Colleagues

As you are aware, following consultation with Trade Union Colleagues in April 2022, we moved to an outcome based working scenario. I thought it would be useful to provide an update and to clarify some areas which may have caused confusion as I need to be clear about what is expected from all crews.

Firstly, I want to clarify what we mean by outcomes. Outcomes are what we achieve and the purpose of working in the new way is to ensure that we provide:

- Cleaner streets
- Better experience for the citizens that live in these streets
- Reduction in complaints
- Increase in compliments
- Better working conditions for you
- Ability to spend time on training and development
- Ensuring health and safety of our people, vehicles and depots are maintained
- Opportunities for team meetings, 1-2-1's, appraisals and staff briefings so that you know what is happening across the Council and feel well informed

- Your well being is managed and you feel part of the wider team

What does this mean for you?

In line with the Woods Report there is an expectation that each round will take between 5-6 hours to complete them safely, making sure that we are providing the best service to the citizens of Birmingham. This **does not** mean that once rounds are complete, you can then go home.

In order to meet the above outcomes, you are expected to complete the work allocated for that working day by your manager.

In order to complete rounds safely and effectively, each round should take a minimum of 5 hours and a maximum of 6 hours to complete, dependant on size of the round, traffic condition etc. Further to this the vehicle will need to go through the weighbridge and tip their load.

Once your round is complete, you should notify your line manager before returning, this is to ensure that your collection stream is fully collected and where other crews need support, you can be deployed to help out prior to returning back at the depot. Once back crews will be expected to use their remaining working day productively to:

- Clean down vehicles
- Complete safety checks of vehicles
- Undertake training
- Carry out 1-2-1's, appraisal
- team meetings/briefings
- Toolbox Talks
- Use laptops provided to check wage, slips, read Council wide communications, look at training opportunities etc.

We have recently purchased a number of laptops and we have more on the way. This should enable you to have better access. We are also arranging some IT skills workshops for you. More details to follow over the next few weeks.

I would also like to remind all staff, that they are expected to attend depots at the start and end of the working day. No-one will be allowed to leave work until the whole depot work is completed.

Perry Barr whilst going through the regeneration of the depot will continue to use a hybrid scenario as discussed. Some of the NWOW changes won't come in to affect until we move to the normal operating depot in early 2023.

The vehicle external sanitisation has now come to an end and teams will go back to keeping their cabs and trucks clean and clear of debris in the cabs. The vehicle cleansing/digging out will continue as normal by the vehicle cleansing teams.

We have agreed that Staff can start at 5.00 am to check vehicle and travel to their first round but work out on the patches **cannot commence** until 6am.

There may be some business cases put forward for a slightly earlier start however this will mainly be for work that has to be done such as within the City Centre linked to our Trade work.

If a driver feels that their round needs to start earlier this should be discussed with his/her ASM who will develop a business case to be presented to the senior management team who will seek guidance from the City Councils legal team for agreement or refusal.

Driver Team Leaders

They will be responsible for the team, and we will be taking steps for the drivers to meet the objectives within their Job Description this will include:

- o The first levels of sickness management.
- o Ensuring safety of the team at all times i.e., no pulling of two bins, PPE compliance etc.
- o Ensure the WRCO and loader are working in line with expectations i.e., putting bins back where they were picked from or as close as possible.
- o Ensure PPE compliance of the team.
- o Speak to the team in crew briefings and bring forward any issues or training needs of the crew for management to consider.
- o Round management with the team to ensure that any issues on the round are raised to the next level and dealt with appropriately. We will be giving full training and instruction to be able to meet these objectives.

Waste Reduction and Collection Officers (WRCO)

They will also be working to their Job Descriptions and to clarify, this means:

- o To be responsible for the safety of the loaders the back of the vehicle when working.
- o To engage with service users as required to resolve issues as they present themselves whilst out working, again further training will be provided to help meet these objectives.

Loaders

They will

- o Follow instructions from the driver and WRCO.
- o Work safely and conscientiously at all times.
- o Highlight issues on the round to the Driver or WRCO for action.

Assistant Service Manager involvement:

- o The local ASMs will be working alongside all the teams to ensure that all work is completed and to act as a catalyst to ensure that this happens.
- o They will be out working with all crews on a daily basis offering help and support.
- o The ASM will help solve collection issues as they present themselves with a view of unblocking any problems we have with access, round sizing and any other issue that causes collection problems.

Service Manager Involvement:

The service Manager will also be there to help with issues as they arise and will be at hand as required to help and support the ASM and driver team leaders in their day-to-day duties.

We want to ensure that the service is delivering best in class and during the last couple of months, we have seen a big reduction in missed collection and a real team effort to provide a great service to our customers and we want this to continue.

At the Joint Service Improvement Board meeting on Wednesday, chaired by Councillor Majid Mahmood, he wanted to place on record, thanks to all of you for your hard work and efforts and he will be writing to you all himself. He will be working with us and his fellow Councillors to help with educating residents which should help us with improving the service even further.

To summarise, once the shift has ended please use this time to:

- Clean down vehicles
- Complete safety checks of vehicles
- Undertake training
- Carry out 1-2-1's, appraisal, crew meetings/briefings
- Toolbox Talks
- Record incidents, reports and referrals
- Return to works

There may be occasions where you can undertake training or work related admin in a different location if you have the equipment to do so e.g. lap top or another device.

This could be done at home as an example but you will be required to provide evidence of what you have done.

I hope this clarifies how we will be working in a different way and I hope that you can see both the benefits for the teams but how this will also improve the customer experience for our citizens.

I want to share with you my sincere thanks for the work and support during and post Covid. You are making a positive difference for our residence that we serve.

Thank you all,

Darren Share

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'D. Share', followed by a period.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR ENVIRONMENT
FROM COUNCILLOR ADAM HIGGS**

“Fleet and Waste Night time allowance”

Question:

Please provide details of the Night-time Allowance within fleet and waste, including what rate is paid for it, what it is paid for, and how much has been paid out in each year since 2018.

Answer:

Night-time Allowance is paid at time-and-a-third for hours worked between 8pm and 6am only when part of the normal working week for the business area.

In Street Scene, this is normally paid for time worked between 5am and 6am, but some container crews start earlier. The early start is to enable crews to access traffic sensitive areas at times when the roads are quieter.

The majority of night rate is paid as an additional permanent allowance, paid as a percentage of salary and based on the employee rota.

For example: An employee works Mon–Fri from 5am to 12.48pm (which includes 30 min lunch) = 7.3 hours per day.

1 hour (5am–6am) per day means that 5 hours per week in that example will attract night allowance.

Total cost of Unsocial Hours payments from April 2018 to October 2023 is

£1,022,334.37

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR ENVIRONMENT
FROM COUNCILLOR ROBERT ALDEN**

“Depot Health and Safety”

Question:

In each year since 2012, please provide a breakdown of health and safety incidents at each depot, including the total number of reports, the amounts paid out in any fines, amounts paid out in compensation, and the number that resulted in any disciplinary action.

Answer:

Accident, incident and near miss statistics, whereby logged upon the corporate accident reporting system, indicate the location of occurrence at a depot within Street Scene (formally Fleet/Waste management)** as per the table below:

Time period: January 2012 - December 2022:

Year	Accident	Incident	Near Miss	RIDDOR submitted to HSE	Total for year
2012	64	3	1	15	68
2013	36	2	1	5	39
2014	87	9	5	12	101
2015	62	28	4	14	94
2016	34	6	2	5	42
2017	24	2	0	1	26
2018	35	13	1	3	49
2019	83	41	6	12	130
2020	80	53	1	8	139
2021	42	14	3	3	59

2022	45	17	2	6	64
Totals	592	188	26	84	806

****Caveats to data:**

- Data does not include agency workers.
- Data does not include accident, incident or near miss reports from other directorates outside of Street Scene (formally Fleet/Waste management).
- Data has not been trend analysed.
- Data limited to what has been reported on the Corporate Accident Reporting system.
- Does not take into account any local records held.

The amounts paid out in any fines, amounts paid out in compensation, and the number that resulted in any disciplinary action have been requested from Legal and HR respectively, and will follow as soon as they have been retrieved.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR ENVIRONMENT
FROM COUNCILLOR DAVID PEARS**

“Fleet and Waste Home working”

Question:

How many employees in the fleet and waste service spend one or more days a week (average) working from home?

Answer:

Staff delivering front line waste services do not work from home.

Business Support Services (e.g. administration/clerical) are working in an agile way – they are employed by Business Support within Council Management, supporting City Operations.

This could be based at depots, the Council House, other CAB buildings or home.

Senior Management will also be agile working and are working from different bases, based on work needs/priorities.

E7

PLEASE NOTE WRITTEN QUESTION E7 – CABINET MEMBER FOR ENVIRONMENT - HAS NOW BEEN REDIRECTED TO A22 – THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR ENVIRONMENT FROM
COUNCILLOR IZZY KNOWLES**

“Old Yardley Park”

Question:

“Further to discussions with local historian Mike Byrne, could the parks and conservation departments please consider ways to protect the remains of the medieval ‘ridge and furrow’ farming system, next to the medieval manor house ‘double moat’ in Old Yardley Park.

Large mowers and modern grass cutting techniques and machinery appear to be taking the top off this historic feature and damaging it.”

Answer:

We would like to offer to meet Mr Byrne on site with representatives from our grounds maintenance team to work out an improved approach to the area that ensures an understanding of the particular geographical features and ensures no damage occurs to the ridge and furrow areas when we begin the mowing season next year.

In the short term, I will ask the team involved to adopt a more sympathetic approach when cutting this area. This will be achieved by raising the height of the cutting blades to leave a longer length of grass and so give more space between the ground and the blades, so avoiding potential damage to the field.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR COLIN GREEN

“Tree removal in Yardley East”

Question:

“In the last three months – August, September, October (partial) - I have received a large number of notifications about tree removals in my ward of Yardley East. In total, I have had eight notification emails, with a total of 40 trees identified for varying reasons, including new planting failure, disease/decay, dead and structural integrity.

This number of notifications is considerably more than I have received in the whole time I have been a Councillor, since October 2021, and I also understand one or two other colleagues have received an increase in notifications.

Can you please explain this sudden increase and confirm that: for each tree removed, another will be planted in Yardley East, as I understand is a requirement, and if those trees fail, they are automatically replaced?”

Answer:

Highway Trees are inspected on a cyclical 5-year programme. Yardley East is currently being inspected as part of the 2023/2024 arboriculture inspection route, which will explain the increase in the number of tree notifications.

For every tree that is removed a new tree is planted, ideally in the same location. Where this is not possible, a new tree will be planted in a different location within the same ward.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR ENVIRONMENT FROM
COUNCILLOR PENNY WAGG**

“Recycling stations in the city”

Question:

**“Is there a plan and timeline to swap traditional waste bins in the city centre
with recycling stations?”**

Answer

:

We are currently developing a Litter Strategy and any changes to the current waste bin provision will be identified in that. Any changes in bin provision will need to be considered against the ongoing spend control backdrop.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR ENVIRONMENT FROM
COUNCILLOR MORRIAM JAN**

“MHRC vehicles”

Question:

“How long is the current contract that employs the MHRC vehicles?”

Answer:

The MHRC vehicles are leased on a rolling contract which has no fixed-term element. This is funded from the MHRC budget.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR ENVIRONMENT FROM
COUNCILLOR MUMTAZ HUSSAIN**

“Deykin Avenue”

Question:

Can we please have a date for the clear up of Deykin Avenue and assurances that the clear up will be completed given that it is a serious environmental hazard?”

Answer:

All visible asbestos was removed by the council earlier this year.

As you will understand, all council spend is subject to the controls laid out in the s.114 notice that was recently issued.

We have sought clarity on what this means for work with residents and community groups on the clearance of **privately-owned** or **unregistered** alleyways.

We understand that the residents themselves may well be victims of waste crime and officers from within the Waste Enforcement Unit will investigate any allegations of flytipping.

Where there is flytipping that requires our input to remove, we will now have to let the Waste Enforcement team carry out investigations, attempt to contact the residents/occupiers and then issue appropriate notices for removal to them.

If there is no removal of dumped waste after this, and there is rodent activity, the team can request involvement from the council's Love Your Streets (LYS) team and we will also have to consider billing of the occupiers that have legal responsibility for the private alleyway.

This has previously been shown to be a net loss to the Local Authority (which has no legal requirement to clear the land) due to the difficulties around identification and pursuance of the responsible parties. This may therefore prove to be a service area that continues to be withdrawn and is currently under discussion at the operational and executive level including input from legal services.

This will inevitably mean there will be a lengthening of timescales for LYS support and intervention, for which we apologise, but it is vital we follow the financial

guidance issued to us as we support the wider recovery from the challenges the city council faces.

If there are other areas in your ward that we can work with you on in the meantime that come under public ownership, please let us know so we can discuss and get something arranged as soon as possible.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR ENVIRONMENT FROM
COUNCILLOR JON HUNT**

“Perry Park”

Question:

“Despite assurances and responses to petitioners, there is no sign of work taking place to reinstate Perry Park or remove the fencing around the bulk of the park? Could the leader discuss with the commissioners the urgency of this work, including in the discussion the reinstatement of the former children’s play area with the £150,000 commuted from the Commonwealth Games specifically for this purpose?”

Answer:

I appreciate the concerns raised in this question and can give assurance that the reinstatement of Perry Park and replacement of the Children’s play area are conditions associated with the original approved planning application for the development of the Stadium and use of the park for the Commonwealth Games, and therefore need to be completed.

The issuing of the s.114 notice and subsequently-approved recovery plan have impacted all capital developments including the Stadium and Perry Park.

We are still working through the governance process and what impact this will have on the overall programme.

However, the Parks service are working up plans to reinstate further areas of the park and remove fencing currently in place.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR
ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR ZAKER
CHOUDHRY**

“Moseley trees”

Question:

**“How many trees were planted, and how many were
removed in 2022/2023?”**

Please list the reasons for removal”

Answer:

As an elected member for South Yardley, thank you for expressing a keen interest in trees situated in Moseley.

For the trees under the responsibility of Highways, 23 trees were removed from Moseley in 2022/23. 10 were planted in last year’s planting programme, with the remaining 13 due to be planted in this years’ programme.

The reasons for removal are listed below:

Road Name	Reason for Removal	Size Category	Species of Tree
ETON ROAD	New Planting Failure	A	Tilia platyphyllos 'Rubra'
ETON ROAD	New Planting Vandalised	A	Tilia platyphyllos 'Rubra'
MOORCROFT ROAD	Disease/Decay	A	Prunus cerasifera Pissardii
MOOR GREEN LANE	Failure	D	Betula pendula
KINGSWOOD ROAD	Unauthorised Removal-New Plant	A	Malus 'Rudolph'
KINGSWOOD ROAD	Dead	B	Sorbus x thuringiaca
YARDLEY WOOD ROAD	New Planting Vandalised	A	Ginkgo biloba
DADS LANE	Senescent	C	Acer pseudoplatanus
EASTLANDS ROAD	Structural Integrity	A	Malus 'Evereste'
WAKE GREEN ROAD	Malicious Damage	A	Liriodendron tulipifera

ALCESTER ROAD	New Planting Failure	A	Tilia cordata 'Greenspire'
ALCESTER ROAD	New Planting Failure	A	Crataegus x lavalleei 'Carrier'
ALCESTER ROAD	New Planting Vandalised	A	Crataegus x lavalleei 'Carrier'
ALCESTER ROAD	Failure	A	Ulmus glabra
ALCESTER ROAD	Dead	A	Ulmus glabra
YARDLEY WOOD ROAD	Structural Integrity	E	Tilia x europaea
BELLE WALK	New Planting Vandalised	A	Tilia cordata x mongolica 'Har'
AMESBURY ROAD	New Planting Failure	A	Carpinus betulus fastigiata
BELLE WALK	Unauthorised Removal	A	Betula ermanii
WAKE GREEN ROAD	Malicious Damage	A	Acer x freemanii Autumn Blaze
GREENEND ROAD	Dead	A	Malus baccata
GREENEND ROAD	Senescent	B	Pyrus calleryana 'Chanticleer'
CAMBRIDGE ROAD	Malicious Damage	A	Acer platanooides

For the trees under the responsibility of the Parks Department, the information requested will not be available within the timeframe given before the deadline for these answers, however I will ensure you receive this as soon as possible thereafter. The POPI team will interrogate the management system and provide this for you.

Ahead of this, whilst we do not record the exact reason why each tree has been felled, I can confirm that Park trees are only felled if they are dead, diseased, dangerous or if they are proven to be a causal factor in a tree-related subsidence claim or are causing direct damage to buildings and structures. Trees are also sometimes removed to maintain the stability of flood defences.

Generally, directly comparing numbers removed with numbers planted does not give a clear picture of the benefits the trees are providing. Good performance indicators are canopy cover and the tree equity in an area. The council has been working with Birmingham Tree People and together have created a very informative tree information website, which I would encourage you to visit: <https://uk.pg-cloud.com/BTP/>

Moseley currently reports a very high 43% canopy cover, which is amongst the best in the city.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR ENVIRONMENT FROM
COUNCILLOR BABER BAZ**

“Cannon Hill Park”

Question:

“Please provide the following financial data for Cannon Hill Park:

Gross revenue obtained by Birmingham City Council from car parking charges and enforcement including Russell Road and Queens Ride car parks in the financial year 2022/23.

Total amount spent on repayments of loans/investment incurred to install the car park charging equipment.

Total amount spent on infrastructure at the park such as lighting, resurfacing, CCTV and itemise expenditure.

Total amount of car park revenue spent on other areas of the park or the MAC (please itemise the expenditure.)

Total amount of car park revenue spent elsewhere other than Cannon Hill Park or the MAC (please itemise the expenditure)”

Answer:

2022-23	£000s
Gross revenue from car parking charges	(422)
Repayments of loans (prudential borrowing)	56
Infrastructure spend	0
Revenue spend on MAC (net income share)	137
Revenue spend on the park (grounds maintenance and car park operational costs)	229

Details of gross revenue from enforcement for Russell Road and Queens Ride car parks is held by Highways and unavailable at site level.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR FINANCE AND RESOURCES FROM COUNCILLOR DAVID BARRIE

“Oracle budget”

Question:

Please provide a breakdown of the £100m bill to fix Oracle, including what has been spent so far, what it has been spent on, what more is projected to be spent and what it is to be spent on.

Answer:

Table 1, below, is taken from the Oracle Implementation Cabinet Report, June 2023, and shows the historic spend position and the forecast spend for FY23/24. The 23/24 cost forecast covered the Safe & Compliant (Stabilisation) work, and included costs for the design of the final, optimised Oracle solution. It did not include a cost forecast to deliver the final, Optimised solution.

The cost to deliver the final, Optimised solution is still being finalised and this will enable us to confirm what the total cost forecast will be. The aim is to confirm the final cost forecast by the end of this calendar year.

A report is being prepared for Finance & Resources OSC later this month to update on the FY23/24 spend position, as per Table 1. The key areas of spend include the cost of remediation work (i.e., technical fixes), additional staff to support manual workarounds, programme staff costs, and software licensing costs.

It is important to note that the £11.44m cost from Pre-23/24 in Table 1 was (and remains) provisional with work still underway in Finance to confirm the final figure.

Description	Cost (£m)		
	Pre-23/24	23/24	TOTAL
Previously approved budget (March 21)	£39.97		£39.97
Forecast spend (s&c + solution design)	£11.44	£29.24	£40.68
Contingency (@20% of 23/24)		£5.85	£5.85
TOTAL	£51.41	£35.08	£86.49
New funding for which approval is sought (row 2 + 3)			£46.53

Table 1. Oracle costs from June 2023 Cabinet Paper

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR FINANCE AND
RESOURCES FROM COUNCILLOR MATT BENNETT**

“Oracle budget”

Question:

Please provide a copy of any assessment carried out into value for money of the current plans to 'fix' oracle, including assessing other options such as scrapping the system and restarting with a new ERP.

Answer:

An assessment of various options is being undertaken as part of the work that the Oracle programme is doing to design the final, Optimised solution.

Grant Thornton our External Auditors are currently undertaking a value for money assessment of the Oracle Programme. The outcome of this assessment will be reported to Audit Committee is due course.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR FINANCE AND
RESOURCES FROM COUNCILLOR ALEX YIP**

“Oracle budget”

Question:

In July you said to me in response to an oral question that extensive legal advice had been taken over the 2017 bin dispute resolution and that you were told there was no equal pay risk. Now you have confirmed you have gone back and read the legal advice in the 2017 reports, would you like to formally correct this response and apologise to councillors for the misleading answer given in July?

Answer:

Councillor Jones addressed this issue at the last Ordinary Meeting of the City Council - Tuesday 11 July 2023, 2:00pm, in oral questions.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR FINANCE AND
RESOURCES FROM COUNCILLOR DEIRDRE ALDEN**

“Spend control board diesel fuel for parks vehicles”

Question:

A spend control board decision to reject diesel fuel for parks vehicles was reportedly rejected as it was a duplicate request. Please provide a copy of the original decision approving the funding, and a copy of the invoice showing it was paid.

Answer:

Some spend requests for fuel were submitted by individual officers (ref numbers 40, 50 and 52), which coincided with those officers' manager submitting a spend request form on behalf of the BPN service, covering all areas, (ref numbers 86 and 87).

At the S151 Spend Control Board on 13th September 2023 (notes attached) requests 40, 50 and 52 were approved and the duplicate requests (ref numbers 86 and 87) were withdrawn.

No grounds maintenance vehicle has been off the road due to having no fuel, either before or after September: work has not stopped.

There is not one invoice we can provide for this, as the costs cover a number of sites and cost is also until the end of the financial year, so is not fully paid yet.

**PLEASE NOTE WRITTEN QUESTION F5 – CABINET MEMBER FOR
FINANCE AND RESOURCES - HAS NOW BEEN REDIRECTED TO A21 –
THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL**

F6

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR FINANCE AND
RESOURCES FROM COUNCILLOR DAVID PEARS**

“Manual bank reconciliations

Question:

What is the total cost per month of the staff required to provide the manual work arounds for Oracle, including bank reconciliation?

Answer:

The total monthly cost of interim staff working in Transactional Services is circa £300,000 per month. Please note this is the cost for Transactional Services (Cash Management, Supplier Payments, Debt Collection, Payroll & Pensions, Data Governance and System Interfaces). Further to this, discrete packages of work are commissioned to deliver finance support for manual interventions, such as manual bank reconciliations delivered off system. This means the estimated total cost of manual interventions is circa £500,000 per month.

F7

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR FINANCE AND
RESOURCES FROM COUNCILLOR RON STORER**

“Direct Debits”

Question:

As of 1 April each year between 2018 and 2023, how many Direct Debits were the for Business Rates?

Answer:

Please find below table detailing number of Direct Debits for Business Rate, 2018-2023.

Year	Number of Hereditaments	Number of Accts on DD %	
2018-2019	47,345.00	13,055.00	23.51%
2019-2020	47,302.00	10,840.00	24.19%
2020-2021	47,737.00	11,789.00	21.80%
2021-2022	48,294.00	7,109.00	26.40%
2022-2023	48,200.00	7,293.00	21.38%
2023-2024	47,588.00	10,179.00	22.04%

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR FINANCE AND
RESOURCES FROM COUNCILLOR ROBERT ALDEN**

“s114 warnings”

Question:

Please list all dates and times of meetings or correspondence in which the possibility of a s114 notice needing to be issued was raised with you by any officer, either as Cabinet Member or Deputy Leader before that?

Answer:

Following the announcement of the Equal Pay Liability in June 2023, the Section 151 Officer was in ongoing conversation with Cabinet Members Leader around the circumstances in which a s114 notice would be triggered, as a result of this liability.

At the Cabinet Member / CLT Away Day on 13th July, Cabinet we were informed of the circumstances in which a S.114 noticed might be triggered.

F9

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR FINANCE AND
RESOURCES FROM COUNCILLOR EWAN MACKEY**

“Write-offs”

Question:

By year since 2018, including year to date, please provide a breakdown of how much debt has been written off by type of debt (council tax, business rates, social care charges, housing rent etc.)

Answer:

At this time we are unable, without manual resource, to produce this level of detail. As you will be aware Oracle went live in April 2022 with no standard reporting, currently. Once we have this detailed level of reporting from the various financial systems, we hope to have this information ready to share by the end of this month.

F10

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR FINANCE AND
RESOURCES FROM COUNCILLOR ADAM HIGGS**

“Car Parking”

Question:

In each year since 2018 please provide a breakdown of budgeted income versus actual income for each council car park and off-street parking locations.

Answer:

The budget income versus actual income for each council car park and off-street parking location is in the attached appendix.

G
**PLEASE NOTE NO WRITTEN QUESTIONS WERE SUBMITTED FOR THE CABINET
MEMBER FOR HEALTH AND SOCIAL CARE**

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR HOUSING AND HOMELESSNESS FROM COUNCILLOR ROGER HARMER

“Families in temporary accommodation”

Question:

“Please provide a breakdown of the number of families in temporary accommodation, month by month, over the past year. Can this data be made available regularly through the Birmingham Observatory?”

Answer:

Please see below the number of families in temporary accommodation over the past year:

Date	Households with Children in Temporary Accommodation
01/11/2022	3833
01/12/2022	3878
01/01/2023	3893
01/02/2023	3947
01/03/2023	3998
01/04/2023	4033
01/05/2023	4051
01/06/2023	4139
01/07/2023	4186
01/08/2023	4246
01/09/2023	4316
01/10/2023	4303
01/11/2023	4353

We will link into the Observatory team to explore how the data can be captured there.

H2

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR HOUSING AND HOMELESSNESS FROM COUNCILLOR AYOUB KHAN

“Homelessness”

Question:

“As we draw once again towards winter, what is being done to get street homeless people into permanent accommodation?”

Answer:

There is a street outreach offer 24 hours per day, 7 days per week. Outreach workers identify those who are rough sleeping and try to support into accommodation, or link in with other appropriate support services. They recognise that an offer of accommodation may not be an immediate priority for individuals, so will ensure that health, social care, addiction recovery services are also involved.

There are a range of accommodation offers available, from shared supported accommodation to independent accommodation via Birmingham City Council, Registered Social Landlords and private rented sector. Although some of these require referrals and take time to become available, support workers will be working intensively with those rough sleeping to offer interim accommodation and keep them updated on the progress of longer-term accommodation.

In addition to the daily outreach and support, short-term accommodation is made available during severe weather conditions. This is available regardless of previous exclusions, immigration status or local connection. Severe Weather Emergency Protocols are activated in the winter when temperatures fall below 0 degrees, or a red weather warning is issued by the Met Office.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR HOUSING AND
HOMELESSNESS FROM COUNCILLOR MORRIAM JAN**

“Homelessness”

Question:

“When will the next count of rough sleepers be administered?”

Answer:

Snapshot counts of rough sleepers occur on a monthly basis and are reported into DLUHC. Next snapshot count will be held at the end of November 2023.

An annual snapshot takes place nationally in Autumn. Birmingham annual snapshot count took place on 27 October 2023. Data is still being collated and will be independently verified. This will be released by DLUHC in February 2024.

**PLEASE NOTE WRITTEN QUESTION I1 AND I2 - HAVE NOW BEEN
REDIRECTED TO C5 AND C6 – CABINET MEMBER FOR CYP**

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR SOCIAL JUSTICE,
COMMUNITY AND EQUALITIES FROM COUNCILLOR JON HUNT

“Dealing with legacy issues relating to slavery and law breaking”

Question:

“What process exists to allow councillors and members of the public to report and provide evidence of inappropriate historical/ posthumous commendations, accolades, awards, statues or otherwise that should be reviewed due to legacy issues linked to slavery or racism?”

Answer:

Anyone can report concerns about legacy issues of this nature through the standard customer contact channels and they will be forwarded to the appropriate service to review depending on the issue highlighted.

For example, if the concern is about public art such as statues or monuments, it would be primarily addressed through the council’s Public Art Officers Gateway Group which includes external representatives from organisations such as Birmingham Civic Society and Birmingham Museums Trust.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR SOCIAL JUSTICE,
COMMUNITY AND EQUALITIES FROM COUNCILLOR ZAKER CHOUDHRY

“Actions that can be taken on legacy issues”

Question:

“What actions can this council take to remove historical/ posthumous commendations, accolades, awards, statues or otherwise of people celebrated by the city, who are linked to slavery or racism?”

Answer:

As advised in Question I3, anyone can report concerns about legacy issues of this nature through the standard customer contact channels and they will be forwarded to the appropriate service to review depending on the issue highlighted.

Each matter would then be considered. For example, in 2020 representations were received regarding a number of statues in the city. As a result, an academic research report was commissioned on the Boulton, Watt and Murdoch statue that led to the installation of a new interpretation panel with contribution from Black Heritage Walks.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR SOCIAL JUSTICE,
COMMUNITY AND EQUALITIES FROM COUNCILLOR BABER BAZ**

“Law breaking and dishonourable conduct”

Question:

**“Does the cabinet member agree that historical/ posthumous racism, or
dishonourable conduct is a sufficient reason to review and remove an honour
bestowed by the council?”**

Answer:

I agree that racism and dishonourable conduct should be investigated and reviewed by the council through the appropriate processes. After these processes have been followed and there is a recommendation that an honour bestowed by the council is to be removed, then I agree that this is the appropriate action.

Any representation can be made to the City Solicitor who will ensure that Council Business Management Committee considers the request.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR TRANSPORT FROM COUNCILLOR JON HUNT

“Traffic Enforcement Cameras”

Question:

“When can we expect the Traffic Enforcement Camera trial to begin and end?”

Answer:

On 31 May 2022, the Government enacted Part 6 of the Traffic Management Act (2004). This allows Local Transport Authorities outside of London to apply to the Secretary of State for Transport for powers to enforce moving traffic contraventions.

The Council made an application for these powers on 16 February 2023. The application process requires the Authority to consult upon and pursue enforcement of several trial sites. In compliance with these requirements, six sites were consulted upon, four of which required camera enforcement:

- **Newhall Street / Great Charles Queensway (A4400)** - Banned left & right turns.
- **Bristol Road (A38) / Priory Road (B4217)** - Banned left & right turns.
- **Kingsbury Road / Gravelly Hill (A5127)** - Banned right turn.
- **Corporation Street / James Watt Queensway (B4114)** - Banned left turn.

Due to the complexity of the Newhall Street / Great Charles Queensway and the Bristol Road (A38) / Priory Road (B4217) junctions, it is proposed to undertake the initial installation of cameras at the Kingsbury Road / Gravelly Hill (A5127) and the Corporation Street / James Watt Queensway (B4114) junctions. This will enable the processes and procedures required to integrate the camera system into the enforcement system to be developed.

It is proposed to submit the Full Business Case by the end of December 2023. Subject to approval the contractor will be appointed by February 2024.

The first two sites will then be installed in March 2024, the remaining two locations would then be implemented over the following months depending on the success of the first two. The trial is expected to last for 12 months from the go-live for each scheme.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR TRANSPORT FROM COUNCILLOR IZZY KNOWLES

“Moseley Village car park”

Question:

“Please provide the gross revenue received by BCC from car parking charges and enforcement for financial years 2017/18, 2018/19, 2019/20, 2020/21, 2021/22, 2022/23 for Moseley Village car park”

Answer

:

The gross revenue income received for the Moseley Village car park is provided in the table below.

Year	Income
2017/18	£88,039.00
2018/19	£87,993.00
2019/20	£83,023.00
2020/21	£33,300.00
2021/22	£73,598.00
2022/23	£84,378.00

Note - Enforcement expenditure/income (Penalty Charge Notices) is not coded into individual locations/car parks and so we are unable to respond to this element of the question.

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR TRANSPORT FROM
COUNCILLOR COLIN GREEN**

“Moseley Village car park”

Question:

**“Please provide the Total amount spent on repairs and maintenance over
financial years 2017/18, 2018/19, 2019/20, 2020/21, 2021/22, 2022/23 for Moseley
Village car park”**

Answer:

The total amount spent on repairs and maintenance for the Moseley Village car park is provided in the table below.

Year	Total spend
2017/18	£507.00
2018/19	£1,008.00
2019/20	£1,178.00
2020/21	£619.00
2021/22	£800.00
2022/23	£791.00

CITY COUNCIL – 7 NOVEMBER 2023

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR TRANSPORT
FROM COUNCILLOR DEBBIE CLANCY**

“School Crossing Patrols”

Question:

Please list all schools that have been unable to recruit to school crossing patrols due to s114 spending restrictions.

Answer:

The number of school crossing patrol posts that could be funded from the available school crossing patrol service budget are already filled and therefore the s114 spending restrictions has made no impact on recruitment.

J3

J3