



**MEETING OF BIRMINGHAM  
CITY COUNCIL  
26 FEBRUARY 2019**

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF BIRMINGHAM CITY COUNCIL HELD  
ON TUESDAY 26 FEBRUARY 2019 AT 1400 HOURS IN THE COUNCIL  
CHAMBER, COUNCIL HOUSE, BIRMINGHAM**

**PRESENT:-** Lord Mayor (Councillor Yvonne Mosquito) in the Chair.

**Councillors**

Muhammad Afzal	Peter Fowler	Majid Mahmood
Akhlaq Ahmed	Jayne Francis	Karen McCarthy
Mohammed Aikhlaq	Eddie Freeman	Saddak Miah
Alex Aitken	Peter Griffiths	Gareth Moore
Deirdre Alden	Fred Grindrod	Simon Morrall
Robert Alden	Roger Harmer	Brett O'Reilly
Tahir Ali	Kath Hartley	John O'Shea
Olly Armstrong	Adam Higgs	David Pears
Gurdial Singh Atwal	Charlotte Hodivala	Robert Pocock
Mohammed Azim	Jon Hunt	Julien Pritchard
David Barrie	Mahmood Hussain	Hendrina Quinnen
Baber Baz	Timothy Huxtable	Carl Rice
Bob Beauchamp	Mohammed Idrees	Lou Robson
Matt Bennett	Ziaul Islam	Gary Sambrook
Kate Booth	Morriam Jan	Kath Scott
Sir Albert Bore	Kerry Jenkins	Lucy Seymour-Smith
Nicky Brennan	Meirion Jenkins	Mike Sharpe
Marje Bridle	Julie Johnson	Sybil Spence
Mick Brown	Bridgid Jones	Ron Storer
Tristan Chatfield	Josh Jones	Martin Straker Welds
Zaker Choudhry	Nagina Kauser	Sharon Thompson
Debbie Clancy	Zaheer Khan	Paul Tilsley
Liz Clements	Narinder Kaur Kooner	Lisa Trickett
Maureen Cornish	Chaman Lal	Ian Ward
John Cotton	Mike Leddy	Mike Ward
Phil Davis	Bruce Lines	Suzanne Webb
Adrian Delaney	John Lines	Ken Wood
Diane Donaldson	Keith Linnecor	Alex Yip
Barbara Dring	Mary Locke	Waseem Zaffar
Mohammed Fazal	Ewan Mackey	

\*\*\*\*\*

**NOTICE OF RECORDING**

19169 The Lord Mayor advised that the meeting would be webcast for live and subsequent broadcasting via the Council's internet site and that members of the Press/Public may record and take photographs except where there are confidential or exempt items.

The Lord Mayor reminded Members that they did not enjoy Parliamentary Privilege in relation to debates in the Chamber and Members should be careful in what they say during all debates that afternoon

The Lord Mayor indicated that those Members who wished to speak should press their microphone button once and be patient whilst the operator switched the microphone on.

---

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

19170 The Lord Mayor reminded Members that they must declare all relevant pecuniary and non-pecuniary interests relating to any items of business to be discussed at this meeting"

Any declarations would be recorded in the minutes of the meeting.

The Lord Mayor noted that if a disclosable pecuniary interest is declared a Member must normally not speak or take part in that agenda item. However, the Independent Chair of Standards Committee, Peter Wiseman, has granted a dispensation to all Members attending Full Council on 26 February 2019 for the purpose of debating and voting on the Financial Plan 2019-2023, provided they have made a disclosable pecuniary interest.

The grounds for this dispensation are

that granting the dispensation is in the interests of persons living in the authority's area

or

that it is otherwise considered appropriate to grant a dispensation."

The Lord Mayor requested Members to please note that If a Member would like to speak on a matter where a pecuniary interest has been disclosed, then the Member will need to say BEFORE speaking on the substantive issue, that he/she has a pecuniary interest and that the details have already been disclosed to the Monitoring Officer before the start of the Meeting.

---

**MINUTES**

It was moved by the Lord Mayor, seconded and –

19171 **RESOLVED:-**

That the Minutes of the Meeting of the City Council held on 5 February 2019, having been printed and a copy sent to each Member of the Council, be taken as read and confirmed and signed.

---

**LORD MAYOR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS**

19172 The Lord Mayor indicated that she had no announcements to make.

---

**PETITIONS**

**Petitions Relating to City Council Functions Presented at the Meeting**

The following petitions were presented:-

(See document No 1)

In accordance with the proposals by the Members presenting the petitions, it was moved by the Lord Mayor, seconded and -

19173 **RESOLVED:-**

That the petitions be received and referred to the relevant Chief Officers.

---

**Petitions Update**

The following Petitions Update was submitted:-

(See document No 2)

It was moved by the Lord Mayor, seconded and -

19174 **RESOLVED:-**

That the Petitions Update be noted and those petitions for which a satisfactory response has been received, be discharged.

---

**CITY COUNCIL APPOINTMENTS**

Councillor Martin Straker Welds made a number of nominations and it was-

19175 **RESOLVED:-**

- i) Councillor Josh Jones to replace Councillor John Cotton on the Co-ordinating Overview and Scrutiny Committee and as Chair for the period ending with the Annual Meeting of City Council in May 2019.

- ii) Councillor John Cotton to replace Councillor Tristan Chatfield on the Standing Advisory Council on Religious Education and as Chair for the period ending with the Annual Meeting of City Council in May 2019.
  - iii) Councillor Phil Davis to replace Councillor Sybil Spence on the Licensing and Public Protection Committee for the period ending with the Annual Meeting of City Council in May 2019.
- 

**FINANCIAL PLAN 2019-2023**

At this point in the meeting Councillor Martin Straker Welds moved a procedural Motion which was seconded.

It was -

19176

**RESOLVED:-**

That, pursuant to a Council Business Management discussion, Standing Orders be waived to allocate the remaining time of the meeting to 1915 hours for the whole debate on the Financial Plan 2019-2023 report, permit the Leader of the City Council to make a speech of up to 30 minutes, permit the other Group Leaders to make a speech of up to 30 minutes each, permit all other speakers in the debate to speak for up to 5 minutes, permit the Leader of the City Council to reply to the debate without time limit, and agree that amendments to the Motions should be taken in the order that the amendments were notified to the Lord Mayor.

The Leader Councillor Ian Ward declared a pecuniary interest, the details of which he had disclosed to the Monitoring Officer before the start of the meeting and moved the motion which was seconded.

In accordance with Council Standing Orders, Councillors Robert Alden and Meirion Jenkins gave notice of the following amendment to the Motion:-

(See document No 3)

Councillor Robert Alden noted he had a pecuniary interest in that his wife worked in Birmingham Museums which he had disclosed before the meeting and moved the amendment which was seconded by Councillor Meirion Jenkins who reserved his right to speak.

In accordance with Council Standing Orders, Councillors Jon Hunt and Roger Harmer gave notice of the following amendment to the Motion:-

(See document No 4)

Councillor Jon Hunt moved the amendment which was seconded by Councillor Roger Harmer.

In accordance with Council Standing Orders, Councillors Matt Bennett and Ken Wood gave notice of the following amendment to the Motion:-

(See document No 5)

Councillor Matt Bennett moved the amendment which was seconded by Councillor Ken Wood.

In accordance with Council Standing Orders, Councillors Debbie Clancy and Ewan Mackey gave notice of the following amendment to the Motion:-

(See document No 6)

Councillor Debbie Clancy moved the amendment which was seconded by Councillor Ewan Mackey who indicated that he had a pecuniary interest, the details of which he had disclosed to the Monitoring Officer before the start of the meeting.

In accordance with Council Standing Orders, Councillors Paul Tilsley and Deirdre Alden gave notice of the following amendment to the Motion:-

(See document No 7)

Councillor Paul Tilsley moved the amendment which was seconded by Councillor Deirdre Alden.

A debate ensued during which Councillor Gary Sambrook declared a non-pecuniary interest in that his mother worked for Travel Assist and Councillor Brigid Jones declared a pecuniary interest in that her partner worked for the City Council which had been disclosed to the Monitoring Officer. Also during the debate it was questioned whether the date January 2018 in the fifth amendment by Councillors Paul Tilsley and Deirdre Alden should not read December 2017. Later in the meeting it was advised that the date of January 2018 in the amendment was correct.

---

## **ADJOURNMENT**

It was moved by the Lord Mayor, seconded and

19177

### **RESOLVED:-**

That the Council be adjourned until 1700 hours on this day.

The Council then adjourned at 1635 hours.

---

At 1705 hours the meeting resumed at the point it had been adjourned.

The debate continued.

The Leader, Councillor Ian Ward replied to the debate.

The first amendment to the Motions was put to the vote and, by the recorded vote set out below, was declared to be lost.

**For the First Amendment (25)**

Deirdre Alden	Eddie Freeman	Gareth Moore
Robert Alden	Adam Higgs	Simon Morrall
David Barrie	Charlotte Hodivala	David Pears
Bob Beauchamp	Timothy Huxtable	Gary Sambrook
Matt Bennett	Meirion Jenkins	Ron Storer
Debbie Clancy	Bruce Lines	Suzanne Webb
Maureen Cornish	John Lines	Ken Wood
Adrian Delaney	Ewan Mackey	Alex Yip
Peter Fowler		

**Against the First Amendment (62)**

Muhammad Afzal	Jayne Francis	Majid Mahmood
Akhlaq Ahmed	Peter Griffiths	Karen McCarthy
Mohammed Aikhlaq	Fred Grindrod	Saddak Miah
Alex Aitken	Roger Harmer	Brett O'Reilly
Tahir Ali	Kath Hartley	John O'Shea
Olly Armstrong	Jon Hunt	Robert Pocock
Gurdial Singh Atwal	Mahmood Hussain	Hendrina Quinnen
Mohammed Azim	Mohammed Idrees	Carl Rice
Baber Baz	Ziaul Islam	Lou Robson
Kate Booth	Morriam Jan	Kath Scott
Sir Albert Bore	Kerry Jenkins	Lucy Seymour-Smith
Nicky Brennan	Julie Johnson	Mike Sharpe
Marje Bridle	Brigid Jones	Sybil Spence
Tristan Chatfield	Josh Jones	Martin Straker Welds
Zaker Choudhry	Nagina Kauser	Sharon Thompson
Liz Clements	Zaheer Khan	Paul Tilsley
John Cotton	Narinder Kaur Kooner	Lisa Trickett
Phil Davis	Chaman Lal	Ian Ward
Diane Donaldson	Mike Leddy	Mike Ward
Barbara Dring	Keith Linnecor	Waseem Zaffar
Mohammed Fazal	Mary Locke	

**Abstentions (1)**

Julien Pritchard

## **City Council – 26 February 2019**

The second amendment to the Motions was put to the vote and, by the recorded vote set out below, was declared to be lost.

### **For the Second Amendment (30)**

Robert Alden	Eddie Freeman	Gareth Moore
David Barrie	Roger Harmer	Simon Morrall
Baber Baz	Adam Higgs	David Pears
Bob Beauchamp	Charlotte Hodivala	Gary Sambrook
Matt Bennett	Jon Hunt	Ron Storer
Zaker Choudhry	Timothy Huxtable	Paul Tilsley
Debbie Clancy	Morriam Jan	Mike Ward
Maureen Cornish	Meirion Jenkins	Suzanne Webb
Adrian Delaney	Bruce Lines	Ken Wood
Peter Fowler	Ewan Mackey	Alex Yip

### **Against the Second Amendment (55)**

Muhammad Afzal	Jayne Francis	Majid Mahmood
Akhlaq Ahmed	Peter Griffiths	Karen McCarthy
Mohammed Aikhlaq	Fred Grindrod	Saddak Miah
Alex Aitken	Kath Hartley	Brett O'Reilly
Tahir Ali	Mahmood Hussain	John O'Shea
Olly Armstrong	Mohammed Idrees	Robert Pocock
Gurdial Singh Atwal	Ziaul Islam	Hendrina Quinnen
Mohammed Azim	Kerry Jenkins	Carl Rice
Kate Booth	Julie Johnson	Lou Robson
Sir Albert Bore	Brigid Jones	Kath Scott
Nicky Brennan	Josh Jones	Lucy Seymour-Smith
Marje Bridle	Nagina Kauser	Mike Sharpe
Tristan Chatfield	Zaheer Khan	Sybil Spence
Liz Clements	Narinder Kaur Kooner	Martin Straker Welds
John Cotton	Chaman Lal	Sharon Thompson
Phil Davis	Mike Leddy	Lisa Trickett
Diane Donaldson	Keith Linnecor	Ian Ward
Barbara Dring	Mary Locke	Waseem Zaffar
Mohammed Fazal		

### **Abstentions (1)**

Julien Pritchard

## **City Council – 26 February 2019**

The third amendment to the Motions was put to the vote and, by the recorded vote set out below, was declared to be lost.

### **For the Third Amendment (33)**

Deirdre Alden	Eddie Freeman	Gareth Moore
Robert Alden	Roger Harmer	Simon Morrall
David Barrie	Adam Higgs	David Pears
Baber Baz	Charlotte Hodivala	Julien Pritchard
Bob Beauchamp	Jon Hunt	Gary Sambrook
Matt Bennett	Timothy Huxtable	Ron Storer
Zaker Choudhry	Morriam Jan	Paul Tilsley
Debbie Clancy	Meirion Jenkins	Mike Ward
Maureen Cornish	Bruce Lines	Suzanne Webb
Adrian Delaney	John Lines	Ken Wood
Peter Fowler	Ewan Mackey	Alex Yip

### **Against the Third Amendment (55)**

Muhammad Afzal	Jayne Francis	Majid Mahmood
Akhlaq Ahmed	Peter Griffiths	Karen McCarthy
Mohammed Aikhlaq	Fred Grindrod	Saddak Miah
Alex Aitken	Kath Hartley	Brett O'Reilly
Tahir Ali	Mahmood Hussain	John O'Shea
Olly Armstrong	Mohammed Idrees	Robert Pocock
Gurdial Singh Atwal	Ziaul Islam	Hendrina Quinnen
Mohammed Azim	Kerry Jenkins	Carl Rice
Kate Booth	Julie Johnson	Lou Robson
Sir Albert Bore	Brigid Jones	Kath Scott
Nicky Brennan	Josh Jones	Lucy Seymour-Smith
Marje Bridle	Nagina Kauser	Mike Sharpe
Tristan Chatfield	Zaheer Khan	Sybil Spence
Liz Clements	Narinder Kaur Kooner	Martin Straker Welds
John Cotton	Chaman Lal	Sharon Thompson
Phil Davis	Mike Leddy	Lisa Trickett
Diane Donaldson	Keith Linnecor	Ian Ward
Barbara Dring	Mary Locke	Waseem Zaffar
Mohammed Fazal		

### **Abstentions (0)**



## **City Council – 26 February 2019**

The fourth amendment to the Motions was put to the vote and, by the recorded vote set out below, was declared to be lost.

### **For the Fourth Amendment (32)**

Deirdre Alden	Eddie Freeman	Gareth Moore
Robert Alden	Roger Harmer	Simon Morrall
David Barrie	Adam Higgs	David Pears
Baber Baz	Charlotte Hodivala	Gary Sambrook
Bob Beauchamp	Jon Hunt	Ron Storer
Matt Bennett	Timothy Huxtable	Paul Tilsley
Zaker Choudhry	Morriam Jan	Mike Ward
Debbie Clancy	Meirion Jenkins	Suzanne Webb
Maureen Cornish	Bruce Lines	Ken Wood
Adrian Delaney	John Lines	Alex Yip
Peter Fowler	Ewan Mackey	

### **Against the Fourth Amendment (55)**

Muhammad Afzal	Jayne Francis	Majid Mahmood
Akhlaq Ahmed	Peter Griffiths	Karen McCarthy
Mohammed Aikhlaq	Fred Grindrod	Saddak Miah
Alex Aitken	Kath Hartley	Brett O'Reilly
Tahir Ali	Mahmood Hussain	John O'Shea
Olly Armstrong	Mohammed Idrees	Robert Pocock
Gurdial Singh Atwal	Ziaul Islam	Hendrina Quinnen
Mohammed Azim	Kerry Jenkins	Carl Rice
Kate Booth	Julie Johnson	Lou Robson
Sir Albert Bore	Brigid Jones	Kath Scott
Nicky Brennan	Josh Jones	Lucy Seymour-Smith
Marje Bridle	Nagina Kauser	Mike Sharpe
Tristan Chatfield	Zaheer Khan	Sybil Spence
Liz Clements	Narinder Kaur Kooner	Martin Straker Welds
John Cotton	Chaman Lal	Sharon Thompson
Phil Davis	Mike Leddy	Lisa Trickett
Diane Donaldson	Keith Linnecor	Ian Ward
Barbara Dring	Mary Locke	Waseem Zaffar
Mohammed Fazal		

### **Abstentions (1)**

Julien Pritchard

## **City Council – 26 February 2019**

The fifth amendment to the Motions was put to the vote and, by the recorded vote set out below, was declared to be lost.

### **For the Fifth Amendment (87)**

Muhammad Afzal	Peter Fowler	Ewan Mackey
Akhlaq Ahmed	Jayne Francis	Majid Mahmood
Mohammed Aikhlaq	Eddie Freeman	Karen McCarthy
Alex Aitken	Peter Griffiths	Saddak Miah
Deirdre Alden	Fred Grindrod	Gareth Moore
Robert Alden	Roger Harmer	Simon Morrall
Tahir Ali	Kath Hartley	Brett O'Reilly
Olly Armstrong	Adam Higgs	John O'Shea
Gurdial Singh Atwal	Charlotte Hodivala	David Pears
Mohammed Azim	Jon Hunt	Robert Pocock
David Barrie	Mahmood Hussain	Julien Pritchard
Baber Baz	Timothy Huxtable	Hendrina Quinnen
Bob Beauchamp	Mohammed Idrees	Carl Rice
Matt Bennett	Ziaul Islam	Lou Robson
Kate Booth	Morriam Jan	Gary Sambrook
Sir Albert Bore	Kerry Jenkins	Kath Scott
Nicky Brennan	Meirion Jenkins	Lucy Seymour-Smith
Marje Bridle	Julie Johnson	Mike Sharpe
Tristan Chatfield	Brigid Jones	Sybil Spence
Zaker Choudhry	Josh Jones	Ron Storer
Debbie Clancy	Nagina Kauser	Martin Straker Welds
Liz Clements	Zaheer Khan	Sharon Thompson
Maureen Cornish	Narinder Kaur Kooner	Paul Tilsley
John Cotton	Chaman Lal	Lisa Trickett
Phil Davis	Mike Leddy	Ian Ward
Adrian Delaney	Bruce Lines	Mike Ward
Diane Donaldson	Keith Linnecor	Suzanne Webb
Barbara Dring	Mary Locke	Ken Wood
Mohammed Fazal		Alex Yip
		Waseem Zaffar

### **Against the Fifth Amendment (0)**

### **Abstentions (0)**

## **City Council – 26 February 2019**

Motion 1 was put to the vote and, by the recorded vote set out below, was declared to be carried.

### **For Motion 1 (55)**

Muhammad Afzal	Jayne Francis	Majid Mahmood
Akhlaq Ahmed	Peter Griffiths	Karen McCarthy
Mohammed Aikhlaq	Fred Grindrod	Saddak Miah
Alex Aitken	Kath Hartley	Brett O'Reilly
Tahir Ali	Mahmood Hussain	John O'Shea
Olly Armstrong	Mohammed Idrees	Robert Pocock
Gurdial Singh Atwal	Ziaul Islam	Hendrina Quinnen
Mohammed Azim	Kerry Jenkins	Carl Rice
Kate Booth	Julie Johnson	Lou Robson
Sir Albert Bore	Brigid Jones	Kath Scott
Nicky Brennan	Josh Jones	Lucy Seymour-Smith
Marje Bridle	Nagina Kauser	Mike Sharpe
Tristan Chatfield	Zaheer Khan	Sybil Spence
Liz Clements	Narinder Kaur Kooner	Martin Straker Welds
John Cotton	Chaman Lal	Sharon Thompson
Phil Davis	Mike Leddy	Lisa Trickett
Diane Donaldson	Keith Linnecor	Ian Ward
Barbara Dring	Mary Locke	Waseem Zaffar
Mohammed Fazal		

### **Against Motion 1 (32)**

Deirdre Alden	Eddie Freeman	Simon Morrall
Robert Alden	Roger Harmer	David Pears
David Barrie	Adam Higgs	Julien Pritchard
Baber Baz	Charlotte Hodivala	Gary Sambrook
Bob Beauchamp	Jon Hunt	Ron Storer
Matt Bennett	Timothy Huxtable	Paul Tilsley
Zaker Choudhry	Morriam Jan	Mike Ward
Debbie Clancy	Meirion Jenkins	Suzanne Webb
Maureen Cornish	Bruce Lines	Ken Wood
Adrian Delaney	Ewan Mackey	Alex Yip
Peter Fowler	Gareth Moore	

### **Abstentions (0)**

## **City Council – 26 February 2019**

Motions 2-5 were put to the vote and, by the recorded vote set out below, were declared to be carried.

### **For Motions 2-5 (55)**

Muhammad Afzal	Jayne Francis	Majid Mahmood
Akhlaq Ahmed	Peter Griffiths	Karen McCarthy
Mohammed Aikhlaq	Fred Grindrod	Saddak Miah
Alex Aitken	Kath Hartley	Brett O'Reilly
Tahir Ali	Mahmood Hussain	John O'Shea
Olly Armstrong	Mohammed Idrees	Robert Pocock
Gurdial Singh Atwal	Ziaul Islam	Hendrina Quinnen
Mohammed Azim	Kerry Jenkins	Carl Rice
Kate Booth	Julie Johnson	Lou Robson
Sir Albert Bore	Brigid Jones	Kath Scott
Nicky Brennan	Josh Jones	Lucy Seymour-Smith
Marje Bridle	Nagina Kauser	Mike Sharpe
Tristan Chatfield	Zaheer Khan	Sybil Spence
Liz Clements	Narinder Kaur Kooner	Martin Straker Welds
John Cotton	Chaman Lal	Sharon Thompson
Phil Davis	Mike Leddy	Lisa Trickett
Diane Donaldson	Keith Linnecor	Ian Ward
Barbara Dring	Mary Locke	Waseem Zaffar
Mohammed Fazal		

### **Against Motions 2-5 (25)**

Deirdre Alden	Eddie Freeman	Simon Morrall
Robert Alden	Adam Higgs	David Pears
David Barrie	Charlotte Hodivala	Julien Pritchard
Bob Beauchamp	Timothy Huxtable	Gary Sambrook
Matt Bennett	Meirion Jenkins	Ron Storer
Debbie Clancy	Bruce Lines	Suzanne Webb
Maureen Cornish	Ewan Mackey	Ken Wood
Adrian Delaney	Gareth Moore	Alex Yip
Peter Fowler		

### **Abstentions (6)**

Baber Baz	Jon Hunt	Paul Tilsley
Roger Harmer	Morriam Jan	Mike Ward

## **City Council – 26 February 2019**

Motion 6 was put to the vote and, by the recorded vote set out below, was declared to be carried.

### **For Motion 6 (55)**

Muhammad Afzal	Jayne Francis	Majid Mahmood
Akhlaq Ahmed	Peter Griffiths	Karen McCarthy
Mohammed Aikhlaq	Fred Grindrod	Saddak Miah
Alex Aitken	Kath Hartley	Brett O'Reilly
Tahir Ali	Mahmood Hussain	John O'Shea
Olly Armstrong	Mohammed Idrees	Robert Pocock
Gurdial Singh Atwal	Ziaul Islam	Hendrina Quinnen
Mohammed Azim	Kerry Jenkins	Carl Rice
Kate Booth	Julie Johnson	Lou Robson
Sir Albert Bore	Brigid Jones	Kath Scott
Nicky Brennan	Josh Jones	Lucy Seymour-Smith
Marje Bridle	Nagina Kauser	Mike Sharpe
Tristan Chatfield	Zaheer Khan	Sybil Spence
Liz Clements	Narinder Kaur Kooner	Martin Straker Welds
John Cotton	Chaman Lal	Sharon Thompson
Phil Davis	Mike Leddy	Lisa Trickett
Diane Donaldson	Keith Linnecor	Ian Ward
Barbara Dring	Mary Locke	Waseem Zaffar
Mohammed Fazal		

### **Against Motion 6 (32)**

Deirdre Alden	Eddie Freeman	Simon Morrall
Robert Alden	Roger Harmer	David Pears
David Barrie	Adam Higgs	Julien Pritchard
Baber Baz	Charlotte Hodivala	Gary Sambrook
Bob Beauchamp	Jon Hunt	Ron Storer
Matt Bennett	Timothy Huxtable	Paul Tilsley
Zaker Choudhry	Morriam Jan	Mike Ward
Debbie Clancy	Meirion Jenkins	Suzanne Webb
Maureen Cornish	Bruce Lines	Ken Wood
Adrian Delaney	Ewan Mackey	Alex Yip
Peter Fowler	Gareth Moore	

### **Abstentions (0)**

## **City Council – 26 February 2019**

Motion 7 was put to the vote and, by the recorded vote set out below, was declared to be carried.

### **For Motion 7 (63)**

Muhammad Afzal	Jayne Francis	Majid Mahmood
Akhlaq Ahmed	Peter Griffiths	Karen McCarthy
Mohammed Aikhlaq	Fred Grindrod	Saddak Miah
Alex Aitken	Roger Harmer	Brett O'Reilly
Tahir Ali	Kath Hartley	John O'Shea
Olly Armstrong	Jon Hunt	Robert Pocock
Gurdial Singh Atwal	Mahmood Hussain	Julien Pritchard
Mohammed Azim	Mohammed Idrees	Hendrina Quinnen
Baber Baz	Ziaul Islam	Carl Rice
Kate Booth	Morriam Jan	Lou Robson
Sir Albert Bore	Kerry Jenkins	Kath Scott
Nicky Brennan	Julie Johnson	Lucy Seymour-Smith
Marje Bridle	Brigid Jones	Mike Sharpe
Tristan Chatfield	Josh Jones	Sybil Spence
Zaker Choudhry	Nagina Kauser	Martin Straker Welds
Liz Clements	Zaheer Khan	Sharon Thompson
John Cotton	Narinder Kaur Kooner	Paul Tilsley
Phil Davis	Chaman Lal	Lisa Trickett
Diane Donaldson	Mike Leddy	Ian Ward
Barbara Dring	Keith Linnecor	Mike Ward
Mohammed Fazal	Mary Locke	Waseem Zaffar

### **Against the Motion 7 (24)**

Deirdre Alden	Peter Fowler	Gareth Moore
Robert Alden	Eddie Freeman	Simon Morrall
David Barrie	Adam Higgs	David Pears
Bob Beauchamp	Charlotte Hodivala	Gary Sambrook
Matt Bennett	Timothy Huxtable	Ron Storer
Debbie Clancy	Meirion Jenkins	Suzanne Webb
Maureen Cornish	Bruce Lines	Ken Wood
Adrian Delaney	Ewan Mackey	Alex Yip

### **Abstentions (0)**

## **City Council – 26 February 2019**

Motion 8 was put to the vote and, by the recorded vote set out below, was declared to be carried.

### **For Motion 8 (54)**

Muhammad Afzal	Mohammed Fazal	Majid Mahmood
Akhlaq Ahmed	Peter Griffiths	Karen McCarthy
Mohammed Aikhlaq	Fred Grindrod	Saddak Miah
Alex Aitken	Kath Hartley	Brett O'Reilly
Tahir Ali	Mahmood Hussain	John O'Shea
Olly Armstrong	Mohammed Idrees	Robert Pocock
Gurdial Singh Atwal	Ziaul Islam	Hendrina Quinnen
Mohammed Azim	Kerry Jenkins	Carl Rice
Kate Booth	Julie Johnson	Lou Robson
Sir Albert Bore	Brigid Jones	Kath Scott
Nicky Brennan	Josh Jones	Lucy Seymour-Smith
Marje Bridle	Nagina Kauser	Mike Sharpe
Tristan Chatfield	Zaheer Khan	Sybil Spence
Liz Clements	Narinder Kaur Kooner	Martin Straker Welds
John Cotton	Chaman Lal	Sharon Thompson
Phil Davis	Mike Leddy	Lisa Trickett
Diane Donaldson	Keith Linnecor	Ian Ward
Barbara Dring	Mary Locke	Waseem Zaffar

### **Against the Motion 8 (33)**

Deirdre Alden	Jayne Francis	Gareth Moore
Robert Alden	Eddie Freeman	Simon Morrall
David Barrie	Roger Harmer	David Pears
Baber Baz	Adam Higgs	Julien Pritchard
Bob Beauchamp	Charlotte Hodivala	Gary Sambrook
Matt Bennett	Jon Hunt	Ron Storer
Zaker Choudhry	Timothy Huxtable	Paul Tilsley
Debbie Clancy	Morriam Jan	Mike Ward
Maureen Cornish	Meirion Jenkins	Suzanne Webb
Adrian Delaney	Bruce Lines	Ken Wood
Peter Fowler	Ewan Mackey	Alex Yip

### **Abstentions (0)**

## **City Council – 26 February 2019**

Motion 9 as amended was put to the vote and, by the recorded vote set out below, was declared to be carried.

### **For Motion 9 as amended (55)**

Muhammad Afzal	Jayne Francis	Majid Mahmood
Akhlaq Ahmed	Peter Griffiths	Karen McCarthy
Mohammed Aikhlaq	Fred Grindrod	Saddak Miah
Alex Aitken	Kath Hartley	Brett O'Reilly
Tahir Ali	Mahmood Hussain	John O'Shea
Olly Armstrong	Mohammed Idrees	Robert Pocock
Gurdial Singh Atwal	Ziaul Islam	Hendrina Quinnen
Mohammed Azim	Kerry Jenkins	Carl Rice
Kate Booth	Julie Johnson	Lou Robson
Sir Albert Bore	Brigid Jones	Kath Scott
Nicky Brennan	Josh Jones	Lucy Seymour-Smith
Marje Bridle	Nagina Kauser	Mike Sharpe
Tristan Chatfield	Zaheer Khan	Sybil Spence
Liz Clements	Narinder Kaur Kooner	Martin Straker Welds
John Cotton	Chaman Lal	Sharon Thompson
Phil Davis	Mike Leddy	Lisa Trickett
Diane Donaldson	Keith Linnecor	Ian Ward
Barbara Dring	Mary Locke	Waseem Zaffar
Mohammed Fazal		

### **Against the Motion 9 as amended (32)**

Deirdre Alden	Eddie Freeman	Simon Morrall
Robert Alden	Roger Harmer	David Pears
David Barrie	Adam Higgs	Julien Pritchard
Baber Baz	Charlotte Hodivala	Gary Sambrook
Bob Beauchamp	Jon Hunt	Ron Storer
Matt Bennett	Timothy Huxtable	Paul Tilsley
Zaker Choudhry	Morriam Jan	Mike Ward
Debbie Clancy	Meirion Jenkins	Suzanne Webb
Maureen Cornish	Bruce Lines	Ken Wood
Adrian Delaney	Ewan Mackey	Alex Yip
Peter Fowler	Gareth Moore	

### **Abstentions (0)**

Therefore it was-

19178

### **RESOLVED:-**

#### **1. Revenue Budget**

That the revenue budget for the financial year commencing on 1st April 2019 of £851.590m, including the budget allocations to the various Directorates of the Council, as set out in Appendix J to the Financial Plan 2019 – 2023, be approved subject to any revision needed in the light of the ongoing and further planned consultations and equalities assessments on individual savings proposals.



**2. Council Tax Requirement**

That the following calculations be now made in accordance with Section 31A of the Local Government Finance Act 1992, for the financial year commencing on 1st April 2019:

	£
a. aggregate of estimated City Council expenditure, contingencies, and contributions to financial reserves	3,113,523,893
b. Parish Precepts	1,882,539
c. aggregate of estimated income (including Top-Up Grant), and use of financial reserves	(2,312,589,811)
d. net transfers to/(from) the Collection Fund in relation to Business Rates	(453,540,177)
e. Transfer to/(from) the Collection Fund in relation to Council Tax	0
f. Council Tax Requirement, being the aggregate of (a) to (e) above	349,276,444

**3. Council Tax - Basic Amount**

That the Basic Amount of Council Tax for the financial year commencing on 1st April 2019 be set at £1,388.33, pursuant to the formula in Section 31B of the Local Government Finance Act 1992, being the Council Tax Requirement of £349,276,444 divided by the Council Tax Base of 251,580 Band D properties.

**4. Council Tax – City Council and Parish Precepts**

- (i) That the basic amount of Council Tax for City Council services for the financial year commencing on 1st April 2019 be set at £1,380.85 pursuant to the formula in Section 34(2) of the Local Government Finance Act 1992:

	£	£
a. Basic Amount calculated under Section 31B		1,388.33
LESS		
b. Parish precepts	1,882,539	
DIVIDED BY		
City Council Tax base	251,580	<u>7.48</u>
		1,380.85

**City Council – 26 February 2019**

- (ii) That, pursuant to Section 52ZB of the Local Government Finance Act 1992, the Basic Amount of Council Tax for City Council services is not excessive in relation to determining whether a referendum is required on the level of Council Tax.
- (iii) That the basic amount of Council Tax for New Frankley in Birmingham Parish for the financial year commencing on 1st April 2019 be set at £1,403.94 pursuant to the formula in Section 34(3) of the Local Government Finance Act 1992:

	£	£
a. Basic Amount calculated under Section 34(2)		1,380.85
PLUS		
b. The New Frankley in Birmingham Parish precept	31,221	
DIVIDED BY		
The tax base for New Frankley in Birmingham Parish	1,352	
		<u>23.09</u>
		1,403.94

- (iv) That the basic amount of Council Tax for the Royal Sutton Coldfield Town Council for the financial year commencing on 1st April 2019 be set at £1,430.81 pursuant to the formula in Section 34(3) of the Local Government Finance Act 1992:

	£	£
a. Basic Amount calculated under Section 34(2)		1,380.85
PLUS		
b. The Royal Sutton Coldfield Parish Council precept	1,851,318	
DIVIDED BY		
The tax base for Royal Sutton Coldfield Town Council	37,056	
		<u>49.96</u>
		1,430.81

5. **Council Tax - Total**

That, in accordance with Section 30 of the Local Government Finance Act 1992, the amounts of Council Tax set for the financial year commencing on 1st April 2019 for each category of dwelling listed within a particular valuation band, shall be calculated by adding:

- a. the amount given by multiplying the basic amount of Council Tax for the relevant area by the fraction whose numerator is the proportion applicable to dwellings listed in a particular valuation band, and whose denominator is the proportion applicable to dwellings listed in valuation Band D; to

- b. the amounts which are stated in the final precepts issued by the West Midlands Fire and Rescue Authority and the West Midlands Police and Crime Commissioner; and shall be:

<b>Band</b>	<b>Council Tax Areas without a Parish Council £</b>	<b>Council Tax New Frankley in Birmingham Parish £</b>	<b>Council Tax Royal Sutton Coldfield Town £</b>
A	1,062.67	1,078.06	1,095.97
B	1,239.77	1,257.73	1,278.63
C	1,416.88	1,437.41	1,461.29
D	1,594.00	1,617.09	1,643.96
E	1,948.23	1,976.45	2,009.29
F	2,302.44	2,335.79	2,374.61
G	2,656.67	2,695.15	2,739.93
H	3,188.00	3,234.18	3,287.92

6. **Capital Strategy and Programme and Treasury Management**

That the proposals, as set out in Appendices L - V of the Financial Plan 2019 – 2023, be approved for:

- a) Capital Programme
  - b) Prudential Indicators
  - c) Treasury Management
  - d) Service and Commercial Investment Strategy
- and, as set out in Appendix I, for:
- e) Flexible Use of Capital Receipts Strategy

7. **Pay Policy**

That in fulfilment of the requirements of Sections 38 to 43 of the Localism Act 2011, the Pay Policy Statement, as set out in Appendix W, be approved.

8. **Fees and Charges**

That the schedule of fees and charges as set out in Appendix X, Annex 1, be approved.

9. **Financial Plan 2019 – 2023**

That the Financial Plan 2019 – 2023 be approved.

Council further re-affirms the principles agreed by Council in relation to the Commonwealth Games on 1 November 2016 including:-

- The commitment in January 2018's report that there should be "no prejudice" to day-to-day services or to council taxpayers;

### **City Council – 26 February 2019**

- A commitment to transparency around finances and planning that will include regular updates to Council as well as to the wards directly affected by the event.

Council further agrees to work with the Commonwealth Games Federation and the Commonwealth itself to enable the development of new funding models for the Games, noting the huge significance of the event for the Commonwealth as a family of nations and peoples.

---

The meeting ended at 1921 hours.

**APPENDIX**

Questions and replies in accordance with Standing Order 10.2.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
DEBBIE CLANCY**

**A1      Representing Birmingham in the Midlands**

**Question:**

**On how many occasions since 2012 has a Chair of Scrutiny withheld agreement for a Cabinet Report to be taken as a late/urgent item?**

**Answer:**

I am not aware of any Chair of Scrutiny withholding agreement for a Cabinet report to be taken as a late/urgent item.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
RON STORER**

**A2     Unite Hotel**

**Question:**

**At a meeting of the Governance, Resources and Customer Services Overview and Scrutiny Committee on 4 April 2014, a call-in was considered regarding the sale of land at Jennings Road, Eastside to Unite the Union for the building of a hotel and conference centre. The public minutes of that meeting do not contain any declarations of interest – pecuniary or non-pecuniary – of any Councillor in attendance at that meeting. What interests were declared at that meeting and at the Cabinet meeting where the decision was taken and by whom, including whether those interests were declared as pecuniary or non-pecuniary?**

**Answer:**

At the Governance, Resources and Customer Services Overview and Scrutiny Committee on 4 April 2014, non-pecuniary interests were declared by Councillors Carl Rice, Ian Ward, Des Hughes, Ansar Ali Khan and Jess Phillips, as they were members of the Unite Trades Union. These are recorded on the private minutes.

At the Cabinet meeting on 17 March 2014, declarations of interest (non-pecuniary) were declared by Councillors Ian Ward, Stewart Stacey and John Cotton as members of Unite the Union.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
PETER FOWLER**

**A3     Unite Hotel 2**

**Question:**

**What was the total cash received by Birmingham City Council from Unite the Union for the sale of land at Jennings Road, broken down by date of receipt of deposit and any instalments or lump sum of the remaining balance?**

**Answer:**

The City Council have received a premium of £1.95m from Unite the Union.

A deposit of 10% (£195,000) was received on 12/03/2015.

The balance of £ 1,755,000 was received on 17<sup>th</sup> July 2015.

There are no further instalments or lump sum remaining as the balance has been paid in full on the 17<sup>th</sup> July 2015.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
ADAM HIGGS**

**A4     Unite Hotel 3**

**Question:**

**What ground rent is paid by Unite the Union for the land leased to them by the Council at Jennings Road Eastside?**

**Answer:**

There is no ground rental payable by Unite the Union for the lease of the land. The Union paid a premium of £1.95m for the lease in July 2015.



**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
ADRIAN DELANEY**

**A5     PBL Ground Rent**

**Question:**

**How much does Performance Birmingham Ltd pay in ground rent for the lease of Town Hall and Symphony Hall?**

**Answer:**

PBL currently pay a basic rent of £46,176.00 per annum with additional service charge contribution of £483,062.44 per annum and cover the cost of utilities in the sum of £230,563.76 per annum. Service charge and utility costs are variable.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
GARY SAMBROOK**

**A6     Dispensation for conflicts of interests**

**Question:**

**On what date was dispensation given by the Independent Chair of Standards Committee for Members of Cabinet to be able to vote on the waste dispute item at both the 15 January and 12 February Cabinet Meetings given pecuniary interests of some members who have received sponsorship from Unite the Union?**

**Answer:**

In respect of the Cabinet meeting on 15<sup>th</sup> January no dispensation was sought.

In respect of the Cabinet meeting on 12<sup>th</sup> February the dispensation was given on 11<sup>th</sup> February 2019 due to additional options arising from developing ACAS negotiations.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
TIM HUXTABLE**

**A7     Previous Written Questions**

**Question:**

**Written Questions A18 and A24 to Full Council on 5 February 2019 were not answered in time for the meeting but a written response was promised in due course. Are you now able to answer both those questions?**

**Answer:**

**Yes - answers below:-**

**A18     CITY COUNCIL – 5 FEBRUARY 2019**

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER FROM COUNCILLOR  
TIM HUXTABLE**

**“2012 Cabinet Decision”**

**Question:**

**In response to question D11, we were told decisions contained within the 26 March 2012 Cabinet Report ‘Fleet and Waste Management – Future Operating Model and Service Redesign’ were impacted by subsequent changes within fleet and waste. Some of the decisions in that Cabinet report related to wider workforce issues and not specifically fleet and waste. Can you confirm that they were fully implemented?**

**Answer:**

Since 2012, Bulky Waste has been reviewed, Clinical Waste has been redefined, Refuse Collection working patterns have been changed and savings have been implemented. The only remaining outstanding action was the implementation of the Future Operating Model (FOM). A new FOM was partially implemented in 2017 and currently this is being developed to align with the Street Scene Service within Neighbourhoods.

**A24     CITY COUNCIL – 5 FEBRUARY 2019**

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL  
FROM COUNCILLOR PETER FOWLER**

**“2012 Cabinet Decision 2”**

**Question:**

**With reference to the response to Question D11 from January Council, given this was now 6 years ago and you have confirmed that at least some of the recommendations were not taken forward following the change in Administration shortly after, they would no longer be private and confidential. Can all recommendations decided on in the private report of March 2012 but not implemented now please be published, along with any others that, due to the passage of time are no longer classified as confidential?**

**Answer:**

The only recommendation not fully implemented from the 2012 Cabinet report was the implementation of the Future Operating Model. This was partially implemented in 2017.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
ROBERT ALDEN**

**A8     Use of Reserves**

**Question:**

**At the January Cabinet meeting you said you had seen a copy of a letter from the Secretary of State expressing support for *your* policy of developing a budget that does not rely on reserves. That letter was in response to a letter from Liam Byrne MP who wrote to James Brokenshire asking why the Government had blocked the council from accessing its reserves, a claim he repeated in another letter from him and 6 other Birmingham MPs to yourself objecting to your changes to the Enablement Service. Can you confirm if there is a ministerial block on the City's use of reserves or if, as you have repeatedly claimed yourself, that it is your own choice to not rely on reserves in recognition of the unsustainability of the approach you have taken in the previous 3 years?**

**Answer:**

The letter I was referring to is the Secretary of State's letter to myself and John Crabtree, Chair of the Birmingham Improvement Panel dated 12 September 2018.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
SIMON MORRALL**

**A9    Dispensation for pecuniary interest**

**Question:**

**Can you provide a copy of the (dated) request for dispensation to Chair of Standards, along with a copy of the (dated) dispensation granted by the Chair of Standards for any pecuniary interests during consideration of the waste management dispute at any of the Cabinet meetings or the Scrutiny call-in meeting where it has been discussed?**

**Answer:**

Dispensations are published on CMIS.

I am advised that the monitoring officer does not propose to provide a copy of the request for dispensation; a Members Register of Interest is a public document and the disclosable pecuniary is set out in that document.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
CHARLOTTE HODIVALA**

**A10 Partner Contributions to Commonwealth Games**

**Question:**

**How much of the c£30m partner contributions to the 25% local share of the commonwealth games has currently been formally committed, broken down by individual partner, the amount they have committed and the date this was formally approved by their respective decision making board?**

**Answer:**

£45m has to date been provisionally committed by the West Midland Combined Authority and the GBS LEP respectively subject to the City Council meeting funding conditions. Discussions remain ongoing with a range of partners including Universities, regional LEPs and the Midlands Engine to secure the remaining £30m contributions in line with indicative estimates provided at the time of the successful bid for the Games.

The 25% local contribution to the overall cost of the Games assumes that the partner contributions are not received until 2021/22 and 2022/23.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
DAVID BARRIE**

**A11 Games Tax**

**Question:**

**The Council is reportedly still exploring options for additional taxes such as a hotel tax, workplace parking levy and an airport tax to fund the Commonwealth Games. If any of these taxes were levied which element of the 25% local contribution would they fund? i.e. revenue or capital and the money already committed by the council or any potential shortfall in partner contributions?**

**Answer:**

Partner funding commitments almost exclusively relate to capital expenditure., The Council remains committed to securing the full amount of partner contributions that were promised at the time of the successful bid for the Commonwealth Games, but it is acknowledged that there is a risk that some bodies may not honour their commitments and if this occurred, there would be a capital funding shortfall. Any gap created would be filled either by seeking alternative sources of funding or through prudential borrowing.

Additional sources of funding such as hotel tax, a workplace parking levy and/or an airport tax are actively being sought. In the first instance, any funding raised from these alternative sources would be used to offset any shortfall in partner contributions, with any remaining additional funding used to reduce the Council's current assumed revenue contribution to the games.



**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
MEIRION JENKINS**

**A12 European Fund Managers**

**Question:**

**What work is the Council doing to attract European Fund Managers, given the well paid employment opportunities this would bring, to relocate to Birmingham post Brexit?**

**Answer:**

Despite the complexity of Brexit, the UK is still a hub for investment management expertise and an attractive centre for fund management activity in Europe.

London is the centre for fund management activity, however there is an upward trend in the level of investment interest in Birmingham, driven by infrastructure investment and large scale regeneration.

By continuing to promote the City on an international stage, including MIPIM and through investment missions to the Far East, we are showcasing the opportunities for overseas funds to view the City as a credible place to relocate and do business.

We are also working with the West Midlands Growth Company on their regional inward investment strategy, actively engaging with foreign and UK owned companies within the business and professional sector to promote the City as a place to relocate.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL FROM COUNCILLOR  
GARETH MOORE**

**A13 Bin Dispute**

**Question:**

**Does the Leader of the Council think it is helpful to the Council's defence to have Labour Groups on neighbouring local Councils hold meetings which include banners praising the ongoing bin disputes over the last two years, as shown on twitter over the last month?**

**Answer:**

Everyone is entitled to their own views. At the moment our focus is on resolving the dispute.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS, WASTE AND RECYCLING FROM COUNCILLOR MAUREEN CORNISH**

**B1      External waste collection staff use of vehicles**

**Question:**

**Your press statements on the Unite claims of a breach of the MOU state that all contractors have been using their own vehicles, staff and fuel. However there have been claims on social media of external waste collection crews being seen leaving the depots in BCC wagons. Are you able to categorically state that your press statements are accurate and that on no occasion during the current industrial dispute have external crews used BCC wagons (or if you need to correct your press statement on how many occasions has this happened?**

**Answer:**

**I can confirm none of the contractor's staff have used any of BCC vehicles.**

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR CLEAN STREETS, WASTE  
AND RECYCLING FROM COUNCILLOR DEBBIE CLANCY**

**B2     External waste collection staff- firms used**

**Question:**

**Please list all external providers used by the council for any type of waste collection since 29 December 2018?**

**Answer:**

To date (22.02.19) only FCC Environmental has been used to collect household waste since 29<sup>th</sup> December 2018.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR FINANCE AND RESOURCES  
FROM COUNCILLOR SIMON MORRALL**

**C1    Gardening Leave**

**Question:**

**How many staff in JNC grade posts have taken ‘gardening leave’ in the last 6 years, broken down by the number whose leave lasted:**

- **0-3 Months**
- **3-6 Months**
- **6-12 Months**
- **12 Months +**

**Answer:**

There is no contractual right in contracts of employment for employees at JNC grades to receive garden leave. Any such leave arrangements are determined as part of an exit agreement, and are therefore confidential.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR FINANCE AND RESOURCES  
FROM COUNCILLOR EDDIE FREEMAN**

**C2    Invoice to ESN Services Ltd**

**Question:**

**A very late response to a Freedom of Information Request that appears on the Whatdotheyknow website shows an invoice for £13,747.75 was paid by the Council to ESN Service Ltd on 15 August 2018. I am unable to find details of that payment on the council's open data site, which is supposed to detail all invoices over £500. Can you please provide details of the invoice, including what it was for and who authorised it?**

**Answer:**

The payment was not to ESN Service Ltd but payment to ESN Solicitors Ltd. In this particular case the Solicitors are acting on behalf of a private individual and payment is subject to VAT because it is not a payment for services, therefore it is not included in the open data site.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR FINANCE RESOURCES  
FROM COUNCILLOR BOB BEAUCHAMP**

**C3    Corporate Directors**

**Question:**

**On what date did the roles of Corporate Director of Place and Chief Operating Officer become vacant?**

**Answer:**

Neither of these roles are vacant –

As part of the recent JNC restructure:

- The Corporate Director Place has been renamed to Director Neighbourhoods
- The Chief Operating Officer role has been deleted from the structure

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR FINANCE AND RESOURCES  
FROM COUNCILLOR PETER FOWLER**

**C4    Lendlease**

**Question:**

**Are Lendlease signatories to the Birmingham Business Charter for Social Responsibility?**

**Answer:** Yes, they were accredited on 8<sup>th</sup> January 2019.



**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR FINANCE AND RESOURCES  
FROM COUNCILLOR RON STORER**

**C5    Parking**

**Question:**

**What is the total income received to date for parking in Cannon Hill Park since charges were introduced?**

**Answer:**

Gross income to date i.e. before MAC profit share arrangements, excluding VAT & all running costs = £487,832 as at 19<sup>th</sup> February 2019. The 'go-live' date was 6<sup>th</sup> October 2017.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR FINANCE AND RESOURCES  
FROM COUNCILLOR CHARLOTTE HODIVALA**

**C6    Parking 1**

**Question:**

**How much of the revenue from parking at Cannon Hill Park has been paid to the Mac since charges were introduced?**

**Answer:**

£45,877 (net of VAT) has been paid to date, being the 2017/18 profit share.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR FINANCE AND RESOURCES  
FROM COUNCILLOR DAVID PEARS**

**C7 Parking 2**

**Question:**

**What are the medium and long term financial forecasts and costs for the proposal to extend parking charges at Sutton Park (including all associated measures around the park such as TROs)?**

**Answer:**

Council officers are currently working on the different project design elements and associated costs and hope to have agreed costings by the middle of March. These costs will then inform the Full Business Case. The capital costs for the project will be covered through Prudential Borrowing, to be repaid over a term of between 10 -15 years.

Public consultation has yet to take place. This consultation will influence and inform the requirement for, and scale of, any TROs should they be required to supplement the existing traffic restrictions on surrounding roads.

Annual income will be included in the final business case and will be based on an overview of current parking income, visitor numbers and available car parking spaces.

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER FOR TRANSPORT AND ENVIRONMENT FROM COUNCILLOR ADAM HIGGS**

**D      Future Tenders**

**Question:**

**The previous Cabinet Member for Finance and Resources stated at the Cabinet meeting of 18 September 2018 that they approved the Council exercising its right to exclude Amey LG from future council tenders. When was this implemented?**

**Answer:**

The decision has not yet been implemented.